Spring 5-29-2020

# "GIVE THEM A FIRM HANDSHAKE, LOOK THEM IN THE EYE, TRY TO MAKE A CONNECTION": CRITICAL GRADUATE PERSPECTIVES ON SCHOOL ADVANCEMENT PRACTICES OF DE MARILLAC ACADEMY

Alicia M. Tapia
*University of San Francisco*, aliciamtapia@gmail.com

The University of San Francisco

# "GIVE THEM A FIRM HANDSHAKE, LOOK THEM IN THE EYE, TRY TO MAKE A CONNECTION": CRITICAL GRADUATE PERSPECTIVES ON SCHOOL ADVANCEMENT PRACTICES OF DE MARILLAC ACADEMY

A Dissertation Proposal Presented
to
The Faculty of the School of Education
Catholic Educational Leadership Department

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Education

By
Alicia M. Tapia
San Francisco
May 2020

THE UNIVERSITY OF SAN FRANCISCO
Dissertation Abstract

"Give Them a Firm Handshake. Look Them in the Eye, Try to Make a Connection": Critical Graduate Perspectives on School Advancement Practices of De Marillac Academy

This dissertation engages graduates of De Marillac Academy, a NativityMiguel school in San Francisco, in critical inquiry regarding school advancement practices. Graduates were asked how they participated in school advancement practices face-to-face with guests and donors, through media, on-campus and off-campus at their Annual Scholarship Benefit. Graduates engaged in photo and video elicitation interviews, in which photos and videos were used to spark commentary regarding their thoughts and experiences in advancement settings. As Catholic school educators, we are called to investigate the effects of a student's formal and hidden curriculum in all aspects of their educational experience. This study found what the experiences of students and graduates were when they engaged in advancement activities, it investigated the ways that students and graduates code-switch and adapt their behavior based in advancement settings, and that these activities complicate their impressions of race, class, power and privilege. Educators, school leaders, advancement personnel, media producers, and donors should consistently listen to graduate experiences, build relationships, include culturally responsive teaching in their formal curriculum and accompany students and graduates as they navigate race, class, power, and privilege in advancement environments and their educational experience.

This dissertation, written under the direction of the candidate's dissertation committee and approved by the members of the committee, has been presented to and accepted by the Faculty of the School of Education in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education. The content and research methodologies presented in this work represent the work of the candidate alone.

| | |
|---|---|
| Alicia Tapia | May 12, 2020 |
| Candidate | Date |

Dissertation Committee

| | |
|---|---|
| Dr. Ursula Aldana | May 12, 2020 |
| Chairperson | Date |
| Dr. Emma Fuentes | May 12, 2020 |
| | Date |
| Dr. Eileen Emerson-Boles | May 12, 2020 |
| | Date |

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This dissertation is dedicated to my ancestors, all of them. My parents, my grandparents, my great grandparents, and beyond. Their sweat and hard work, their insistence on storytelling, on family, on keeping their eyes on the prize and living their lives with grace and love. To my Nana, who has always been a source of strength and humble power and articulation and intelligence. To my Papa, his love, his humor. To Grandpa Selso "Jess" Tapia, for his eloquently scripted letters to me en español and to Elvia, her resilience, her spirit.

The journey up to this stake in the road would not be possible without my mom and dad, John and Jacqueline. My biggest fans, I am YOUR biggest fans to the very end. I would have never been able to do this, your applause, and your "love you to pieces" texts. I feel the support of your whole hearts and know I love you both with all of mine. A special shoutout and mahalo to my ohana in Hawaii and here on the west coast.

I am thankful for my lifelong friends who supported me along my journey, for all the support and check ins from near or far: Nikos, Caroline, Max, Claudia, Stephen, Nikki, Nick, Tricia, and Perry. I am especially thankful for those who helped me through the days when the journey got particularly arduous: Andrew, Ashley, Tessa, Lucie, and Carly.

I never thought as a kid that the people I worked with would come to be my family away from home. I have the utmost respect and tons of love for my Lasallian-Vincentian family of De Marillac Academy and Sacred Heart Cathedral. I am especially grateful to the dream teams, for those of you who work hard to push the limits, lead, lose sleep and ask critical questions that encourage growth however difficult. For the leaders who have challenged and supported me. To those who work tirelessly and often without

acknowledgment for diversity, equity, and inclusion efforts in our schools, I respect you all so much. To Brother Joseph Fabiano, Br. Joe Kirk, Sr. Kathleen Powers, Sr. Frances Meyer, for your humble leadership of the mission. It's an honor to show up every day alongside you to be in service of our students.

Thank you to my USF family for your scholarly camaraderie and some of the most brilliant, intense, and eye-opening happy hour conversations. I knew I'd be pushed to new limits, but I could have never imagined how surrounded and challenged I'd be amongst such incredibly intellectual minds that live theory in practice. Thank you to Dr. Doreen Jones for her guiding spirit of love and kokua to the end, you are so special. Thank you to Dr. Ursula Aldana for inspiring me in every class, with every meeting, zoom call, and for the level of critique and articulation you bring to every conversation. I want to be like you when I grow up! To Dr. Emma Fuentes, for your truly caring spirit that you pour into every student's research, and mine, and your care that creativity be brought into the research process and product. To Dr. Eileen Emerson-Boles, for your humble leadership since the very beginning of my journey here in San Francisco, your inspiring interactions and care for our students and their learning, your ever-meticulous eye, and the time and conversation you've lended me.

To the students and graduates of SHC and DMA, you're the reasons I show up to work every day. Thank you for your gifts, intellect, and effort. You are my teachers.

Lastly, I am thankful to God, mahalo ke Akua, Father Sun, Mother Earth, guiding spirit, cleansing blue oceans, life-giving air, North, South, East, West, above and below. I am thankful for this life and its often-difficult lessons; I am thankful for the love that surrounds me. Thank you.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

# CHAPTER I: THE RESEARCH PROBLEM

## Introduction

I receive a call on the classroom phone to send a student ambassador down to the main office to greet guests and take them on a tour of the school. As I nod to him, he stops his work, gets out of his chair, drops his pencil down on his desk, and says under a half-joking breath, "Time to go put on my poor face." His classmates throw knowing smirks at him, "See you at recess."

Guests from a technology company located nearby sit in the art room to watch a video. The video explains the mission of the school and features the melody of a violin in a slow, strained tempo, the sound of children laughing during recess, and the voices of students reading their poems. The next scene switches to a student concentrating intently on the words of a book, then to a small child in his Catholic school uniform walking alone to school through a notoriously dangerous area of the city. By the end of the video, the strain of the violin crescendos to a tune of hope, and students' smiling faces look directly into the camera.

Months later, these same guests are invited to attend the school's annual scholarship benefit the students they met and saw in the video greet, sing, and thank guests for their donations of time, talent, and treasure necessary to keep the school's mission of providing a "life-changing, accessible education" alive.

During my time as a teacher-librarian at De Marillac Academy, I had both the privilege and honor of working with educators and professionals to provide a quality, Catholic education to students in the Tenderloin of San Francisco. By nature of the school's funding model, my students and I were often asked to represent the school and

speak to what it was we were doing to visitors on a regular basis. I was and am proud of the tireless work the school puts out every day toward the mission of serving their students and families. The school is eager to share the perseverance and courage that our students and families demonstrate toward their pursuit of education. I was glad to help select students to speak on behalf of the school and happy to interact with possible donors at fundraising events or when a new group of adults from a nearby bank or company came to visit. After a few years, I began to observe and overhear moments that caused me to pause. Students would ask me why another student always got to leave class to speak to a guest, or I'd see how tired a student's eyes were after school on the way to a scholarship benefit before greeting donors. I'd notice the long sighs given when their schoolwork was interrupted so they could do their photoshoot for an upcoming school advancement event. I began to notice the looks graduates exchanged with one another while listening to a speaker rile up guests to donate money to the school. Sometimes students were excited to be able to eat free food at an event and get out of a class lesson, other times they presented a look on their faces that expressed annoyance, surrender, or fatigue. I began to wonder what was going on, what they were thinking and feeling before they put on their "poor" face to greet school guests. I began to wonder what they thought after the twentieth handshake given to a stranger, or what they felt when a speaker described their family and neighborhood as poor and needy amidst a crowd of people with wealth.

Catholic middle schools that are part of the NativityMiguel Coalition (NMC) are unique because of their unwavering mission to serve youth from socioeconomically underprivileged backgrounds. 49 NativityMiguel schools across the United States and

Canada are faith-explicit, non-tuition driven middle schools and are characterized by key features, such as extended school days, an extended school year, and graduate support programs. Proponents of NMC schools praise the model because it exclusively serves economically poor and marginalized students and families ("Federal Poverty Level", 2019; NativityMiguel Coalition, 2018a); an unintended circumstance of this model is that NMC schools "cater mostly to children of color" (Fenzel, 2009a, p. 3; "Status and Trends in the Education of Racial and Ethnic Minorities," 2009). The NMC model has distinguished itself as an innovative school model in terms of how they raise funds to serve students from underprivileged backgrounds and faith-based schools in particular are known to serve students from disadvantaged backgrounds better than their public, non-religious counterparts do (Fenzel, 2009a; "NativityMiguel Coalition," 2017; *Preserving a Critical National Asset: America's Disadvantaged Students and the Crisis in Faith-based Urban Schools*, 2008). To provide this holistic education on a non-tuition driven model, NMC schools utilize student interaction and imagery in advancement materials and practices to inform, attract, and sustain new and existing donors. Students and donors interact in a variety of ways and settings: scholarship benefits, school tours, tutoring, through social media, and corporate days of service.

Face-to-face contact with donors and members of the extended community is a common occurrence for students in NativityMiguel schools because it builds meaningful connections and spreads awareness of the school to outside community members. It is considered one of the most effective factors that lead to successfully raising funds for any non-profit organization (Ebede, 2018; Goldkind, 2016; Marx, 2000; Quirk, 2010). When donors see the faces of those they have the capability of helping, they are more likely to

give (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012; Shanahan, Hopkins, Carlson, & Raymond, 2012).

Additionally, with the proliferation of technology and the constant consumption of social media, the imagery of students in their school and community are captured and shared with others through newsletters, news media, school websites, and social media outlets such as YouTube, Instagram, Facebook, and Twitter. The potential and power of social media extends the school's message to organizations, corporations, individual donors, and their networks (Goldkind, 2017). Images of children have a significant impact on improving and sustaining donations because of the emotional impact on those who view them (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012; Ebede, 2018; Shanahan et al., 2012). The generosity of more socioeconomically advantaged people and organizations financially sustains NativityMiguel schools. If it weren't for these charitable contributions, Catholic education for students from socioeconomically disadvantaged backgrounds would be out of reach for many NMC families incapable of paying thousands of dollars per year for tuition. A non-tuition model depends on a school's successful advancement program and an increase in donations (Quirk, 2010).

Middle school students are in the formative years of creating their self-image; they begin to build their identity with others through the groups and institutions they belong to (Cross, Bazron, Dennis, & Isaacs, 1989; Wardle, 1995). During these formative years, schools play a significant role in student identity formation, the transferal of social and cultural capital, and the socialization of youth (Stanton-Salazar, 1997). The NativityMiguel schools have an expressed aim of breaking the cycle of poverty by providing a holistic, rigorous education, and by connecting students from low-income

backgrounds with skills, resources and network possibilities to attain a place in society that raises them out of poverty (Fenzel, 2009a; Fenzel, 2009b; Podsiadlo & Philliber, 2003; Proehl, Ayon, Braganza, & Sosa, 2017; Quirk, 2010; Roy, 2008).

Yet, by using specific students to interact with donors and sharing their images in certain ways and selective settings, what kind of non-academic impacts are NMC schools having on the youth that they are committed to serving? As part of the larger Catholic Lasallian-Vincentian tradition, those who work in these schools must be concerned with social justice. Those in service to the poor have an obligation to acknowledge and explore the experiences of students and graduates that participate in school advancement practices and the messages conveyed beyond the formal curriculum (Berg, 2010; Brothers of the Christian Schools, 1987; Brothers of the Christian Schools, 2014; Brown, 2015; Capelle, 2003; Grieken, 1999; Massingale, 2010; Roy, 2008; Schackmuth, 2012; Shields, 2017). This study pays particular attention to how advancement practices affect students as they occur and how these experiences resonate after graduation.

## Statement of the Problem

De Marillac Academy (DMA) is one example of many NativityMiguel schools that are committed to providing students an accessible education via successful advancement strategies (De Marillac Academy, n.d., a; De Marillac Academy, n.d., b; Goldschmidt & Walsh, 2013; Hamilton, 2008). The question of how these advancement strategies affect and resonate with students after their graduation begs to be investigated.

Grounded in the desire to shed light on the effects of school advancement strategies on the educational experience of DMA students, this study recognizes that the practice of student-donor interaction in person and through media is a unique component

of NMC schools, due to the need for these schools to fundraise. Students from families with higher income in other Catholic schools are not required to engage with those that help fund their education simply because their family's socioeconomic position and ability grants them immunity from having to participate in school advancement practices. Students in NativityMiguel schools like DMA do not have this privilege.

NMC schools' literature focuses on their unique funding model and its effectiveness in helping students from low socioeconomic backgrounds better than their public-school counterparts do (Fenzel, 2009a). Other Catholic schools that are at risk of closing look to imitate the NativityMiguel funding model as tuition-based models continue to become less sustainable and more out of reach for families from low-income backgrounds. Researchers of the NativityMiguel model have not explored the student experience or impact of advancement practices undertaken to raise funds for students. This study intends to fill that gap in the literature.

Scenes of scholarship benefits present an image of two distinct groups of people in interaction with one another; a juxtaposition of students of color from underprivileged backgrounds and more advantaged, predominantly white upper and middle-class donors brought together by the school. School faculty and staff coach students to professionally interact, greet, thank, and perform for guests that attend advancement events. Whether consciously or not, teachers and staff select individual students to interact with donors because of their ability to speak well and "exhibit high-status social characteristics" (Stanton-Salazar, 2011, p. 1084) which affects the student's understanding of what is valued by their school and society. Students and graduates are socialized to conform to these traits and internalize behaviors throughout their educational experience. While

DMA's advancement efforts and the contributions of donors are well intentioned, and there are meaningful relationships between students and donors to be found, there is a lack of critical examination concerned with how these interactions and expectations affect students.

In addition to face-to-face interaction with donors, NativityMiguel schools share the faces, stories, and testimonies of students with broader audiences through school media on school websites, through physical and digital mailings, and social media. Faces of children are compelling images that provoke a need in donor audiences to respond and help vulnerable children who are un-deserving of the hardships in their lives (Manzo, 2008; Shanahan et al., 2012). Student beneficiaries remain dependent on the success of digital advancement strategies to fund their education, while donors hold the power because they are in a position with an option to help (Ostrander & Schervish, 1990).

Furthermore, the constant imaging of students of color as "at-risk", "at-promise", poor, urban, disadvantaged, marginalized and in need may unintentionally lead to reinforcing deficit stereotypes, white saviorism, and racism instead of creating authentic connection and genuinely empowering students by providing them their essential human right to an accessible, quality education. The control NativityMiguel schools have, over how school media is shared online dissipates when shared through social media channels. Young people from underserved backgrounds who have participated in advancement practices have felt strongly about image-making and consent (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Warrington & Crombie, 2017); it is strongly recommended that images be empowering and preserve the dignity of the children and their stories (Andersson & Valentine, 2015; Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012; Eikenberry & Bhati,

2019; Manzo, 2008; Merchant, Ford, & Sargeant, 2010; Shanahan, Hopkins, Carlson, & Raymond, 2012; Warrington & Crombie, 2017).

A student's education is not limited to what they learn in official courses; they also learn from the unstated norms and social situations they encounter (Giroux & Penna, 1972). In addition to the holistic education DMA students receive; they also contend with cultural code-switching when participating in advancement practices that they otherwise would not have encountered had the school not led them there. The tension DMA students encounter when participating in advancement practices is a hidden part of their educational experience they are required to navigate. What students take away from these experiences contributes to their socialization and understanding of where they fall in the structures of power and authority (Apple, 1971; Harro, 2008), which may have unintended consequences on how they view themselves, hear how others view them and their current position in the fabric of society (Aldana & Kabadi, 2019). Students hear people of authority and power speak about their race and class in turn, adapt their behavior to fit with what is valued by their school, its faculty and staff, and the adults they encounter along their educational journey in different scenarios (Brown, 2015; Morton, 2014). The norm students strive to adapt to in order to be "liberated" from their disadvantaged race-class position is created by the race-class at the top of the hierarchy, essentially those that fund, oversee, and deliver their education (Kendi, 2019).

Catholic educators are called to a higher standard; the core principles of Catholic social teaching urge that the dignity of all individuals be honored and respected and that we do so with a preferential option for the poor (Brothers of the Christian Schools, 2014; De La Salle, 2007; Leo XIII, 1891; Paul VI, 1965b; United States Conference of Catholic

Bishops, 2005a). Catholic educators and schools must act with awareness and intention when creating meaningful interactions and representations of students to donors interested in learning about and giving to NMC schools. Whether employed in the classroom or in the advancement office, Lasallian educators make a commitment to accompany the students entrusted to their care as older brothers and sisters and honor their innate dignity. Lasallian educators are urged to uncover and learn from potential effects of their actions and practices, whether those effects are positive or negative and reveal any type of injustice (De La Salle, 2007; Grieken, 1999; Roy, 2008; Salm, 2008; Schackmuth, 2012).

NMC schools demonstrably support the needs of students from socioeconomically underprivileged backgrounds by providing them unique learning opportunities and catching students up to grade level. NativityMiguel schools provide access for underserved students to Catholic education through a non-tuition driven model (Fenzel & Deal, 2003; Fenzel & Monteith, 2008; Quirk, 2010). While many NativityMiguel schools receive support from religious orders, the holistic education and wraparound services provided require more tuition than it does for other Catholic school students in more privileged settings. This makes it necessary for all NativityMiguel and non-profit schools and their advancement offices to continually seek additional financial support in a philanthrocapitalist environment, where they must compete and vie for donor dollars among other urban independent schools whether religious or secular (Brown, 2015; Fenzel, 2009a, 2009b, 2019; Fenzel & Wyttenbach; 2018, Grace, 2002; Hamilton, 2008; Quirk, 2010). Corporations and generous individuals contribute fiscal help and resources, but also reap benefits when donating to NMC schools; their interests converge

with the schools' needs to fundraise. Donations to the school grant them the advantage of corporate incentives, tax credits, and a favorable public image as they fulfill their corporate social responsibility through donations and service to the community (Brown, 2015; Fenzel, 2009b; Hites, 2019; Ostrander & Schervish, 1990; Proehl, Ayon, & Braganza, 2017; Quirk, 2010; Stanley, 2015).

The focus of this study is to uncover the thoughts and experiences of DMA graduates regarding their current and past participation in school advancement practices. Graduate perspectives shed light on student experiences in the other NativityMiguel schools that advancement teams and donors can learn from. Participation in advancement activities is part of a NativityMiguel student's educational experience. It is not clear whether or not DMA families and students wholly understand this and what it entails before enrollment. The hope is that this study allows NMC schools and those like it to be more intentional and mindful of how their strategies may affect the students entrusted to their care.

## Background and Need for the Study

In comparison with other Catholic schools, NativityMiguel schools operate on a model that requires most of its funding to come from religious orders, philanthropists, corporations, and individual donors. A non-tuition model places an additional pressure and challenge on school advancement offices to procure funds in order to sustain operating costs in comparison with other traditional tuition-driven Catholic schools (Fenzel, 2009a, 2009b; Fenzel & Wyttenbach, 2018; Grant, 2008; Hamilton, 2008; Quirk, 2010). In order to bring this mission to fruition every year on a consistent basis, NMC administrators, faculty, and staff must continuously find innovative ways to call on the

external community to become partners in mission. Advancement offices must be relentless through intentional community and donor relations, and continuously market the impact a NMC school can make in the upward trajectory of a student's social status. Faculty and staff coach and encourage their students to share their school experiences with donors through social media campaigns, scholarship benefits, and school tours (DMA DeMarillacAcademy, 2011; Fenzel 2009b; Fenzel & Monteith 2008).

Since the birth of the NMC, research has been published on the creation, innovation, and commitment of NativityMiguel school models (Anderer, 2005; Anderson, 2002; Grant, 2008; Posiadlo & Philliber, 2003), the success of NMC graduates in comparison to their peers from similar socioeconomic backgrounds (Fenzel, 2009a; Fenzel & Monteith, 2008; Our Results, 2015; Proehl et. al., 2017), and the model's ability to serve their intended population through a unique funding model in a time when Catholic schools continue to decline (Quirk, 2010; Saroki & Levenick, 2009; Walch 2016). There is a lack of investigation concerned with student voice and what it is like for students and graduates of NMC schools to navigate the tension of code-switching during advancement practices. This tension is what Morton (2014) describes as "behavior required by the mainstream for academic and socioeconomic success, and that required by students' relationships, associations, and groups" (p. 268). While student representation is necessary to attract donors and crucial to raising funds for their education, Catholic school educators are obligated to listen to the students and be curious about the impact it has on them in the long run.

Known for their purpose of raising funds to provide services to children in crisis who do not receive access to their basic human rights around the world, researchers of

non-governmental organizations abroad have engaged in critical inquiry around the media and messaging that agencies conduct to acquire sponsors for the children they aim to help. Research findings urge personnel charged with this role and responsibility to balance the need to share images of children in need with ethical considerations for their rights and dignity as individuals (Burt & Strongman, 2005; Manzo, 2008; Watson & Hoefer, 2014). Additionally, research calls us to consider the message laden in images of children living in disadvantaged circumstances, and insist that images shared strive to evoke empathy rather than sympathy by representing children in a good light and seeking their consent (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012; Warrington & Crombie, 2017). NativityMiguel students and families may be wary of questioning these practices because of uneven power relations and the fact that the purpose of these advancement practices and students' ability to code-switch to appeal to donors affords them a quality Catholic education otherwise inaccessible. In 2008, a study by Roy conducted in a NativityMiguel school on relational trust and social capital from perspectives of graduates urged the importance of recognizing areas of vulnerability for needy families and students in relation to school professionals. This dissertation extends the need to recognize uneven power relations and feelings of vulnerability for students of NativityMiguel schools concerning school advancement practices.

For Catholic schools, education is not strictly a matter of preparing humans to contribute economically to society; the matters of mind and intelligence come second to the matters of the heart and soul. Catholic schools must focus on the soul of the child, elevate the inherent dignity of every child, and protect their right to Christian education of virtues consistent with Gospel values (Paul VI, 1965b). Recognition of this inherent

dignity implies a concern for the experiences schools lead students into as part of their educational experience in our schools. As more Catholic and secular schools look to the NativityMiguel model and ones like it, this study intends to fill in gaps in the literature by highlighting specifically the student experience around advancement strategies.

## Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study is to engage graduates of De Marillac Academy (DMA), a NativityMiguel school in San Francisco, in collective inquiry about their experiences and interactions with donors and their thoughts on the images of them shared for informational and fundraising purposes. This study is grounded in the desire to elevate the voices of students by allowing them to speak to their own experiences. It explores the nuances of code-switching within these contexts and gather their perspectives on their representation as students attending a NativityMiguel school. I chose DMA because of the frequency and consistency with which DMA students engage with current and prospective donors and adults in and outside of the school in person and through images and videos shared online. I also selected DMA because of my familiarity with the school, its advancement practices, and access to the school's graduates.

This study uses photo- and video-elicitation methods coupled with semi-structured group and individual interviews. Photos and videos of students produced and shared through advancement events and online by the school were used to elicit and stimulate rich accounts from graduates about their past and current experiences in advancement settings. Whether through interactions with donors or the act of representing the school in videos and photos, this study explores how these experiences resonate with students after their graduation.

## Conceptual Frameworks

It is necessary to employ a few frameworks through which to explore the experiences of De Marillac Academy (DMA) students and graduates who participated in advancement practices such as school tours, social media campaigns, and scholarship benefits.

Morton's moral-psychological model of code-switching and Carter's definition of cultural straddlers and concept of "acting white" (2006) helps to articulate how students and graduates may use code-switching as a non-cognitive strategy to adapt their behavior in different social realms they encounter. Researchers have described it as a way for low-income communities to remain tied to the values of their community while succumbing to the dispositions valued by the labor market (Morton, 2014).

Apple and Giroux's understanding of the sociopolitical nature of the hidden curriculum informs this study in terms of understanding that "everything counts" in a students' learning, including the experiences outside of the formal classroom that may range from ritual lunch routines to field trips and advancement events. This hidden and subtle socialization informs a student's understanding of how to identify, navigate, and manipulate power and social structures.

Finally, the concept that images are laden with content and are extensions of the self is founded on Marshall McLuhan's 1967 work *The Medium is the Message*. This study is concerned with how students and graduates feel about seeing extensions of themselves in photos and videos as representatives of the school and was used to prompt reflection on how they code-switched and what "hidden" lessons they took away from participating in advancement strategies.

### *Cultural Code-Switching & Cultural Straddlers*

Morton (2014) describes cultural code-switching as a non-cognitive ability to change one's disposition and speech based on what is valued by the environment one is in at the time. Although people from more advantaged socio-economic backgrounds also code-switch, it is distinctly seen as a tool for upward mobility when talking about students from low socioeconomic backgrounds. Author and educator Emdin (2010) describes this ability as becoming a "social chameleon" (p.175), in which students read the codes of a particular social environment, figure out which ones have value, then adapt to enact them to win connections to new people or higher status. Students of color from low socioeconomic backgrounds must grapple with the codes they switch between and may:

> a) integrate dispositions within their value system,
>
> b) code-switch as a pretense in one context where that disposition is valued (adopting a disposition but not adopting the value tied to it),
>
> c) compartmentalize a disposition "for the sake of labor market success" (Morton, 2014, p. 273),
>
> d) code-switch as subsumption, or as a performance required in a particular environment, but is justified by the person because they are conscious of what they are doing (Morton, 2014).

Cultural code-switching is a way for students from low socioeconomic backgrounds to reach higher class opportunities while staying true to the values of their home communities in order to gain higher educational and financial opportunities. It is a soft skill that involves non-cognitive abilities that are valued by those from more

advantaged, white backgrounds such as extraversion and grit, which enables students to "straddle the achievement gap" (Morton, 2014, p. 279). Students of color from low socioeconomic backgrounds manage their roles and behaviors differently when they participate in multiple worlds and subscribe to social structures where the institutional agents that enable their success reward them (Stanton-Salazar, 2011). Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) state that when student performances conform to "white norms," the property of whiteness, and its' access to privileged networks are rendered attainable to students.

This framework helps us identify instances when students in this study may have found themselves acting inauthentically as a way to "perform" for donors or the school. It helps identify and describe the behaviors and responses of cultural mainstreamers, noncompliant believers, and cultural straddlers (Carter, 2006) participating in this study. For marginalized students of color, school is not just about learning the curriculum, but also how to "decode the system" (Carter, 2006; Stanton-Salazar, 1997, p.13).

### *Hidden Curriculum*

Schools are not neutral institutions of learning, their mission and leadership shape and define them and beyond that, dominant ideologies and economic systems define how students are conditioned for success according to what is valued in society. Schools impart a formal curriculum to prepare students with the knowledge and skills they believe lead to success in the labor market and life. This study operates on the understanding that the true breadth of what a student learns is not constrained to what is taught in the classroom; it also includes environments, people, and situations they are led to by adults

charged with their care. In addition to a school's formal curriculum, Apple and Giroux have asserted that a students' overall learning includes the informal, latent teachings, and the "unstated norms, values, and beliefs" that may be unconsciously disseminated to students (Giroux & Penna, 1979, p.22). These norms and values of the more powerful race and class, students learn, carry power and access to privilege and resources toward their education and success. Students' appeasement or adoption of these norms, behaviors, and values are a type of forced assimilation that reinforces larger systems of oppression (Villanueva, 2018).

When it comes to what students learn, "everything counts" (Freedom to Learn Project, 2015). Students learn from all rituals and practices, whether it is standing in line, asking permission to use the restroom, or learning to raise their hand until called upon rather than blurting out answers. Rituals and practices add to the socialization of a student as they navigate social structures of power. Every day, students confront situations in which they must choose to behave in specific ways that appeal to the levels of power and authority laden in school structures. They learn how to manipulate the system of power and familiarize themselves with what success looks like as defined by those with authority to determine the routines and expectations of the school (Apple, 1971; Brown, 2015; Giroux & Penna, 1979; Giroux & Purpel, 1983). The hidden curriculum extends to extra-curricular activities outside the formal classroom curriculum, including the training and participation of students to interact with donors both in person and through digital media messaging.

### *Medium is the Message*

In terms of looking at images and videos of students that are produced by the school and shared with others for advancement purposes, this study uses McLuhan's theory that every medium carries with it a message and transmits "fixed charges of our personal energies" (McLuhan, p.21, 1997) to understand how students and graduates see themselves captured through digital mediums. Marshall McLuhan published *Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man* (1964) in which he purported that different forms of media and technology are extensions of "physical, social, psychological, or intellectual function of humans." (Bobbitt, 2011, para. 4) His theory is that mediums of technology transmit addendums of our being to the masses. For example, the radio extends our voice, which expresses our intellect. A video or photograph extends our image, our emotions, an expression of ourselves in a given time and place. The mediums through which these extensions of us are manifested carry a message with it. This study uses this understanding that photos and videos, when compounded with the sharing capabilities of social media, carry extensions of our being to environments beyond our control. When extensions of DMA students' lives are dispersed through various online mediums, schools lose their control over the context in which they are shared.

> In *Medium is the Massage*, McLuhan (1967) explains that no one is left unchanged after taking in any media: All media work us over completely. They are so pervasive in their personal political, economic, aesthetic, psychological, moral, ethical, and social consequences that they leave no part of us untouched, unaffected, unaltered.
>
> (p. 26)

Media is influential in affecting and motivating donors to give because features of a video or photograph of students spark an emotional connection in donors that incites helping behavior to those who are blameless for the conditions they are living in (Merchant, Ford, & Sargeant, 2009; Shanahan et al., 2012). Donors are motivated by images and narratives that implore them to identify with those depicted in the media, to donate out of altruistic motivations or feelings of empathy (Evans, 2012). The more mediums one layers, the more intense and effective the media is. For example, text accompanied by audio requires more of the body's senses to be alert than just the text itself. Videos that contain music, the imagery of a child's life at home and school, voices of students, and text, which many of DMA's videos and photographs present to the audience, require that audiences process information. These compounded mediums incite "the emotional response [in donors] of feeling influential" because they have the power to help. (Evans, 2012, p.53) McLuhan wrote, "both monocle and camera tend to turn people into things [...] they become dreams that money can buy" (1997, p.189). While most advancement research focuses on message effectiveness in inciting donors to give, the focus of this study is to find out what messages students and graduates receive from the fundraising media that represents them to more significant audiences to reach advancement goals.

Media that features DMA students was used to incite responses and reflections on when and how students code-switched and navigated home, school, and advancement environments and provide insight into what took away from this hidden aspect of their curriculum and schooling experience.

## Research Questions

This study examines the following research questions:

1. What were and are the experiences of De Marillac Academy students and graduates who participated in advancement practices during 2010-2018?
2. How and when do DMA students and graduates code-switch in advancement settings?
3. How do graduates relate their participation in advancement practices to their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege?

## Delimitations

This study focuses on one school in the entire NativityMiguel network. All 49 NativityMiguel schools are unique in terms of the students they serve, their communities, and their urban context. The sample size is made up of no more than twelve DMA graduates that shared their experiences concerning school advancement practices specific to De Marillac Academy. Their experiences and the themes that arose in this study may or may not be generalizable to other schools in the NativityMiguel Coalition.

DMA's location in the heart of San Francisco, its connections to community organizations, corporations, unique access to technology companies, and benefactors may be similar to that of other NMC schools' contexts. However, advancement practices and outreach methods in other NativityMiguel schools are bound to be different from that of DMA and thus not generalizable to the entire network of schools.

## Significance

Currently there is no existing research in the field of NativityMiguel schools and Catholic educational literature concerned with student perspectives of donor interactions

nor their opinion of images that serve as representations of them as students of a school that is committed to exclusively serving students from low socioeconomic backgrounds. The findings of this study inform schools in the NMC about the student experiences and their thoughts on the images and narratives of them shared online or offline. As NativityMiguel schools continue to provide a successful and innovative model for serving the neediest of students as other Catholic schools struggle with staying financially afloat, it is imperative to investigate the hidden curriculum and impact of school marketing and student representation so that we do not lose sight of those entrusted to our care.

Through a Catholic educational lens, this study expands the degree to which we care for the dignity of our students and elevate their voices through participation and reflection on school fundraising practices.

While there is a healthy amount of research regarding the success of the NativityMiguel model, a study investigating the impact of school advancement practices on students is non-existent. As Catholic and secular schools look to viable, sustainable funding models to serve the underprivileged, it is imperative to understand the long-term effects of presenting students and their stories to more privileged individuals.

## Definition of Terms

| | |
|---|---|
| Advancement: | Used interchangeably with fundraising when speaking within the context of NativityMiguel schools (Quirk, 2010) |
| Advancement Strategies: | "All methods engaged to raise revenue by solicitation of charitable contributions" (Quirk, 2010) |
| Advancement Personnel: | "Persons engaged to perform the function and duties of the advancement office" (Quirk, 2010, p.77) |
| charism: | "a grace or spiritual gift given to those in apostolic or missionary work primarily to help others (not oneself)" (Grieken, 1999, p. 194) |
| disadvantaged | "lacking in the basic resources or conditions (such as standard housing, medical and educational facilities, and civil rights) believed to be necessary for an equal position in society" ("Disadvantaged. In The Merriam-Webster.com Dictionary," n.d.) |
| Lasallian Association of Miguel Schools (LAMS): | The Lasallian Association of Miguel Schools was established in 2003 as a resource and support for new Miguel schools. It predates the merger of the Jesuit Nativity and Miguel school networks merging to form the Nativity Miguel Coalition. |
| NativityMiguel Coalition (NMC): | The NativityMiguel Coalition was established in 2006. It was formerly known as the NativityMiguel Network, which dissolved in 2012 ("NativityMiguel Coalition," n.d.) but later quickly reorganized. It represents the merging of the NativityMiguel and Lasallian Association of Miguel Schools. The NMC is dedicated to supporting, studying, and advising what is effective in member schools, and as a means to connect schools to one another to share best strategies and practices. The 49 member schools of the Coalition are aligned by mission, governance structures and core beliefs (NativityMiguel Coalition, 2014b) |
| NativityMiguel Schools: | Urban middle schools sponsored by religious orders, donors, and benefactors that exclusively serve students from low-income backgrounds. Their extended school day model, small teacher to student ratio, graduate support |

| | |
|---|---|
| | programs, and non-tuition models characterize NativityMiguel schools. |
| Philanthrocapitalism: | a term used to refer to a way of doing philanthropy that "mirrors how business is done in for-profit settings" (Bishop, 2007, para.1) Often refers to philanthropists giving money to schools, expecting data-driven results and innovative models that break from the past |
| "the poor" (Catholic): | When used in the context of how Catholics refer to the poor, the poor includes those believed to be suffering from food insecurity, hunger, work and joblessness, homelessness and lack of affordable housing, to the extent that the basic necessities of life are not secure, such as "food, clothing, shelter, education, health care, safe environment, economic security". When these basic human needs are not met, those who are poor suffer psychologically and spiritually, encroaching on the person's integrity, freedom, and creativity (Benedict XVI, 2009; United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, 2019c; United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, 2019d). |
| Poor (Lasallian): | In the context of the 16th century France, poor in De La Salle's context implied those that we would consider living in lower middle class to destitute conditions today economically. La Salle expressed it to include the "vast majority of people, but not limited to, those at the bottom of the economic scale", his priority was that those living in poor conditions had access to gratuitous schools (Bassett, 1995) |
| Race-class: | Per Kendi's definition (2018), race-classes are "racial groups at the intersection of race and class". Examples include white elite, black elites, poor whites, poor latinx, Asian elites, native poor, etc. |
| San Miguel: | Used to refer to the Lasallian San Miguel schools established in the early 2000s for underserved students in urban cities |
| Students of color: | Per Massingale's definition of "people of color", children enrolled in schools that come from families "without easy access to the political, social, economic, or cultural |

| | |
|---|---|
| | advantages enjoyed by those designated as white" (Massingale, 2010, p. 2). |
| Underprivileged: | Students without the full privilege of access afforded by socioeconomically dominant groups such as political, social, and economic, or cultural advantages |
| White: | The dominant, socioeconomically advantaged group in the United States. "A social group that has access to political, social, economic, or cultural advantages that people of color do not share" (Massingale, 2010, p.2) |

## PART II: LITERATURE REVIEW

The purpose of this study is to engage with graduates of De Marillac Academy, a NativityMiguel school, in collective inquiry around their experience of school advancement practices. The hope of this research is to gain insight into what these experiences were for students, what impressions it left on them, and their thoughts surrounding how they were represented through advancement practices. In order to arrive at this entry point of research, a careful review of the literature is necessary to contextualize what this research seeks to explore.

I begin the first section of the literature review by explaining how NativityMiguel schools like DMA came to exist in the urban landscape of American Catholic schools. It illustrates key features of NativityMiguel schools, characteristics of their school governance structures, student and family populations, the cost of a NativityMiguel education and the advancement practices that must be undertaken in order to stay afloat. Critical Race Theory (CRT) in education is used to relate intersecting racial and social nuances that exist when we consider student experience with school advancement practices given that NativityMiguel schools predominantly serve students of color in urban spaces.

The second section of this literature review is broken into two subsections of advancement optics. The first explores the student and beneficiary experience when a) they interact with donors face to face and the second subsection b) is concerned with the media aspect of advancement strategies and the thoughts of beneficiaries who are featured in them.

| Structure of Literature Review |
| --- |
| NativityMiguel Schools<br>• Urban Catholic Schools in America<br>• The NativityMiguel Coalition<br>• Characteristics of NativityMiguel Schools<br>• Financial Cost of a NativityMiguel Education<br>• Critical Race Theory in Education |
| Fundraising Optics<br>• Student/Beneficiary Experience with Donors in Person<br>• Student/Beneficiary Experience through Media |

## NativityMiguel Schools

### *Urban Catholic Schools in America*

The NativityMiguel school movement is rooted in the Catholic mission to provide educational service to the poor (NativityMiguel Coalition, 2014a; Posiadlo & Philliber, 2003; Shields, 2003). Jesuits run the majority of NativityMiguel schools (see Table 2), but because this study focuses on a school sponsored by the Lasallian Christian Brothers and the Daughters of Charity, it focuses on the Lasallian-Vincentian context.

The educational ministries of the De La Salle Christian Brothers and Daughters of Charity arrived to America in the 19th century and in the 20th they opened schools in an era when immigrant and American Catholic families were able to send their children to attend publicly-funded, free parochial schools. Primarily unpaid religious sister-teachers staffed these schools while loyal Catholic parishioners provided funds and maintained

school buildings. Until the 1920s, Catholic schools continued to receive public assistance from the state to help fund their schools (Walch, 2016). Prior to World War II, parochial education was as popular as ever, and even after the war during the Baby Boom era, Catholic families believed that a quality Catholic education was a viable option for their children. However, in the 1950s and 1960s enrollment in urban schools drastically declined as white, typically Irish and Italian immigrant communities continued to rise socioeconomically, schools desegregated, and many opted to leave for the racially homogenized suburbs, a social phenomenon referred to as "white flight" (Rector-Aranda, 2016; Rich, 2008; Walch, 2016). With white flight, urban parishes saw an exodus in both their parishioners and thus their funds. Suburbanization defunded urban parishes as many less advantaged families of color sought out housing in the city that was previously unavailable to them (Brinig & Garnett, 2010). During this time, the Catholic Church also saw an overall decline as Americans became more and more disillusioned with Church teachings (Walch, 2016). These changing mentalities that questioned the need for Catholic school education and the fleeing of parishioners to the suburbs led to a downward shift and closing of many urban Catholic schools (Brinig & Garnett, 2010; Walch, 2016).

From 1962 to 1965, the Second Vatican Council, also known as Vatican II, met to revisit doctrinal issues and ultimately laid the foundation of our current Church today. It was an effort to make the Church and Gospel more accessible and relevant to lay people. Mass was no longer delivered in Latin, it lessened restrictions on religious orders, and called for all Catholics to spiritually re-awaken their focus on the Church as a missionary to spread goodwill to people of other religions through action rather than

teaching of the doctrine (Teicher, 2012; Walch, 2016). The Second Vatican Council produced a series of documents that took positions on issues of education and the media and called on all religious, including women religious who up to then had confined their lives to the convent and parish school, to break out of their cloisters, read the signs of the times and meet the suffering. This led to an exodus of sorts, where women religious became more independent, founded other ministries, and lived out in the communities where they were serving. When the teaching sisters departed, it left vacant teaching positions. Lay teachers replaced teaching religious at the cost of salary, whereas in the past teaching sisters did so for free. The expense of running parish schools and paying lay teachers competitive salaries created a financial burden that could only be remedied by increasing tuition costs. This made it extremely difficult or impossible for low-income families, who were predominantly families of color to continue to afford Catholic education. Catholic parochial schools were in a sharp decline by the mid-1960s (Greeley & Rossi, 1966; Walch, 2016). Despite white flight, by the 1970s sociologists noted that private Catholic schools were still preferred by parents in urban areas, "The northern and eastern European Catholics who had fled urban parishes for new ones in the suburbs had been replaced by Hispanic and African-American Catholic families. Children of color were now sitting behind the desks of urban Catholic schools." (Walch, 2016, p.143)

Throughout the 1980s and 1990s, urban Catholic schools struggled to stay open as financial strains continued to damper efforts to maintain their school buildings and provide religious instruction. Despite education voucher programs such as those in Milwaukee and Washington D.C. for the economically poor, the number of Catholic schools continued to decline or were forced to turn into non-religious schools void of any

Catholicity (Hamilton, 2008; Walch, 2016). Despite studies that showed students of color that received a Catholic education were more likely to become acculturated and see higher levels of achievement academically, the rising costs of tuition continued to be a financial burden that made it impossible to fulfill the desire of minority families to send their students to Catholic schools (Aldana, 2013; Walch, 2016).

### *The NativityMiguel Coalition*

Concurrently, the De La Salle Christian Brothers and other teaching religious orders like the Jesuits found that they arrived at a point marked by "a shift away from the charism's basic thrust" to seek out and serve those on the fringes of society as their founders originally had intended (Anderson, 2002). American Lasallian educators, also heeding the call of the Vatican II documents, saw a need to re-shift their focus on the Black, Native American, Mexican, Central, South American, and South Asian immigrants in their midst in order to "[recover] the Founder's charism" (Anderson, 2002; Capelle, 2003). It was in a spirit of discernment and examination that vowed Jesuits, Lasallians, and laypeople reoriented their actions and attention to their original mission in education for the poor; they read the signs of the times.

The name "NativityMiguel" is reflective of the history and religious orders that endeavored to return to the charisms of their founders to deliver an accessible Christian education to the poor. "Nativity" represents the Jesuit order, and "Miguel" the Lasallians. "Nativity" derives from the Nativity Mission Center founded by the Jesuits in the 1970s that was originally a community support center, which evolved into a middle school committed to educating the underserved Hispanic population on the Lower East Side of Manhattan. The Nativity Mission Center enrolled young men referred to them by

community partners at the middle school age before they entered high school. Their model of a non-tuition, faith-based education with an extended school day, school year, whopping amounts of social and financial support and community networks proved highly successful in producing groundbreaking results for the young men they served (Hamilton, 2008; Fenzel, 2009a). The characteristics that led to the success of the Nativity Mission Center are the foundation of what unites all NativityMiguel Coalition schools, discussed later in this chapter.

By 1993, the Lasallian Christian Brothers imitated the model to establish their first San Miguel School in Providence, Rhode Island, named after the Christian Brother Saint [San] Miguel Febres Cordero from Ecuador who was a renowned scholar and dedicated religious teacher known for his affect on students in their evangelization ("Saint Miguel Febres", n.d.b; Shields, 2017; Suzuki & Levenick, 2009; Walch, 2016). Previously in the late 1980s, Lasallian Christian Brother Lawrence Goyette and fellow Christian Brothers lived in a low-income neighborhood in Providence, Rhode Island. They asked themselves why they were traveling to other parts of the city to serve in schools where the children were not necessarily poor, but rather well off, coming from families that could afford Catholic school tuition. These Christian Brothers sought instead to shift their vision and purpose to serve the youth in their midst who seemed to be "left to their own devices in the streets" and not being cared for (Anderson, 2002). Br. Lawrence also noticed the effects of white flight, and after attending the Brothers General Chapter in Rome, the directive was that Christian Brothers be encouraged to return to the founder's charism of serving the socioeconomically poor through their founding charism of education.

After painstakingly securing a building and acquiring start-up money from his province, the first San Miguel school was founded “on a wing and prayer” in 1993 (Anderson, 2002, p. 13). Like the Jesuit Nativity Mission Center, the first Lasallian San Miguel school exclusively admitted underserved students acquired through a community network of social workers and community centers that recommended them (Anderson, 2002; Fenzel, 2009b). The school charged no tuition, and over time proved to succeed in providing a quality Catholic education of a holistic nature for underserved young men. This school inspired the opening of another San Miguel school in Chicago and other Miguel schools began to spread rapidly throughout the nation.

Lasallian San Miguel schools hit the ground running in collaboration with lay partners to get schools up where they were needed most. In 2000, there were five San Miguel schools, and by 2006, there were sixteen (Anderer, 2005). Between 2003 and 2006, the Lasallian Association of Miguel Schools (LAMS) brought the Miguel schools together in order to share best practices and support for each school as they looked toward long-term sustainability. Terrence Shields wrote about the uniqueness of the Miguel schools in “Priority to the Poor” and their commitment to providing an education that deepens faith, strengthens the family, is accessible, develops the social and relational abilities of the student, builds a commitment to the poor in the student, in classrooms with small teacher to student ratios (2003). Essentially what sets LAMS apart from the Nativity schools, is that they were strictly Lasallian, inspired by John Baptiste de la Salle’s commitment to serve the children of the “artisans and the poor” (Shields, 2003)

It was the serendipitous bringing together of new age Lasallians and venture Catholic education philanthropists like B. J. Cassin that made this renewed commitment

of schools dedicated to serving the poor and vulnerable through education possible. Cassin is a key figure in the funding of school feasibility studies and start up grants for other groups interested in starting schools based on the San Miguel model as well as the formation of LAMS. This collaboration between the Brothers and philanthropists like Cassin, who were willing to do things differently than before with a spirit of innovation and determination, was reminiscent of how De La Salle worked with generous, wealthy benefactors at the time of founding his first Christian schools (Anderer, 2005). At the onset of school openings, they were concerned with the day-to-day operations, but while some schools matured and others were forced to close, they became more concerned with how to persist as organizations over time.

In 2006, representatives from LAMS and the Jesuit Nativity schools combined and streamlined the model and networks of their schools in order to better collaborate and share best practices and resources in order to strengthen the sustainability of the model and mission. Today the middle schools under these networks are known as the Nativity Miguel Coalition (NMC) (Hamilton, 2008; Shields, 2006; Saroki & Levenick, 2009; Walch, 2006).

> The NativityMiguel model is derived from a 2006 merging of the Jesuit Nativity schools and the Lasallian San Miguel schools. Fr. Jack Podsiadlo, S.J., founded the first Nativity school in New York's Lower East Side in 1971. Br. Lawrence Goyette, F.S.C. opened the first San Miguel school in Providence, Rhode Island in 1993. NativityMiguel model schools saw a significant expansion at the start of the 21st century when they grew from 21 schools in 2000 to 62 schools in 2006."
>
> (Goodwin et. al, 2014, p.3)

### *Characteristics of The NativityMiguel Schools*

NativityMiguel schools are distinguished from other Catholic schools because they are small middle schools that are non-tuition driven and committed to serving low-income children and families from all faiths and cultures (Anderer, 2003; NativityMiguel Coalition, 2014a). NativityMiguel schools are marked by alignment of their missions, outcomes, governance models, and core beliefs (NativityMiguel Coalition, 2014b).

Much of the literature that involves NativityMiguel schools describe the unique characteristics that mark its innovation and success serving students from low-income backgrounds in a more holistic manner than their public, non-religious counterparts (Fenzel, 2009a; Hamilton, 2008; Walch, 2016). NativityMiguel schools are marked by rates of high attendance, higher retention rates, and a higher likelihood of attending and finishing high school, whether through a Catholic private high school or other type of magnet or charter school (Fenzel, 2009a; NativityMiguel Coalition, 2015).

Most NativityMiguel schools are established as middle schools because the middle school years are both developmentally and socially formative years when students of color from underprivileged backgrounds are most likely to leave school (Podsiadlo & Philliber, 2003; Sherwood, 1987). "The responsive middle school truly appreciates the unique developmental needs of young adolescents" (Roy, 2008, p.33). NativityMiguel schools recognize the impact enrolling students during their adolescent years has, and how it better prepares them for high school.

The most distinct characteristic of NativityMiguel schools is that they exclusively serve the economically poor, marginalized, and more often than not, students of color. Admission into a NativityMiguel school requires that students come from families

who are officially beneath the poverty line and are often casted as “at-risk” or what Proehl, Ayon, Braganza, and Sosa call “at-promise” (2007, p.121); both are labels which may perpetuate deficit ideologies when speaking from a majoritarian perspective. Families pay what they can afford based on a sliding scale tied to family income (Daniels, 2015; NativityMiguel Coalition, 2014b). All students admitted qualify for free and reduced lunch (Common Alignment of Member Schools, 2014). NativityMiguel schools make a holistic, religious education accessible to students by adopting a funding model that is non-tuition driven. Families served fall near or below the poverty level and because the schools are founded on the Catholic principle that education is a human right and should be accessible to all children, families do not pay anywhere near the tuition amounts charged and required by other traditional tuition driven Catholic schools (Quirk, 2010). However, that is not to say that families do not financially contribute to their child’s education. Families contribute differentiated amounts based on their incomes (Fenzel 2009b; Posiadlo & Philliber, 2003). At De Marillac Academy, “the average family pays $500 per year” (Daniels, 2015). In a study of a Jesuit Nativity school in Washington D.C., families are responsible “for a $250 activity fee that is spread over a 10-month period” (Grant, 2008, p.84). While these amounts are substantial for the families served by NativityMiguel schools, the sum of these family contributions multiplied by the number of students served are still nowhere near enough to sustain operational costs of the schools, to pay teacher salaries, and provide the wrap-around holistic education NativityMiguel schools are known for; “parental ‘buy in’ has never exceeded 5% of actual costs” (Fenzel, 2009b; Grant, 2008; Meyer, 2008, p.59; Posiadlo & Philliber, 2003).

NativityMiguel schools are marked by their commitment to holistic education, one that "addresses the academic, physical, social, emotional, moral and spiritual needs of a student" (Common Alignment of Member Schools, 2014). Fenzel remarks in many of his studies that this holistic education is the hallmark success of these schools. Students in NativityMiguel schools benefit from school counselors at a low ratio, as well as academic and speech or emotional therapy services. Beyond the socioemotional realm, students in NativityMiguel schools may also benefit from wraparound family services and support in ways not limited to disaster relief, food, dental cleanings, or other basic human needs (Fenzel, 2009a).

Students feel cared for, listened to, and find their school environments more enjoyable than others they have been in and develop relational trust in the adults they interact with on a daily, weekly, or monthly basis, even beyond their graduation (Fenzel, 2009a; Roy, 2008). Fenzel remarks that students "consistently reported higher levels of support and caring from their teachers" and also "enjoyed and benefited from the mentors (local volunteer college students) with whom they had formed relationships" (Fenzel and Monteith, 2008, p. 393). The extended school day model, lower student to teacher ratio, and purposeful intention to meet students where they are and build relationships with their families makes a huge impact on students' motivation to do well.

As mentioned earlier, the support students receive from NativityMiguel schools does not stop when they graduate from eighth grade and head to high school. The graduate support programs are another key characteristic of NativityMiguel schools. It plays a crucial role in helping to see graduates through to their own definition of success (Bryk & Schneider, 2002; Podsiadlo & Philliber, 2003). Graduates indicate "having felt

listened to and cared about… that their backgrounds and abilities were understood and respected by members of the community. Graduates believed that those working with them proved to be capable and honest individuals" (Roy, 2008, p.167-168). Graduate support programs keep constant communication with students in order to ease the transitions throughout a student's secondary and postsecondary journey and set the expectation that graduates will pursue these paths by providing speaker sessions, skill and study workshops, opportunities for community service, college visits, assistance with matriculation, and networking possibilities (Fenzel, 2009a). Additionally, graduates may continue to be called upon to participate in school advancement practices to attest to the success of a NativityMiguel graduate.

NativityMiguel schools positively contribute to students' self-perceptions, especially since they are students from socioeconomically disadvantaged backgrounds. Students reported high levels of support and a positive classroom and peer atmosphere, which are all known to contribute immensely to their intrinsic motivation to show up and do well (Fenzel, 2009a). "Consistent academic gains made, attendance outshines other public schools, parent involvement adds to success" (Fenzel & Deal, 2003). Students and graduates of NativityMiguel schools report that they are a part of a close-knit community and that schools exhibit a culture of family (Proehl et. al., 2017) "They used the term *family* to describe their perceptions of the quality of togetherness they felt with their classmates and teachers (Fenzel, 2009a, p.13). Families of NMC students and graduates have also participated in school advancement practices, appearing in media or in-person at events.

Other key components of a NativityMiguel school program also add to overall cost. All NativityMiguel schools have an extended school day and year for the purpose of catching students up academically to ensure their preparedness to enter competitive high schools in hopes of leading them into postsecondary education or other paths of success instead of possibly being left to the whims of idleness (Fenzel, 2009a).

### *Financial Cost of a NativityMiguel Education*

In these ways, the costs of supporting a NativityMiguel student surpasses what it might cost in other Catholic schools because those families can reasonably afford health services not always accessible to NativityMiguel families; "operating NativityMiguel schools is expensive [...] because of its full-service model devoted to addressing unmet health and other needs of its students." (Fenzel, 2009a, p.16) In his study on the impact of charitable donations on the financial viability of San Miguel schools, Quirk remarks that the cost of a NativityMiguel education may be “$12,000 per student [per year] as compared to $6,000 per student [per year] in a traditional Catholic school” (Quirk 2010, p.39). The NativityMiguel education at a Jesuit Nativity school in Washington D.C. costs approximately $15,000 per year (Grant, 2008), as does the Lasallian and Vincentian model sponsored De Marillac Academy (“Formula for Success”, n.d.).

In order to keep this level of quality education and wraparound services available for NativityMiguel students and graduates, schools require huge amounts of fundraising and continued networking with philanthropists, donors, and community organizations (Daniels, 2015; Fenzel, 2009b; Grant, 2008; Quirk, 2010, Posiadlo & Philliber, 2003). Fundraising and events to bring awareness to the school’s mission, heretofore referred to as “advancement” strategies and practices are “a major concern” (Grant, 2008,

p.86) and practice of NativityMiguel schools. In fact, many NativityMiguel schools employ dedicated advancement teams whose primary task is to establish and develop their donor bases and successfully "market" the schools by showcasing proven results and successes of NativityMiguel schools and students in order to keep school doors open (Fenzel, 2009; Proehl, Starnes, & Everett, 2015). It is for this reason that NativityMiguel schools are commonly aligned in their governance structures to have a president-principal partnership model where the principal primarily focuses on the academic operations of the school while the president and advancement team focus on overall mission execution and decide key strategic decisions related to finance, leadership, and policy. Without successful advancement initiatives under the direction of the president, the holistic and academic education of NativityMiguel students is not possible. "Since the schools charge little or no tuition, considerable funds must be raised annually to ensure continuous operation of the school" (Fenzel & Wyttenbach, 2018, p.32).

While the NativityMiguel model has been adopted by secular independent schools and exist in a variety of governance structures, most are independent, private Catholic or religious schools founded on the principles of religious orders, primarily Lasallians and Jesuits (Fenzel 2009a; Proehl, et. al., 2015; See Appendix B). Since NativityMiguel schools rely on the generosity of donors and benefactors for the majority of operational funds, schools draw on resources in the community to minimize costs while providing unique opportunities and connections.

NativityMiguel schools also draw on the wealth and intellectual prowess of philanthropists and their Board of Trustees to keep schools funded and alive. The wisdom and success of benefactors in the community and business realm are an

invaluable resource in guiding schools toward financial stability. In return, schools may also draw on the networks of these benefactors and philanthropists (Axelrod, 2000; Quirk 2010). The presidents of NativityMiguel model schools tap into the wisdom of their Board of Trustees to identify needs of the organization from a business standpoint. Quirk (2010) notes that the successful NativityMiguel non-profit school will possess a President or chief executive officer that realizes the importance of nurturing individual relationships with Board members and their networks in order to increase the likelihood of donations. "The organization will also have Board members who understand their vital role in individually supporting the organization with their own donation and guiding other individuals to support the organization with charitable contributions" (p. 59).

Board members understand from experience in their own professional business realms that the need for data is paramount for creating a larger network of supporters and capital that can possibly benefit the schools. This amplifies the need for NativityMiguel schools to produce and show data-driven results to assist schools in decision-making and as a tool to showcase their successes to attract and sustain new and existing donors. "Funders increasingly require schools to provide evidence for constructive use of their investments" (Goldschmidt & Walsh, 2013, p. 128). NativityMiguel schools must compete with other schools vying for donor dollars. It is a profound need to have successful advancement strategies and programs to increase charitable donations (Quirk, 2010, p. 42-43). While investors of the school range from one-time donors, to bigger philanthropists, to organizations and corporations, the bigger the entity and the amount of money donated, the bigger the need to provide evidence that funds are being used constructively and successfully (Frumkin, 2010; Goldschmidt and Walsh, 2013).

Board members, benefactors, corporations and individual donors give to NativityMiguel schools for various reasons. In the broader realm of philanthropy, religion and education, the greatest share of charitable donations in the United States, giving money voluntarily is a form of religious service and when deciding where to give money to, the needs of the poor take priority over all others (Quirk 2010). Quirk administered surveys to donors of San Miguel model schools, interested in what their reasons were for giving specifically to these schools. Donors reported giving to San Miguel model schools for a combination of reasons, the primary ones being belief in the school's mission, the realization of their own luck and lot in life, and federal income tax laws and benefits of donating wealth to San Miguel schools. One hundred percent of respondents indicated that they believed their donation would make an impact, which Quirk points out is "evidence that the school has done an effective job in communicating the importance of charitable giving towards achieving the school's mission" (p.109), which is carried out through advancement practices. Eighty-four percent of donors replied that their primary motivation was that they realized their own success and good fortune and wanted to give back. Seventy-five percent agreed that federal income tax laws impacted their decision to make a charitable donation while twenty percent disagreed that tax laws were a factor in their decision to give. Sixty percent of respondents considered themselves to be in the upper income brackets of their field (Quirk, 2010, p.98). Corporations receive tax credits "equal to 50 percent of the amount of a donation that supports the education of a child from a low-income family" (Fenzel, 2009b, p.84). It is also not unusual for donors to create or have foundations that name NativityMiguel schools as beneficiaries to ensure continued giving and support. Overall,

the ability to give children access to a quality Catholic education when that opportunity did not previously exist is the underlying factor (Grant, 2008; Quirk, 2010).

In order to convince and sustain existing and potential donors, larger philanthropists and donors need to be able to evaluate the school program's effectiveness to ensure that they are charitably giving to an organization that produces results (Frumkin, 2010). NativityMiguel schools practice advancement strategies to spread the word and keep their donors and interested parties informed. NativityMiguel schools create mailings both digital and print to report the school's successes and they also create events to personally connect and build deeper relationships between donors and the school, and often the student beneficiaries themselves (Fenzel, 2009b; Fenzel and Wyttenbach, 2018; Joslyn, 2016; Quirk, 2010). These events range in size and kind (See Appendix B). Sometimes schools themselves host the events or are part of other sponsored events in which the school is named as a recipient of the amounts raised. As many Catholic schools do, NativityMiguel schools also host large annual scholarship benefits, art sales, and sporting event fundraisers such as golf tournaments. There are also NativityMiguel schools that host private "friendraisers" in which donors identify and sponsor individual students (Fenzel, 2009b; Grant, 2008). Schools and their board of Trustees and President actively seek out other capable, possible donors and friends within their networks through invitations to tour the school, attend dinner or cocktail parties, and other events in which they may interact with students or witness their testimonies (Fenzel, 2009b). The majority of schools within the NativityMiguel network clearly publicize their fundraising events and feature images and videos that tell the story of their school, stories, and success on their websites (See Appendix B).

There is a lack of recognition in the NativityMiguel literature that the necessity to raise funds to run NativityMiguel schools often requires that students interact with their donors, whether face-to-face, in the same vicinity, through community organization interaction, or digitally. Furthermore, there is a lack of acknowledgment and critical interrogation of the fact that NativityMiguel schools predominantly serve students of color and that their human right to access a quality, Christian education relies on interactions with and the generosity of more socioeconomically advantaged individuals. As mentioned in the introduction, scenes of NativityMiguel advancement activity often feature students of color from underprivileged backgrounds juxtaposed amidst predominantly white funders.

### *Critical Race Theory in Education*

Critical Race Theory (CRT) in education is a theoretical framework, pedagogy, and a methodology that seeks to name, analyze, and transform the structural, racial, and cultural inequities found in schools. As we recognize that NMC schools serve predominantly students of color from disadvantaged backgrounds and the majority of funders in a position to give substantial amounts of capital to the school are white and/or elite, CRT is applied to the experiences of students and graduates who have participated in school advancement practices at DMA.

CRT is committed to acknowledging the central role that race plays in examining structural inequities. It originated in the 1970s among critical race legal scholars in an attempt to illuminate unjust aspects of the law that maintained the subordination of communities of color and hindered their access to rights and liberties granted and enjoyed exclusively by white communities (Caldwell & Crenshaw, 1996). The long-lasting ill

effects of slavery, colonization, the construction of race, and the emergence of whiteness and white privilege continue to permeate our American society and schools today, albeit sometimes inadvertently. Whiteness, or being born with fair skin allows privileges not granted to people of color. Ladson-Billings & Tate (1995) draw on the fact that in the colonial times, Native Americans and African Americans were subject to the white man's idea that land and black people could be acquired and owned as property. African Americans, Native Americans, or any human that was not white were seen as subordinate. African Americans entrenched in slavery were sold as property with no individual, human rights of their own. Social institutions developed in the early colonies privileged the physical and intellectual property of the white race, including their notion of land ownership, their narratives, and epistemologies. Even after the civil rights movement and decades after that, communities of color continue to experience social inequities and injustice in all realms of American society simply because of the color of their skin. White privilege, as Solórzano and Yosso (2002) describe it, is an "invisible package of opportunities and benefits […] bestowed on an individual simply for being White" (p.111). The idea that white is ideal and "good" creates a binary where anything not white is "bad." It implies that, as a young Filipino protagonist puts it to his white "colorblind" friend in the book *Patron Saints of Nothing*, "white is default and implies that difference equals bad instead of simply different" (Ribay, 2019, p.37).

Solórzano (1998) outlines the five themes of CRT:

1. The centrality and intersectionality of race and racism: At the forefront of CRT is the understanding that racism is endemic and permeates social institutions. Racism is "ingrained legally, culturally, and even

psychologically" (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995, p.52), including our schools. Eurocentric perspectives continue to shape the practices, curriculum, and expected norms of schools and educators and affect students of color in negative ways that hinder the multifaceted potential of their identities and ways of knowing (Delgado Bernal, Lynn, Yosso, Solórzano, Parker, 2002).

2. The challenge of dominant ideology: CRT rejects the Eurocentric epistemological perspective and claims of neutrality, color blindness, and meritocracy (Delgado Bernal et al., 2002). These claims serve to merely protect the privilege of those who benefit from their Whiteness (Solórzano, 1998)
3. The commitment to social justice: CRT is committed to seeking political and social change equity and equality for communities of color. CRT envisions the elimination of racism, sexism, and poverty, and works toward the empowerment of non-white minority groups (Delgado Bernal et al., 2002; Solórzano & Yosso, 2002)
4. The centrality of experiential knowledge: CRT holds the experiences of people of color as authentic and valid in and of itself. Critics of CRT claim that CRT methodologies and testimonies are not objective enough and try to devalue the experiences of students of color. CRT commits to listening to experiences not often shared and seeks to expose and challenge majoritarian stories of racial privilege (Delgado Bernal et. al., 2002; Solórzano & Yosso 2002).

5. The interdisciplinary perspective: CRT accepts that race intersects with additional layers of complexity such as sex, gender, immigration, language, class, etc. It uses intersectionality to deconstruct the experiences of students in schools. It rejects criticism that CRT essentializes race and treats all people of color the same, instead, CRT sees identity as multidimensional, shifting, dynamic, and based on experience (Chapman & Donnor, 2015; Delgado Bernal et al., 2002)

CRT in Education acknowledges that school norms and practices often inadvertently reinforce deficit and racist ways of thinking about students of color considering that school curriculums and power structures elevate epistemologies derived from the dominant white majority (Caldwell & Crenshaw, 1996; Solórzano & Yosso, 2009). CRT in education helps us contextualize the experiences of young students of color that participate in advancement practices. These advancement practices are intended to appeal to more privileged individuals who not only have the power to fund students' education, but influence the decisions made by leadership. CRT challenges claims of neutrality and colorblindness and insists on the relevance of first-hand accounts as truth in and of itself (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). It seeks to identify and transform aspects of schooling that are (inadvertently or not) racist towards students of color and acknowledges that identity is not founded on race alone, but intersects with other factors such as class, immigration status, and gender for example (Solórzano & Yosso, 2002). Related to CRT are Bell's interest-convergence theory, Morton's cultural code-switching, and Carter's "acting white".

Interest-convergence takes place when the interests of the privileged majority converge with the advancement of people of color (Bell, 1980; Chapman & Donnor, 2015; Rector-Aranda, 2016). Chapman & Donnor (2015) call on researchers to "interrogate how corporations and for-profit entities benefit" from funding schools. This is applicable to this study, as donors of NMC schools enjoy the privilege of receiving tax credits and a favorable public image of fulfilling corporate social responsibility and being charitable in the name of social justice. While donations to NMC schools are completely necessary, the advancement rituals of scholarship benefits and listing of donors acknowledges the contribution of expenses, but also reproduces structures of domination. "Celebrated as acts of patriotic or humanitarian generosity, giving remain acts of *symbolic violence* subjugating those witnessing them" (Hites, 2019, p.481). In a review of literature concerning donor motivation in San Miguel schools, Roy explains that most donors want to use their money to positively influence education, poverty, and inequality while maintaining their own standard of living. In his survey on donor motivation, it was clear that for the majority of donors, aside from a spirit of goodwill and charity, considered a great influencing factor in their decision to donate are the tax deductions allowed by the Internal Revenue Service (Quirk, 2010).

Levinson (2007) believes that equal opportunities in education will continue to be out of reach for low-income children if code-switching is not explicitly taught. Code-switching is a means for minority children to learn and challenge the systems that oppress them (Levinson, 2007). However, Emdin (2010) insists that the distinction must be made between code-switching and teaching students to act unnaturally for acceptance. When students are encouraged to act or choose to act unauthentically or in opposition to their

"neoindigenous identities" they "spend their entire lives copying another person's culture and looking down on their own" (Emdin, 2010, p.177).

If a student begins to look down on others who share in racial and cultural identities, they risk being seen as a social outlier, or may be accused of "acting white" (Carter, 2006). The social signifiers of "acting white" are explored by Prudence Carter in her 2006 article "Straddling boundaries: Identity, culture, and school." Carter used mixed methods to investigate the notion of "acting white" in connection with young people of color's attitudes about school and success. She outlines the four dimensions of "acting white":

- Collective and individual signifiers in language and speech codes
- Racial and ethnic in-group/out-group signifiers centered on cultural style via dress, music, and tastes
- Meanings of group solidarity symbolized by the racial composition of students' friendship and social networks at school
- Interracial power dynamics of superiority and subordination

(Carter, 2006, p.315)

Carter also found that three groups emerged when it came to how black and Latino students believed group members should behave: cultural mainstreamers, cultural straddlers, and noncompliant believers. Those who were coined as cultural mainstreamers believed that group members should assimilate and accommodate the values of the American schools they are a part of. A participant in Carter's study that was characterized as a cultural mainstreamer looked down on group members for the way they spoke, "[r]efusing to uphold some of her peers' prescriptions of blackness, she

relegated some of her schoolmates' speech to ignorance and stupidity" (p.316). However, it was found that cultural mainstreamers are still found to be in touch with their racial and ethnic identities.

Noncompliant believers are described as such because although they may criticize the structural inequalities that schools reproduce, and although they may know how to code-switch, they choose to embrace their "own class and ethnospecific styles, tastes, and codes and opt not to conform to the mainstream (marked as 'white') and middle-class ways of being" (Carter, 2006, p.308). Nevertheless, noncompliant believers still *believe* in the value of education and the rewards of high achievement as a vehicle to break through social structures.

Carter finds that behavioral cultural straddlers, or students that are "strategic navigators, ranging from students who 'play the game' and embrace the cultural codes of both school and home community" (p. 308) are best able to negotiate the cultural spheres that they belong to the best whether in their home or school communities. These students take a more blended approach to their behavior and identify their values tied to school and success simultaneously through their multiple social identities. Carter implicates that schools that seek to explicitly promote interculturalism serve their minority students better and see favorable academic and positive social ramifications than schools that do not.

The imagery of students and practices of DMA advancement teams may inadvertently maintain or increase stigmas of inferiority based on race, class, and other intersecting identity factors DMA students possess. School advancement activities in schools that depend on outside funding tend to be successful when students of color

conform to images of perceived “whiteness” (Brown, 2015). In her ethnographic study of an urban charter school, College Prep in New York, Amy Brown (2015) speaks to the professional “look” necessary to appeal to school funders.

> Students were Black and Latino, spoke in Standard English, consistently came to school on time and in uniform, could talk about being college-bound, despite the hardships or challenges in their lives, and would be sure to say great things about College Prep. It was important to perform both neediness and deserved in our solicitation of funders’ help and to make funders feel generous, important, appreciated, and not threatened. (p.2)

Solórzano & Yosso (2002) note that in cultural deficit storytelling, “successful students of color are assimilated students of color” (p.31). Whiteness is viewed as the ultimate cultural capital, by conforming to the expectations of donors, students gain access to new networks that make it possible for them to establish control over their life’s trajectory rather than being under the dominion of others (Caldwell & Crenshaw, 1996; Rector-Aranda, 2016).

This study utilizes the central tenets of the CRT framework to give credence to the first-hand accounts that graduates share as they reflect on their participation in advancement events. It enables us to see how possible encounters with racism and microaggressions shape, influence, or impact their self-perceptions and worldviews (Kohli, 2008).

## School Advancement Optics

Literature concerning NativityMiguel schools is primarily concerned with its history and its unique approach to providing a transformative education for students who

live in poverty. No study of NativityMiguel schools has been concerned with the student experience of advancement practices. All NativityMiguel schools have school websites that feature student faces and the great majority of schools host events where students are present (See Appendix B). I turn to the broader field of philanthropy to be informed in this study of the issues that surround student and donor interactions in person and through media. Even though these advancement practices exist for the necessary purpose of raising money and attention to the cause of the emancipating children and families from the cycle of poverty, this study is concerned with exposing the thoughts and experiences of students who participate in advancement practices as there are power dynamics at play between the donor and the beneficiary, both in person and through the medium of images and video (Eikenberry & Bhati, 2019; Manzo, 2008; Ostrander & Schervish, 1990). Being a NativityMiguel student means interacting with donors in person or through school media, it is a component of their educational experience that affects the way they see themselves and others in the world.

From here on, this literature review investigates advancement practices in two ways:

First, I discuss literature from the field of critical philanthropy that speaks to the experience of beneficiaries when they interact with donors **in person**. Students and graduates who receive funds are often present at school advancement and fundraising events in order to connect with individuals who possess the potential of donating to the organization's cause.

Lastly, I discuss literature that discusses beneficiary thoughts on **media** they are featured in that is shared with donors at fundraising events through physical and digital

media such as large posters and videos shown during advancement events. As schools and organizations further their cause by harnessing the power of social media, there are questions surrounding the preservation of dignity for children who are portrayed in advancement materials via images and social media to donors.

### *Beneficiary Experience of Advancement Practices in Person*

Students of NativityMiguel schools are often present at school advancement events (Fenzel, 2009b). These "special events" as Quirk (2010) calls them, include black tie dinners, golf tournaments, school visits, cocktail parties, and other meetings where "potential donors can meet and hear testimonies from students and teachers at the schools" (Fenzel, 2009b, p.84)

At De Marillac Academy, students are coached to present themselves and interact with guests by the faculty and staff of the school. In a video shared online, DMA fourth graders practice shaking hands with one another, introduce themselves, properly ask someone to repeat themselves if they couldn't hear someone, and then we see them transfer these skills to adult visitors who step into the classroom unannounced. "No matter how quietly a visitor enters, that day's class greeter is up like a shot to extend a welcome" ("De Marillac Academy", 2011, 00:08:48). Advancement practices such as school visits and scholarship benefits are intended to connect the donors face-to-face with their beneficiaries. Face-to-face contact is considered an invaluable strategy to fundraising successfully because "it allows for close proximity, which promotes intimacy, trust, and caring" (Marx, 2000, p.146). When donors meet the students who their generosity will benefit and create a personal connection, they are more likely to give larger gifts than if the solicitation had been indirect or mediated (Ebede, 2018; Marx,

2000). However, these interactions can leave students feeling uncomfortable because it brings up a variety of fears of what might occur during that interaction. In a study by Ebede (2018) concerning college students who were given training workshops on how to interact with possible donors, students experienced general discomfort and fears of rejection, being unprepared, annoying, or offending when approaching a possible donor. Ebede conducted pre- and post- preparation workshop surveys to measure if there was a change in students' level of comfort, and found that training workshops lessened students' anxiety, as did teaming them up with another student, introducing students to a people with fundraising experience, and framing the activity as an active learning exercise rather than a plain solicitation.

Issues of race and socioeconomic standing compound the tension of advancement activities, as NMC students come from predominantly students of color (DeMarillacAcademy, n.d.c; Fenzel, 2009a, Shields, 2015). There is no research that attests to the demographics of donors to NativityMiguel schools. In Quirk's study on donor motivations in San Miguel model schools (2010) "Donor Survey Demographics", only focuses on gender, years of service, and whether or not the donor was a graduate of a Lasallian school.

Faculty and staff of NativityMiguel schools continue to be predominantly white even though there is a great effort by some schools within the network to diversify their school leaders and board members (Fenzel & Wyttenbach, 2019; Fenzel, 2009a). Regardless, it is the faculty and staff that mediate the training that students undergo when they are about to enter into advancement events or when visitors enter school grounds. NativityMiguel students are faced with interacting with adults who have

power that dictates what is valued and decided by the organization that then act as mediators to further the cause of the school through their own personal and professional networks. Proehl et al. (2017) acknowledge that relationships between De Marillac Academy and nearby technology companies have yielded "employee gifts, corporate-sponsored grants, and employees who have volunteered" (p.117). Although the efforts of advancement staff, board members, faculty, and other partners are well-intentioned and necessary, the ways in which the adults share this message in the midst of students' presence at advancement events and meetings can be problematic for students. In Aldana and Kubadi's Critical Race Theoretical Examination of the Cristo Rey Network (2019), which is also a Jesuit and Lasallian network of secondary schools that provide a Catholic, college prep curriculum coupled with a corporate work-study program, it was revealed that students feel frustration and confusion when it was their poverty being made an example of in philanthropic settings and yet is not discussed in other realms of their educational experience:

> He would use a few students to come to orientation to show them what the firm produces. He would say, "And a lot of students there are from impoverished communities" -- like myself, a lot of my friends. And it was just important for us to recognize it, I think, that we came from those backgrounds, whether we wanted to talk about it or not-- the staff, other students, specifically us.
>
> (Aldana & Kabadi, 2019, p.48)

In an article written by Tara Kenny (2017) in which she recounts her experience of being an underprivileged student of color among wealthy people, she explains that

being exposed to people and settings of privilege gave her the “language and mannerisms “ of the wealth, but left her with “an internalised shame about being poor”.

In her book *A Good Investment? Philanthropy and the Marketing of Race in Urban Public Schools* (2015), Amy Brown, a former schoolteacher of College Prep in New York, conducted an ethnography which highlighted the ways that the expectation for certain behaviors and ways of talking in the classroom known in the school as “professionalism” became a political spectacle that students performed “in front of the curtain” (Brown, 2015, p.45). Behind the curtain, the authenticity of the student was suppressed, and they learned how to “turn it on, turn it off” instead of taking a critical look at why this code-switching behavior was sanctioned and expected of students.

She adds that uniformed bodies of private schools give the impression of disciplined bodies, and that only certain students are asked to actually participate at events where they will be in the spotlight or interacting with donors of the school. The school’s commitment to professionalism is what makes it marketable to its investors, a school that is needy and deserving of upward mobility and social and cultural capital. One of the teachers in Brown’s ethnography, reflects on her experience of being present at a scholarship benefit full of mostly white funders hearing that it was their generosity that made the school possible:

> And then I remembered being a high school kid and sitting in a room and hearing everyone talk about me like I wasn’t even there. And hearing everyone talk about how messed up my life was. And how I needed them to save me… And every single kid in that room was checked out… They were either on their phones, or talking to each other, or trying to go to the bathroom together… because any part

> of the presentation that talked about the need to save them from Newark talked about them in a way that made them feel uncomfortable in middle school. And they gotta sit through those things because they are chosen over and over again. They choose the same kids, over and over again. They've gotta sit through those presentations over and over again, and all they keep hearing is, it's not their hard work that makes a difference, it's not their parents that makes the difference. It's these White folks who are giving them twenty-five thousand dollars a pop who make their lives possible."
>
> (Brown, 2015, p. 206)

The fact that this teacher retroactively remembers this uncomfortable moment from her experience as a student and observes and identifies the same sentiment in the "kids" present at this benefit reveals the tension that can exist for socioeconomically disadvantaged students of color in these types of scenarios.

### *Beneficiary Experience in Advancement Media*

If students do not interact directly with guests and benefactors, donor audiences are likely to at least audio-visually witness images with students through a digital medium, such as photos or poster boards, videos of teacher and student testimonies and footage of the school, their stories, and their successes. Samples of this media featuring students, faculty, and families are also easily accessible by visiting any of the NativityMiguel school websites (See Table 1). Use of beneficiary images is shared abroad through social media and is a vital and effective advancement tactic to spread the word of any non-profit organization's cause that hinges on donations (Breeze, 2012; Congress, Luks, & Petit, 2017). Ostrander and Schervich (1990) posit that the media for

communicating beneficiary needs are “words and images that are put together in such a way as to make a normative or moral appeal for support” (p.72). Advancement teams recognize the need to tap into donors’ emotions in order to justify the donations they are asking for.

The majority of research on fundraising is donor centric. Research tends to focus on who gives and why people give instead of examining or questioning who benefits, who decides, and the experience of beneficiaries (Eikenberry & Bhati, 2019; Breeze & Dean, 2012; Ostrander & Schervish, 1990).

Advancement materials tend to focus on the broader issues at hand such as lack of access to education and select faces that best represent the general population they are serving and portray these beneficiaries as “deserving” of donors’ generosity. (Breeze, 2012; Rosenthal, 2000).

The most convincing way to solicit donations is the use of children’s faces because they are the most vulnerable and innocent; they attract greater attention because they are born into contexts into which they have no control (Bhati, 2016; Shanahan et.al., 2012). When donors see faces of children in need, they experience negative waves of emotions such as sadness, anger and anxiety. Experiencing negative emotions of injustice done to other human beings drives donors to relieve this unpleasantness by helping. Other studies have found a positive correlation between negative emotions and helping behavior (Burt & Strongman, 2005; Merchant et. al., 2010; Shanahan et. al., 2012). The use of children’s faces reminds donors of their own cultural associations with childhood such as dependence, innocence, and the need for protection and care. It incites a donor to recognize their ability to help, and act in *loco parentis* to children by providing

donations to fund a need unfulfilled by the child's parents and circumstances (Manzo, 2008). The imagery of facial expressions has the ability to induce sympathy, empathy, or cause "emotional contagion" in the observer (Andersson and Valentine, 2015). Donors are also persuaded to give when the faces of children are shown smiling and enjoying life, because these positive visual messages show donors how their donations worked or the potential of the happiness their donations will contribute to (Manzo, 2008).

Photographers battle with whether to showcase children in a good light rather than showcasing the real need of these children (Bhati, 2016; Breeze, 2012). The media produced is admittedly crafted to tug at donors' emotions because organizations must raise as much money as possible. Breeze and Dean (2012) used photo elicitation methods in focus groups with photographers who work for charities and with people who are homeless who the photos are intended to help. Photographers recognized the "unfortunate necessity" of creating these images to tug on the heartstrings because "the images need to make as much money as possible." (p.136).

Children and families in need are in a vulnerable position. They depend on the funds the images are intended to help generate and students and families may not always be fully aware of how their images will be used. In a study by Warrington and Crombie called *The People in the Pictures: Vital Perspectives on Save the Children's image-making* (2017), they found that while beneficiaries understand that having their photos or videos taken helps to spread the message of a cause intended to benefit them, and although they were extremely grateful for the help provided by the organization, there exists a sense of <u>obligation</u> from beneficiaries to say yes to the need to be photographed. One project manager explained that she often has to step back and use her

professional judgment to decide whether someone may be too vulnerable to participate despite their willingness to do so.

In addition to a sense of obligation, beneficiaries feel a sense of powerlessness when the purpose of the photos is intended to help them. In Breeze & Dean's study (2012), beneficiaries believed that when you are receiving help from an organization, you are not in a position to be morally outraged over an issue. The priority of meeting fundraising goals overrode their ethical concern over how they may be portrayed inaccurately or how their situation was generalized.

Beneficiaries prefer when a photo or video tells their story rather than oversimplifies their need or background. They care about the stories of their context being shared in a way that helps to educate donors as to the conditions they live in rather than just one image with no room for explanation and history (Hibbert, et al., 2007 as cited in Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012). Generic and oversimplified representations of underprivileged children are harmful as it diminishes the uniqueness of their particular story and overgeneralizes the circumstances of those in need and may further lead to enforcing negative stereotypes and possible racism (Bhati, 2016; Ove, 2010). While it may serve organizations to quickly use generic images of beneficiaries devoid of their story attached to it, it leads audiences of these images to generate oversimplified interpretations and assumptions about beneficiaries' lives.

Beneficiaries and their photographers want to present dynamic accounts in a way that preserves their human dignity (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012, Warrington & Crombie, 2017). Beneficiaries reported that they want to be portrayed in a good light, that they are seen as people with potential that bear intelligence and

dignity. In a study on the portrayal of destitute children in fundraising campaigns of NGOs in India, children expressed a desire that images generate awareness of their life circumstances and also show them as brave, unique, and full of innate potential (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016). They do not want to be pitied, but rather recognized for their innate worth and "prefer the use of images that elicit feelings of empathy rather than merely sympathy and they hope for marketing that generates a generous response as a result of a recognition of common humanity rather than through emotions such as guilt or pity" (Breeze & Dean, 2012, p.141). Across all of the research sites in Wardle & Crombie's study (2017), there was a desire expressed by beneficiaries to be portrayed as empowered individuals who can help themselves, as those who work toward the solutions to their problems, and as individuals full of resilience. There was also a strong call for children to speak for themselves in advancement materials and be portrayed with dignity.

The idea of dignity is an abstract and difficult notion to define and put into literal practice. What may seem dignified to one person may not be considered so by another. According to Catholic social teaching, human dignity roots from the belief that all human beings derive their dignity is rooted in their creation in the image and likeness of God, and that all human beings are worthy of respect and freedom from slavery, manipulation, and exploitation ("Human Dignity", n.d., par. 1). Warrington & Crombie note the dilemma of defining dignity when it comes to producing images of beneficiaries and their life circumstances but argue that the images produced are a place where dignity can be realized.

Addressing dignity must involve consideration of how beneficiaries feel about their portrayal and offering them genuine respect and agency in the process of image

making. For contributors, having a choice in how they are represented, and coming away from the image- making process with a clear understanding of the purpose and value of their contribution, is dignified. Dignity involves listening to the thoughts and experiences of the beneficiaries.

Warrington & Crombie (2017) also found reluctance from beneficiaries about having their images correlated with a life of deficiency and there was an understanding that families who chose not to participate did not want their child's image to be tied to social stigma of being poor, "If you're talking about poverty and families struggling with income, that's something people don't confess to anyone...support workers and social services, they all know... but the [people themselves] won't be advertising it to everyone that actually things are really tough and things are really difficult…" (p.30) Other parents were concerned with the permanence of portrayal; "your child would be associated with that for the rest of their lives". Another expressed the lack of agency a child would have over their image, "They have got to live with that for the rest of their life" (p.30). While these families opted out of having their child's image taken, as mentioned earlier some families and children feel obligated to give back, powerless, and do not want to seem ungrateful to an organization that is providing them aid. The relationship between those who are giving aid and those receiving it is not an equal one and there must be a constant vigilance concerning the dignity of the beneficiary being upheld (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012; Ostrander & Schervish, 1990; Warrington & Crombie, 2017).

Despite signing waivers in which they agree to have their image taken to aid the organization's advancement goals, beneficiaries are not always fully aware or informed

about where their images are shown and what in context they will be represented. Once their images are taken, beneficiaries have little to no say about how those images will be used (Andersson & Valentine, 2015). In Warrington & Crombie (2017), it was highly suggested that organizations practice continuous communication with those that they photograph to the best of their ability as a way of giving agency to those they are charged with empowering.

Communication approaches and resources must be developed to support contributors to understand the purpose, use, the likely audience of their content, and any potential consequences. Ideally, this dialogue should enable those with less power to feel comfortable expressing their preferences and concerns to others involved in the process (Warrington & Crombie, 2017, p.84).

It is suggested that when it comes to the image-making process, organizations should:

- Invest in creative and collaborative approaches
- Uphold beneficiaries' rights and fulfill duty of care
- Make informed consent part of the essential process
- Commit to sensitive and effective communication before, during, and after image gathering,
- Ensure that human dignity is upheld in the image-making process, not just the image itself (p.67)

Beneficiaries who have their images taken have strong views on their power over the photos and videos and how their story is told. Children desire the agency to give that permission in the first place, and to be aware of where and how those images are shared

(Breeze & Dean, 2012; Warrington & Crombie, 2017). How children are depicted ultimately influences how children see themselves in the world in relation to others. Children can exercise control over their self-image by being given choices and the opportunity to participate in projects and activities that give them the ability to provide feedback (Wardle, 1995).

Social developmental stages of adolescents into adulthood is also important to understand when investigating how students and graduates perceived their experience with advancement activities. According to Erikson's Eight Stages of Development as described by Gould & Howson (2019), until the age of about 11, children are concerned with industry vs. inferiority. They question, "How can I be good?", especially in school where they must prove their competence (Cherry, 2019). Therefore, children may be more willing to participate in advancement activities if they see it as a way to please those with power and authority. When students in middle school age beyond 12 years old, they turn a corner both physically and mentally. These young teenagers start to become concerned with their identity vs. confusion about who they are. They begin to understand who they are, who they want to be, and set out to determine their identity in the midst of their social landscape (Cherry, 2019). Social-emotional stages of development must come into consideration when investigating why students may have been more eager to participate early on in their middle school career, as opposed to the latter years of middle school and into high school.

By providing a sincere place of welcome to all participants and the truth of their experiences at the table, we become a truer reflection of Jesus' table fellowship that allows us to challenge the boundaries that hinder true inclusion, acceptance, and equality

of the students entrusted to our care (Massingale, 2010). Since the 15th century, Lasallians have concerned themselves with the education of young people who otherwise would not have access to a quality, Catholic education. As the landscape of Catholic school funding changes, schools concerned with accessibility to this kind of education can no longer depend on tuition models. The NMC has been an innovative model that due to the generosity and mission of NativityMiguel educators and philanthropists makes Catholic schooling available for marginalized children in our current society today. Despite reports of feeling safe and cared for in NMC schools, the tensions of race, class inequity, and deficit thinking permeate modern-day schools and society. Studies report that while beneficiaries are grateful for the benefits of philanthropic donations, there exists a performative aspect to interacting with donors face-to-face and a desire to have some kind of control over how their images and stories are used to fund the cause. This study intends to fill the gap in NMC literature concerned with the educational experiences of students in which participation in advancement materials is part of their hidden curriculum and intends to do so by listening to their thoughts and reflections on this aspect of their schooling experience as they recall on the past. As NMC school leaders, educators, and advancement personnel accompany our students and donors in grappling with issues of race, class, power, and privilege, we exemplify our commitment toward working for justice and liberation, rather than charity.

# PART III: METHODOLOGY

## Restatement of the Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this qualitative study was to understand the collective experiences of DMA graduates regarding their face-to-face and digital interactions with donors, how students code-switch and adapt their behaviors in these environments, and how these interactions affect their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege. This study explored how students in various interactions with donors felt these experiences as part of their educational experience in a NativityMiguel school. This study intends to shed light on the student experience of advancement practices that feature students through in-person and digital interactions with donors. By exploring the experiences of DMA graduates, schools within the NativityMiguel Coalition, Catholic, secular schools, as well as community organizations and companies who give to NMC schools can be informed and more mindful of how advancement practices impact students' perceptions of themselves and the hidden curriculum of their educational experience.

This study examined the following research questions:

1. What were and are the experiences of De Marillac Academy students and graduates who participated in advancement practices during 2010-2018?
2. How and when do DMA students and graduates code-switch in advancement settings?
3. How do graduates relate their participation in advancement practices to their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege?

## Research Design

I chose a qualitative research design for this study that mainly relies on individual and small group, photo-elicited semi-structured interviews as my primary data source. I

did this as a way to encourage students to share with me their experiences as students of DMA and their feelings toward school advancement practices.

Photo-elicitation has its roots as a method in anthropological studies of social class, organization, and identity and cultural studies (Lapenta, 2011) The combination of visual and verbal methodologies has allowed researchers to understand how participants see societal structures through the participants eyes in their own words (Bhati, 2016). Photo (and video) Elicitation Interview method (PEI) was selected because it is a means to study the phenomena of involving students in school advancement materials and practices from the perspective of those captured in these images and participating as students in school advancement practices. PEI allows for the participants' experience to be the core of the interview and empowers informants to take control of the interpretation of the visual matter for themselves rather than allowing the researcher's own assumptions to overtake the narrative (Collier & Collier, 1986; Lapenta, 2011; Pink, 2009).

This methodology was chosen because this study is concerned with how graduates feel about the visual message and nature of school advancement practices that transmit their images to wider audiences for informational, school marketing, and fundraising purposes. Other studies that use photo elicitation methods in group settings have stimulated reflective discourse from participants from socioeconomically disadvantaged communities who have been photographed for fundraising and informational purposes (Andersson & Valentine, 2015; Bhati, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012; Harper, 2002). Other studies use photo elicitation interview methods to give vulnerable groups of people, especially young people, the power to speak to images they

have taken or were taken of them (Liebenberg, Ungar, & Theron, 2014; Warrington & Crombie, 2017; Waymark, 2015).

Additionally, PEI helps participants recall the past. PEI allows the researcher "to gain a phenomenological sense" of the informants' experiences (Harper, 1986, p.25), and has the capability of drawing out what participants were feeling when the images or video were taken and what the images mean to them now as graduates (Bates, McCann, Kaye, & Taylor, 2017; Harper, 1986; Ungvarsky, 2018). Showing graduates photos and videos from past DMA school advancement materials and events has the potential to provoke conversations around what was happening at the time and reveal emotional connections and meaningful reflections from participants surrounding this unique component of their educational experience as DMA students (Bates, et. al; 2017). Harper (2002) maintains that interviews that use both images and text draws responses from deeper parts of the human consciousness because "the parts of the brain that process visual information are evolutionarily older than the parts that process verbal information" (p.13)

PEI allows informants to use their experience and expertise on the subject of the photos and gives them the lead in discourse. Critics of semi-structured interviews argue that instead of building rapport, as is its intention, semi-structured interviews force the participant to accept the views of the researcher. PEI method seeks to address this strain by allowing the images to anchor the conversation and gives participants ownership of their interpretation. PEI allows for a more collaborative dialogue between interviewer and interviewee and helps the researcher avoid misinterpretation. It aids the interviewer in attempting to understand the experiences rather than force their perspective of the topic (Bates et. al, 2017; Lapenta, 2011; Pink, 2007; Waymark, 2015). This study uses semi-

structured interviews following a protocol that focuses on their experience and participation in school advancement practices. The following procedures were done for this study:

- With the interviewee's permission, all interviews were recorded with a digital recorder and transcribed.
- I took brief notes during each interview, describing what was happening before the interview, whether it was online or in-person, and why
- I created a database of these interviews and my notes, compiled the data in nVivo and reviewed each interview to check for accuracy.

In order to provide a level representation of student experience, I selected students who self-reported that they were asked to participate very often or often in advancement activities. I chose to conduct these photo elicitation interviews in individual settings, only in one instance did I interview two participants at a time. In Waymark's 2015 study, he uses photo elicitation as a research method with students and notes "students may persist in their view of the teacher as an authority figure rather than a neutral researcher and be reluctant to divulge certain information" (p.11). I was sure to report to participants that their identities would not be revealed. While I had originally planned to tap into the camaraderie that already exists among students as a class to interpret the images and their experiences together in small groups, COVID-19 made it so that I had to act quickly to gather these interviews with individuals before the shelter in place policy was enacted.

The use of images in interviews aided the interview process by drawing out issues or subjects that may seem too complex to explore (Lapenta, 2011). It has been noted that when PEI is used as a methodology with young people, it helps with awkward and

difficult silences and keeps interviews stimulating and structured, without being repetitive (Waymark, 2015). The photos and videos selected are part of DMA's institutional past; these images connect informants to experiences and eras of their lives that occurred earlier.

## Setting

De Marillac Academy (DMA) is an independent, Catholic middle school established in 2001 in the Tenderloin neighborhood of San Francisco, CA. It is part of the NativityMiguel Coalition (NMC) and in addition to its sponsorship by the De La Salle Christian Brothers; it is the only NativityMiguel model school in the Coalition that benefits from the charism, leadership, and service of the Daughters of Charity.

### *The Lasallian Tradition and the Institute of the Brothers of the Christian School*

On May 15, 1950, Pope Pius XII named St. John Baptiste de La Salle the patron saint of all schoolteachers (Brothers of the Christian Schools, n.d.). Born to a noble family in Reims, France, St. John Baptiste de La Salle (1651-1719) worked toward providing a quality Christian education to the poor. In De La Salle's context of 17th century France, schools offered primary education in variable ways that were neither useful nor accessible for lower- and middle-class families. A quality Christian education was only accessible to wealthy families, which perpetuated poverty. It kept the rich educated and the poor disempowered.

Serendipitously, in 1679, De La Salle met Adrian Nyel through the Sisters of the Holy Child Jesus. Nyel had recruited young men as educators in Rouen, France to run a school for poor boys. Their education was funded by the generosity of a wealthy Madame Maillefer who was a relative of De La Salle. When De La Salle and Nyel met,

Madame Maillefer had sent the latter to Reims, her hometown, to open another school to educate poor boys there. After speaking with one another, they spent some time at De La Salle's house working out the details of this endeavor. Weeks after, another wealthy widow wanted to sponsor a Christian school in Reims at her local parish but would only do so if De La Salle was involved (Grieken, 1999). Here in the very beginnings of De La Salle's commitment to education for the poor, we see the importance of his collaboration with philanthropists and Church orders in order to bring his mission of changing lives through education to fruition.

While Nyel was good at recruiting teachers, he was not good at developing their vocation or teaching skills. As Nyel continued to open new schools rapidly, De La Salle realized that without proper training of the teachers, these schools would prove ineffective. In order to make good on his promise to manage the wealthy widow's investment, De La Salle invited the teachers, who were hardly literate or disciplined themselves, to meals at his home in an effort to see that their teaching was carried out in a "religious and conscientious manner" (Grieken, 1999, p.39). De La Salle strengthened the faith, zeal, vocation, and teaching abilities of his fellow teaching Brothers by living in community with them and establishing uniformed routines and expectations that served to benefit the teaching Brothers and thus their students. To further prove his dedication and solidarity with the poor and the teaching Brothers, De La Salle resigned his position as Church canon, doled out his remaining wealth in food to the poor during a winter famine, and relied on "providence through poverty" (Grieken, 1999, p.45) to guide his efforts toward making education more accessible for poor children and "toward the salvation of their souls toward a life filled with hope." (Grieken, 1999, p.91; *Signs of*

*Faith,* 2000; *St. John Baptiste de La Salle,* n.d.). De La Salle and the Brothers went on to run the other schools that Nyel had left in their care after his death and the impact of the faith, zeal, and discipline of their teaching practice expanded over generations. Wealthy French philanthropists continued to draw on the strength and success of the Christian Brothers under the guidance of De La Salle to open more Christian schools for the poor.

By 1680, St. John Baptist de la Salle established the Institute of the Brothers of the Christian Schools to serve the economically poor and marginalized children of Reims, France (Salm, 2002; "Signs of Faith", 2000). They were the first Catholic religious order committed solely to the education and formation of young children. The Brothers aimed to break the reproduction of poverty through fostering academic and spiritual growth of underserved children with education and sought to evangelize students to a faith that compelled them to lead lives of virtue and purpose (Grieken, 1999; "Signs of Faith", 2000; "St. John Baptiste de la Salle", n.d.).

By continuing to contemplate these questions and give preferential treatment to the poor, Lasallian schools today answer to five interconnected core principles: to have concern for the poor and social justice, to respect all persons, to provide a quality education, and to build an inclusive community, all through their faith in the presence of God. The Brothers *Declaration* defined "the poor" not just in the economic sense, but those who suffered from "poverty of intelligence, of affection, of faith" born out of frustration of injustice that hindered individuals due to socioeconomic constraints and unjust institutions (Brothers of the Christian Schools, 1997, p.22). The Lasallian mission of education and their five core principles are aligned with the Gospel message of care

for learning and loving our students and the greater Catholic Church's commitment to education and preferential treatment of the poor (Johnston, 1999).


The Lasallian school today believes a quality education does not build the intellectual capabilities of the mind but also the ability of students' hearts to critically examine the world in light of the Gospel message (Brothers of the Christian Schools, 2014).

The Lasallian Core Principle of respect for all persons expresses their specific concern for upholding the dignity of all. This core principle is a reflection of the Lasallian belief that all relationships be filled with respect regardless of position and authority in the school and with the "acknowledgment of each other's identity as the children of God" (Brothers of the Christian Schools, 2014). De La Salle insists that educators give great consideration to the children entrusted to them, that they deserve "greater consideration than the children of royalty" such that these children are the "living images of Jesus Christ" (Grieken, 1999, p.81). This insistence is echoed in the Vatican II document *Gaudium Et Spes* (1965), which declares the value of every being of

God's creation and their autonomy, "all things on earth should be related to the human as their center and crown" (12). This pastoral constitution also insists that we read the signs of the times, and remain vigilant to how technology and communications are developing at such a rapid pace that it becomes impossible for us to stay abreast of examining whether our practices recognize that all human beings are tied to the Divine (5). Pope Francis further states:

> The education of children and young people is such an important task in forming them as free and responsible human beings. It affirms their dignity as an inalienable gift that flows from our original creation as children made in the image and likeness of God. And because education truly forms human beings, it is especially the duty and responsibility of the Church, who is called to serve mankind from the heart of God and in such a way that no other institution can.
>
> (United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, 2019)

Lasallians have a constant concern for the poor and social justice. The Brothers *Declaration* defined "the poor" not just in the economic sense, but those who suffered from "poverty of intelligence, of affection, of faith" born out of frustration of injustice that hindered individuals due to socioeconomic constraints and unjust institutions (Brothers of the Christian Schools, 1997, p.22). They ground themselves in creative study to discover ways to adapt to meet and express concern for the poor entrusted to their care in Catholic schools, which the Congregation for Catholic Education (CCE) considers the heart of the Catholic Church (CCE, 1997, para. 11; *Declaration,* 1997, 33.1; Salm, 2002). In the *Rule* (1987) of the Brothers of the Christian Schools, the Institute expresses their preferential treatment for the poor:

> The Institute is concerned above all for the educational needs of the poor as they strive to become aware of their dignity and to live and to be recognised as human beings and children of God. The Institute establishes, renews and diversifies its works according to what the kingdom of God requires. (11)

Lasallian educators are beckoned to read the signs of the times and confront possible issues as they arise, especially in a world in which the voices and needs of the most vulnerable go ignored (Brothers of the Christian Schools, 1997, 8.1). When placed in our contemporary context, the *Declaration* asks Lasallian educators to train their students to be critical of media and its effects, but also to self-reflect periodically on the educational practices of Lasallian schools. The *Declaration* Lasallian educators must remain sensitive to situations that may prove to be unjust to those they intend to serve (Brothers of the Christian Schools, 1987, Art. 11, 13-14) and express this concern through action and solidarity.

Br. Álfaro Echeverria's Pastoral Letter: *Associated with the God of the Poor* (2003) reminds Lasallian educators that creating a more just society means involving the voices of the poor. We cannot expect our students to live in service to others if we do not model ourselves the vigilance and care necessary for protecting and elevating the dignity of the vulnerable and the "salvation of souls" of children entrusted to our care (De La Salle, 2007, p. 436). Mejia-Garcia, in her work titled *Current Poverties in Lasallian Schools: Increasing Intercultural Sensitivity and Empathy*, provides a Freirean connection to Echeverria's message, that it is of utmost important to involve the poor when examining systems of oppression in order to break the cycle of poverty. "The vision of both men [La Salle & Freire] is to form a just world indeed, through the

collaboration and generosity of the rich and the poor" (Mejia-Garcia, p.21). Lasallian educators are to ask themselves, "How does the voice of the poor join into the significant conversations in which I participate at my school?" (Grieken, 1999, p.157).

In addition to including the voices of the poor to establish an inclusive community that critically self-examines the educational practices of Lasallian schools, everyone who works towards the mission of Lasallian schools is called to confront possible injustices towards underprivileged students in our care. In his pastoral letter on the Defense of Children, The Reign of God, and the Lasallian Mission (1999), Br. John Johnston encouraged all Lasallians, "Brothers, partners, parents, former students, board members, pupils, [...and] associations of former students to be engaged" in activities that seek new answers to the new problems of our context today in real solidarity with the poor. Schackmuth also expresses that beyond teachers, "all who work in Lasallian schools are educators and contribute to the educational experience (Schackmuth, 2012). Catholic schools are communities that include everyone directly involved with the school and students to take responsibility for the excellence of the educational experience and to awaken a critical sense of examining the world and participating in the fulfillment of the Gospel message to love and be concerned for one another (CCE, 1988).

Since De La Salle worked with Nyel, Madame Maillefer, and Sisters of the Holy Child Jesus, the Lasallian mission has endured and transformed over centuries throughout the world as Lasallians continue to work today with lay educators and partners in association. Christian Brothers gladly associate with laypersons committed to education as their professional work "or form of gospel ministry" and charity (*Rule,* 1987, Article 17). The history of De La Salle and those that have sustained his legacy tell us that

collaboration between educators and the wealthy to provide education to the poor is not a new development. It has continued to show itself in new iterations. The funding model of NativityMiguel schools three centuries later is an example of how generous laypeople and modern-day Lasallians continue to collaborate and dedicate their lives to breaking social barriers for the spiritually or economically poor children in our midst.

The NativityMiguel school movement is rooted in the Catholic mission to provide educational service to the poor (NativityMiguel Coalition, 2014a; Posiadlano & Philliber, 2003; Shields, 2006). Jesuits run the majority of NativityMiguel schools (see Table 2), but because this study focuses on a school sponsored by the Lasallian Christian Brothers and the Daughters of Charity, it focuses on these charisms to inform the context of DMA.

### *The Vincentian Tradition and the Daughters of Charity*

De Marillac Academy derives its name from St. Louise de Marillac, the co-foundress who together with St. Vincent de Paul started of the Daughters of Charity in 17th century France. Like St. John Baptiste de La Salle and the Christian Brothers, the Daughters of Charity worked in service to the "poor, sick, abandoned outcasts in the countryside and cit[ies]" of France (Gibson, 2002, p.20; Sullivan, 1995).

The Counter-Reformation age was a ripe time of religious devotion and spiritual renewal in France at the turn of the 17th century. St. Vincent de Paul was born to a family of farmers in 1581, was sent to school in preparation for priesthood, and started out as a remarkably young priest for his time, called to serve the most marginalized of French society at the age of 19. Vincent believed that "love needed to be shown in affect and effect", enthusiastically committed to founding and managing a Confraternity of Charity, which inspired other small groups in France to dedicated themselves to providing for

long terms needs of people who were sick and impoverished with clothing, food, healthcare, improved prison conditions, and education (Gibson, 2002, p.26). In what was considered a radical move at the time, St. Vincent de Paul invited women religious to work in collaboration for the marginalized and in need. In 1623 he was asked to be a spiritual advisor for Louise De Marillac, who was recently widowed and a Lady of Charity. Early on in their relationship, Vincent de Paul recognized Louise's command for leadership and organization to turn the love he acted out of to go from affect to effect. She was called upon wherever new initiatives were underway and turned the enthusiasm Vincent had into action. Through much prayer and action, St. Louise de Marillac and Vincent de Paul provided the leadership that led to serving the needs of orphans, inhumanely treated galley slaves and prisoners of the time, the sick in hospitals, and the elderly. They treated those they served with such compassion and care that they hoped to show those who ignored the needs of these populations a model that was less harsh and "prevented worse brutality" (Gibson, 2002, p.32; Sullivan, 1995).

Most relevant to this study, St. Louise de Marillac introduced free schools for poor, illiterate girls. They provided free education and wraparound services in Paris and rural areas in petites ecoles, or "little schools" (Gibson, 2002, p.33); they saw education more than just a benefit of alleviating poverty but as a human right of the poor (Sullivan, 1995, p.150). The Daughters of Charity are credited with playing a major role in overcoming illiteracy among the French female population (Sullivan, 1995).

It was St. Elizabeth Ann Seton in Emmitsberg, Maryland that tapped the American spring of the Daughters of Charity from France and is also the "first saint to grow from the soil of the U.S." (Gibson, 2002). Elizabeth Ann Seton, born in New York,

converted to Catholicism after enduring various tribulations in her life including child abandonment, bankruptcy, the death of her husband, children, and others close to her to tuberculosis and other fatal ailments. With the guidance of Bishop John Carroll, she left New York for Baltimore, Maryland to escape the discrimination she was receiving for being Catholic, and also to undertake a call by God to provide an education for her children and others.

Just as St. John Baptiste de La Salle found blessings through the charity and generosity of wealthy philanthropists, St. Elizabeth Ann Seton received ten thousand dollars from Samuel S. Cooper, a rich seminarian, to establish a religious community in Emmitsburg, Maryland. Bishops and priests insisted that she model her school and religious community based on that of the Daughters of Charity in France. The Daughters of Charity sought a humble and modest lifestyle and established St. Joseph's free school and academy in 1809. St. Joseph's served young immigrant girls in need of a Catholic education and was the first Catholic parochial school in America ("Daughters of Charity: Province of the West", n.d.; Gibson, 2002, p. 17; Walch, 2016).

Based on the wisdom derived from correspondence between St. Vincent de Paul and St. Louise de Marillac, and the model of their lives lived in service, the educational work of Vincentians is grounded in their core values:

1. Holistic- seeks to respond to the intellectual, spiritual, moral and affective needs of the students—educates the heart as well as the head
2. Integrated- blends the humanistic and the professional, the abstract and the practical

3. Creative- ever seeking new or renewed ways to meet changing needs among the student population while maintaining a clear "sense of the possible."
4. Flexible- willing to make the effort to adapt to the needs of the non-traditional student
5. Excellent- places quality at the center of its educational activities. It seeks excellence in:
    a. Teaching: the instructor must not only be competent but must also be efficient, dedicated, and reveal "all those virtues required of the students;"
    b. Methodology: the method employed must be active, challenging, competency based, and enable the student not only to learn but to enjoy doing so;
6. Person oriented- must be one in which all—administration, faculty, staff, and most importantly, students—are respected and valued
7. Collaborative- seeks to collaborate rather than merely compete with other educational institutions
8. Focused- central to the Vincentian mission of service to the poor

(Sullivan, 1995, p.178-179)

These Vincentian Core Values, in addition to the Lasallian Core Principles stated above are what ground and inspire the mission and vision of the schools that were later founded together in collaboration by the Daughters and the Brothers centuries later in San Francisco (Gibson, 2002).

### *Lasallian and Vincentian Collaboration in San Francisco*

By the 1850s, San Francisco was a new and bustling city in the midst of the Gold Rush. There was an estimated 25,000 people, half of whom were Catholics, but unfortunately many were gripped with cholera, which left many children abandoned by their fathers (Frings, 2002 p.4). The Daughters of Charity in Maryland were called upon by Bishop Alemany to start an orphanage, which evolved to contain a school in the newly established, bustling San Francisco. The Daughters endured an arduous journey across the Isthmus of Panama to California, only five out of the seven Daughters survived. They went on to successfully begin an orphanage and expanded to include schools and healthcare services for people in poor and destitute conditions ("Daughters of Charity: Province of the West", n.d.; Frings, 2002). From 1902, through the great San Francisco Earthquake of 1906, and into the 1980's, the Daughters of Charity served thousands of young women with a robust educational curriculum at St. Vincent School which later was renamed Cathedral.

Bishop Alemany also called upon the educational service of the De La Salle Christian Brothers to San Francisco. By 1874, the Brothers were running Sacred Heart College, an all-boys high school. In 1966, the all-girls Cathedral opened a new campus kitty corner to Sacred Heart and as they grew closer in vicinity, they also enmeshed their curriculums to supplement the others. In the 1980s, it made sense for the schools to merge, thus marking the official partnership in 1982 between the by then well-established Daughters of Charity and De La Salle Christian Brothers in San Francisco, becoming Sacred Heart Cathedral (SHC) (Frings, 2002).

### *De Marillac Academy and the Tenderloin*

This official collaboration between the Brothers and Daughters at SHC is instrumental to the start of De Marillac Academy as is the generosity and partnership with venture philanthropists, community organizations, and educators. San Francisco lawyer, investment executive, and SHC parent Lou Giraudo suggested the idea of a Nativity school to the Brothers and Daughters just as both orders were reimagining how "to return to the poor" at the heed of Vatican II (Brothers of the Christian Schools, 1997, p. 25; Garcia, 2002; Gibson, 2002). After considering potential Miguel-school sites around San Francisco such as Hunters Point and the Mission District, the committee found that the building of St. Boniface School on Golden Gate Avenue just six blocks east of SHC was vacant and planted their new endeavor in the "heart of the city", the Tenderloin. DMA would not have been made possible without fiscal and generosity and mission of the Daughters of Charity foundation. In collaboration with the De La Salle Institute, Catholic educational philanthropists like Giraudo and Cassin, and SHC faculty and staff committed to renewing the charism to meet the needs of the underserved in the midst of San Francisco. De Marillac Academy opened their doors to serving children of the Tenderloin community in 2001 (De Marillac Academy, n.d.a; Garcia, 2002).

The Tenderloin neighborhood of San Francisco is often judged solely as a harbor for drugs, crime, and filthy streets. While it is true that one may witness drug deals, addicts, or gang activity out in the open in its' streets, the Tenderloin is much more than may first appear to be. Beyond this first glance those who reside here or care to learn the rich history and vibrant community of the 31 block district will defend its character as one of the few remaining neighborhoods in expensive San Francisco where impoverished

and low-income residents, whether housed or unfortunately homeless, find unmatched access to public services and resources. It is a neighborhood that has historically proven to be a place where many begin their lives anew or find refuge from being different from, ignored, or marginalized by the status quo of society. In the early 1900s, independent women fighting for their right to be in public unaccompanied by a man and independent found affordable housing in single room occupancy hotels close to their workplaces on Market St. In the 1950s, the Tenderloin was a refuge for gay men seeking community and was a haven for transgender women later in the 1960s. In the 1970s, the Tenderloin was the new home for thousands of displaced Southeast Asian refugees escaping war. By the 1980s and 90s, it was the one community that for over a century by then had resisted the pressures of succumbing to "urban renewal", protected affordable housing by rejecting tourism and is one of the few areas in a major American city that has resisted gentrification at all costs (Shaw, 2015).

While many look to its history of being the vice capital of San Francisco, and despite the reality of drug deals and chronic homelessness on its' streets, the protections on affordable housing make it one of the few places families from low-income or immigrant backgrounds can afford in the city. According to the Bay Area Women and Children's Center *Survey of Tenderloin Children and Family Issues* data summary of 2016, the number of children residing in the Tenderloin is over 3000, making it the neighborhood with the highest density of children in the city of San Francisco (The Bay Area Women's and Children's Center, 2016; Shaw, 2015). Prior to 1997 there were no community schools in the Tenderloin, "1200 young students rose before the sun to catch buses to nearly 50 schools around the city, some as far as Treasure Island" (Bay Area

Women's and Children's Center, n.d.). When De Marillac Academy was established in 2001, it was the first Catholic community school to be established since St. Boniface School, which served the German community of early San Francisco and had closed in the 1960s. De Marillac Academy now resides in the former St. Boniface School adjoined to St. Boniface Church (Dunnigan, 2018).

On one of the busiest avenues of the Tenderloin, De Marillac Academy is heralded as a jewel and oasis in the Tenderloin and has worked with community organizations over the last decade to strengthen the bonds of partners in mission who work for the families and residents of this community. (Daniels, 2015; Proehl et al., 2017). For example, organizations sponsor DMA field trips around the city and local school students and faculty volunteer and give time, talent, and treasure to DMA. DMA benefits from a partnership with 826 Valencia across the street, which supports their yearly anthology of eighth grade poetry and students have their physical education classes in the Kelly Cullen Community Center's gym, also across the street. DMA has worked with local police and public works crews to promote cleanliness and safety. DMA students benefit from a partnership with the University of San Francisco's School of Education school counselors and many other experts offer pro bono services to DMA in their area of expertise whether it be law, health, robotics, filmmaking, social media marketing, or strategic planning (Daniels, 2015). Many of these experts and volunteers donate financially to the school.

Starting in 2011, there was a sudden influx of technology companies interested in basing their headquarters in the mid-Market community directly adjacent to the Tenderloin. The local government was interested in attracting new investment to the area

and Twitter wanted to relocate there and "would only do so if it would be exempted from San Francisco's unique payroll tax" (Shaw, 2015, p. 249). This tax break also attracts other technology companies to the area including Dolby, Microsoft Yammer, and ZenDesk. These companies and others regularly send volunteers to the school and "have collectively donated more than $100,000 in employee gifts and corporate-sponsored grants" (Daniels, 2015).

It is typical of all schools in the NMC to partner with community organizations and corporations to work toward neighborhood improvement and to fulfill the school's mission to break the cycle of poverty through education (Daniels, 2015; Fenzel, 2009a, 2009b; Proehl et al. 2017; Shields, 2017). The advancement office of DMA engages with individuals in these organizations and companies of San Francisco, especially the ones mentioned earlier by inviting them to their annual scholarship benefit, publishing images and videos online, school visits, corporate days of service and other meetings where students and donors or potential donors interact face-to-face or through media. DMA benefits from its central location in one of the most "dynamic, forward-thinking, and socially progressive" districts in the already liberal San Francisco (Shaw, 2015).

## Population and Sample

The racial makeup of DMA student and graduate population is entirely people of color. The racial breakdown as of 2019 is 67% Latino, 23% Asian Pacific Islander, 6% multiracial, 3% Asian, and 1% African American (De Marillac Academy, n.d., b). The majority of students live in the Tenderloin (55%), the nearby South of Market district (18%), or in other neighborhoods in San Francisco (27%) (De Marillac Academy, n.d., b). According to federal poverty standard levels all students qualify for free lunch: 46%

are from families with extremely low income, 35% from very low income, and 19% are a family of low income.

As of May 2019, over eighty-three percent of college-aged DMA graduates have either completed or are enrolled in a 2-year, 4-year, or vocational post-secondary program. Current enrollment in a post-secondary program was not a requirement of participants in this study. Grounded in the Catholic belief that all voices are worthy and have the right and duty to participate in order to seek the well-being and the common good for all, it was intended that all graduates of DMA would be invited to participate in the study (Paul VI, 1965b). However, COVID-19 forced this study to focus on the participants who were in reach and most responsive at the beginning of the participant recruitment process. Regardless, this study acknowledges that voices have the potential to impact advancement practices that continue to occur in NativityMiguel and other Catholic schools. Young people are "active participants in society" (United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, 2018); the aim of this research was to provide a greater understanding of their experiences to inform the future of school advancement strategies and practices.

For the purpose of narrowing down a timeframe of when DMA's advancement practices were consistent year to year, participants were students or graduates that were involved in advancement activities during the 2010-2018 years. This span of time was chosen because despite high faculty turnover at DMA, the make-up of the advancement team and advancement strategies was relatively consistent. For example, the Annual Scholarship Benefit was held at the Westin St. Francis hotel in San Francisco with a dinner program consisting of student, graduate, guest interaction, and choir

performance. The school regularly produced images to be shared online and offline to spread the news of the school and their needs. It is also during this timeframe that DMA embarked on a social media campaign with local filmmakers to produce video content pro bono to be used online and at advancement events.

I gathered a mix of interested graduates who participated in advancement activities as students or graduates in school media or at face-to-face advancement events. My goal was to have a minimum sample size of at least ten graduates altogether from various graduating classes, with no more than 2 graduates in a group interview to allow for enough time for each participant to share their thoughts and experiences. If the graduate was under the age of 18, parental consent was sought. Based on the demographics of the DMA student population, all participants are graduates of color from low income backgrounds who are or were living in low to extremely low income levels according to federal poverty standards at the time of their education at DMA and come from predominantly Hispanic, Asian, or African American populations (De Marillac Academy, n.d.c).

The experiences of young people and their childhood is socially constructed, most heavily impacted by class and place (Tickle, 2017). Since I interviewed young people, between the ages of 14-28, the interview protocol was semi-structured so as to respect the ethics of interviewing youth.

In order to recognize my place as a researcher and limit my subjectivity, I kept research memos to keep my own bias and opinion in check so that I could be objective in interviews. In addition to allowing me to monitor my role, reflexivity allowed me to "evaluate the extent to which my methods were reliable and valid, the optimisation of

young people's participation and the ethical integrity of the research" (Tickle, 2017). By constantly questioning how my positionality affected the way I interpret participants' responses, I acknowledged and reflected upon how my position as a former teacher of some of the participants may affect their responses. I noted what particularly incited emotion in me as interviewee when I listened to participants speak and reflected upon how that emotion may have derailed my objectivity. It was important for me to accept the responses as they were, and not lead with my own agenda, or harm the mental well-being of the participants by opening up aspects of race and class in a way they may not have thought about before. As a Catholic Lasallian-Vincentian educator, I am in service to my students, not the other way around.

To identify potential participants, I coordinated with the graduates that I already knew and spread the word through them to ask if they knew anyone who would be interested in participating. I began with a preliminary survey to gather demographic data of possible research participants and the degree of experience they had with advancement strategies during their time at DMA. My hope was to acquire a mix of graduates who were featured or not featured prominently in advancement events and materials, however all the graduates that took the survey responded that they felt they participated in advancement activity often. Due to COVID-19, I did not have the ability to reach out to graduates who were never featured in advancement activities. I conducted these interviews at Sacred Heart Cathedral Preparatory in San Francisco, online via Zoom, or in a place of the interviewees' choosing. Sacred Heart Cathedral Preparatory was an option since it was a central and familiar location for graduates to meet me. Interview lengths ranged anywhere between half an hour to an hour and was conducted in a private

setting to allow graduates to speak freely and critically about the images and their experiences in advancement activities.

Due to COVID-19, I met online with a few of the graduates and conducted interviews virtually. I shared the photos and videos for elicitation purposes before and during the interview process, graduates were able to scroll through the slideshow of photos and videos at their own pace and respond whenever they felt compelled to. After the interview process was done, I blocked access to the photos and videos used during the elicitation interviews to prohibit any unwanted tampering or circulation of the photos and videos used for this study, for the sake of the graduates who were represented.

## Researcher's Role

In this study I chose the collection of photos and but did not arbitrarily choose which images or videos graduates expressed their experiences or thoughts about. I planned to steer participants toward the research questions I outlined earlier if long silences occurred or if the conversation went off-topic, but this did not happen. I found everything they shared about their experience to be relevant to their process of recalling their engagement in advancement activities and their understanding of how race, class, power, and privilege plays out in their education. Given the tendency of images in PEI interviews to keep conversations going organically, I did not have to redirect conversations; this fell in line with my commitment to allow participants to speak freely about their own experiences and takeaways from this component of their DMA education. Given that graduates were familiar with me since I was a DMA faculty member for six years, it was my hope that they felt comfortable and critical enough to express their thoughts and opinions concerning advancement practices. I deeply care for

my students, all graduates, and how their educational experiences affect their thinking about themselves and their perceived place in the world. I am often reminded that much of what we remember about our schooling experience is how they felt in addition to what they were taught. I played a part in DMA's institutional past and students' recollection as a faculty member of color who was ultimately doing the same thing as they were doing, interacting with donors and being featured in a few social media pieces here and there. As a researcher, I also shared this experience with the graduates I interviewed. I hoped that I allowed them to feel that they could be honest and open in their conversation with me.

I was DMA's digital literacy teacher and librarian from 2010-2016. During the 2015-2016 school year, I appeared in a video concerning DMA's digital literacy program shared through social media as an invitation to give to the school online. During my time as a faculty member of DMA, I participated in coaching sessions that prepared students for advancement events like their annual scholarship benefit and Open House. I also worked at advancement events and assisted the advancement office in selecting students to be featured in advancement programming and media. Many of the graduates interviewed are former students of mine. Therein lies an inherent position of power among graduates as an educator of the institution. Graduates may associate and see me as an extension of the school, in a position of power, which may affect their responses to the interview questions or what they choose to disclose. While I hope our relationship allows them to feel safe to share their experiences from a place of trust, some may not have felt completely comfortable opening up. In some cases, graduates' awareness of my critical socio-political views may have affected how they respond to interview questions

and prompts. However, my positionality and unique perspective as a woman of color that mirrors their ethnicities I believe, granted me access to data from students built on the trust of our pre-established teacher-student relationship in a way that an outside researcher may not have been able to reach. I have continued to volunteer at DMA events when asked to and am proud to be part of the Lasallian-Vincentian DMA and communities.

## Data Collection and Interpretation Procedures

I followed the steps outlined by Bates et al. (2017) and conducted by other researchers that used photo elicitation method with semi-structured individual interviews.

In Step One, I gathered an initial collection of photos and videos used in advancement materials online and offline that were used as tools to provoke memories surrounding their experiences as students and graduates in advancement activities. We did not analyze the photos or videos themselves, but rather used them as an aid to elicit memories, feelings, and reflections of their student and graduate experiences.

In Step Two, I invited and briefed participants on the nature of the study as an invitation to share their experiences for the purpose of this study in interviews and data collection. I did not re-publish the images in my study itself to lessen apprehension about any consequences interviewees feel might happen as a result of participating and giving feedback in this study.

In Bates et al.'s Step Three, researchers discussed giving time to participants to actually go out and take the photos themselves since this is a common feature of photo elicitation method studies. However, since this study used images that were already produced by DMA's school advancement team, this step involved me siphoning down

photos and videos captured of students engaged in advancement activities. These photos and images were photos and videos already available online or ones in which students had agreed to have taken of them when they were students by way of the waiver signed by families at the beginning of each school year.

In Step Four, I presented the photos and videos as simple stimuli for the interview. I had a slideshow of various images on two screens that participants watched and had access to as we conducted the interview, as well as physical copies of available advancement material. The mix of photos and video were meant to stimulate thoughts and memories of their participation in school advancement events such as the Annual Scholarship Benefit, as well as having been photographed to produce such images for advancement purposes. Participants were given some time to look through the images and videos on their own. I recorded the dialogue with a voice recorder while they looked at the photos and videos. Only one interview was done in a pair, I suggested that one participant speak at a time, but that the other raise their hand when they had something to say so we were sure to include their perspective. All participants were encouraged to share their thoughts and reflections, but they did not have to if they didn't want to. All participants had the right to end the interview at any time, for whatever reason. After each interview, a follow up email was sent to thank the participants. All participants were interviewed once but were invited to email me if any thoughts came up after the interview.

In Step Five, I transcribed the interviews and explored themes that arose while participants discussed the image gallery. I used language from the theoretical frameworks

and research questions of this study to codify themes and searched for patterns in participants' experiences of school advancement practices.

An initial Google survey was sent to interested participants that responded to my emails inquiring if they would be interested in participating in this study regarding the student and graduate experience of advancement practices. Other interviewees joined the study through the snowball effect of graduates reaching out to other DMA graduates they thought would be interested in this study. I reached out to the graduates that responded most quickly to my inquiries, the COVID crisis of 2020 made it so that I had to operate as quickly as possible to interview participants in person before the city of San Francisco mandated shelter-in-place policies. Once shelter-in-place policies were enforced and citizens were no longer encouraged to meet in person for non-essential purposes, I met graduates online via or Zoom or over the telephone. Seven of the twelve graduates were interviewed in person. Graduates were given access to the photo and video elicitation virtually during the interview so that we could view it together and I could record their reactions to particular photos or videos.

## Ethical Considerations

Since the experiences of DMA graduates are essential to the study, I did not name any graduate participant by their name without their consent and instead use pseudonyms to protect their identity.

Critics of photo elicitation methods caution that participants could be "confronted with a new and previously not considered understanding of their social world" (Bates et. al., 2017, p. 465) It was possible that a graduate may have left the interview with positive or negative realizations or feelings about this aspect of their DMA education. Images

have the capability of amplifying feelings because of their emotion provoking nature. I exercised extreme care and sensitivity in stressing that each participant's experience and feelings about their experience at DMA in regard to advancement practices are their own, I continued to stress that each graduate's truth is theirs and theirs alone to feel and voice. I emphasized the commitment and mission of De Marillac Academy and reminded them that this study was a way for us collectively to be critical of advancement practices in order to improve them if necessary for the benefit of the school, its present and future students, and its potential to inform other schools in the NativityMiguel Coalition, Catholic, and secular schools. If I sensed that graduates felt uncomfortable, I planned to emphasize that participation at all stages of the research was entirely voluntary and that no one was absolutely obligated to participate in the interview. I did not sense that any graduate felt uncomfortable, graduates spoke freely, critically, and came to their own closing points in conversations.

## Limitations

The limitations of this study involved sample size and methodology. It is possible that the sample size of graduates, as well as the varying levels of their perceived participation in advancement practices may not be representative of the entire student and graduate population or their specific experiences depending on how much they were featured in advancement materials or at advancement events.

# CHAPTER IV: FINDINGS

## Introduction

This study sought to discover the thoughts and experiences of DMA graduates regarding their current and past participation in school advancement practices. Specifically, this study used photo and video elicitation methods to examine what experiences resonated with students and graduates that participated in school advancement activities. This study explored when and how DMA students and graduates code-switched while participating in school advancement activities. Next, this study was concerned with how graduates relate advancement practices to their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege.

This chapter is organized by the three research questions that guided this study, and the findings and emergent themes that arose throughout the photo and video elicitation interviews. The three research questions are:

1. What were and are the experiences of De Marillac Academy students and graduates who participated in advancement practices during 2010-2018?
2. How and when do DMA students and graduates code-switch in advancement settings?
3. How do graduates relate their participation in advancement practices to their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege?

## Summary of the Interviewees

Out of fifteen graduates that filled out the initial survey, twelve were interviewed. Nine interviewees are females and three are male. Six interviewees are enrolled in high school and are between the ages of 14-18. Four interviewees are

between the ages of 19-25 and two interviewees are 26-34 years old. All DMA graduates 19 years or older are either enrolled in college or have graduated with a bachelor's degree. The oldest graduate has a master's degree.

Reflective of the general student population of De Marillac Academy, the interviewees described their race as either Latino, Asian, or African American (See Appendix D). In regard to language, four interviewees reported that English was their home language, while the other eight interviewees reported that Spanish or Tagalog was the primary language at home in addition to English. Graduate interviewees self-reported through this survey their participation in school advancement activities such as media production, the Annual Scholarship Benefit, or interacted with guests at De Marillac as "always" (6), "often" (4), or "occasionally" (1).

All interviewees report that they engaged in advancement practices every year of their time as students at De Marillac Academy either on or off campus. On campus, at one point or another, every student fulfilled the classroom duty of being a "classroom greeter". Another advancement activity students engaged in while on campus was serving as an ambassador during their 6th, 7th, and/or 8th grade years. Many photos and videos were taken of students on campus during the years of 2005-2018. These photos and videos were taken for the purpose of recording events but also to provide collateral to be used in informational materials aimed to let those interested in De Marillac Academy know about recent school events or to attract potential donors and new members to the community.

Off campus, graduates most recall attending the Annual Scholarship Benefit which was held at the Westin St. Francis hotel in Union Square during the 2005-2018

years this study inquired about. All twelve interviewees have attended the Annual Scholarship Benefit as a choir member or student ambassador during their time at De Marillac Academy. After graduation, select graduates are invited back to the Annual Scholarship Benefit to volunteer as a representative of the Graduate Support Program or as a graduate speaker to share their story during the benefit's dinner program. Four out of the twelve graduates interviewed were selected as graduate speakers and were featured in media produced by the advancement office.

## Finding 1: "I knew what it was about" -- Experiences of DMA students and graduates who participate in school advancement practices

### *Awareness of school advancement's purpose*

DMA graduates were aware that certain parts of their educational experience like giving tours, being featured in media, or attending the Annual Scholarship Benefit (ASB) was for advancement purposes. Whether it was their awareness of their family's own socioeconomic situation or a faculty and staff member telling them, students were aware that advancement activities were done for the purpose of informing and attracting people, connections, and partners to DMA's mission to serve students from low-income backgrounds in the Tenderloin (TL) and surrounding communities with a quality Catholic education.

> Bryan: I think it was money but also like driven people, like a community where people, especially in the TL, where just like, people, I wanna say mainly money that you need to fund the school and everything that happens in the school but also I think like we have so many different types of opportunities that we usually wouldn't get at a school, you know what I'm saying? I remember a lot of uhh, like some techies from Twitter like we would go and he would take us to this place and we were building like robots and stuff like that. I think we had a lot of people that helped support the mission.

Graduates were especially aware as students that the Annual Scholarship Benefit was the school's premiere fundraising event. They were aware that it was an event that gave them an opportunity to thank donors and community partners and that a goal was to acquire more supporters of the school to potentially raise the money that afforded them all the unique opportunities that came with their education at DMA.

> Carmen: I know it was mainly to get donors. I know that ASB I know for a fact that it's pretty much the point to get donors to donate to our school. I knew what it was about. Like everything I ever did I knew was for the purpose of like, of like, just raising money for the school. They would tell us sometimes. And also I just knew we weren't a school that like, like we don't have a lot of money and money doesn't grow on trees and we needed a way to get that money so this was the way. I kinda figured it out.

Some graduates shared that they understood that donors also had something to gain from donating considerably to the school, whether it was social recognition or tax deductions. Students learned this through their own learning or in one graduate's case, from her older sister that also attended DMA.

> Nora: I'd always think, what it would be like to be them. Like why would they donate to us and then I'd ask my siblings, my sister was like you know they do it sometimes, because if you donate to technical charity work you pay less taxes, so I thought this was part of the reason why a lot of the donors donate to DMA but of course like partly because they believe in our mission.

> KT: I think people tend to be like "I donated money so I get to feel good about myself…"

Students and graduates understand it that their presence and interaction with guests was a way to thank those that contributed time, talent, or treasure to their education and made an impact on the success of the advancement strategies.

### *Interaction with School Advancement Staff*

Students and graduates interact with faculty on a daily basis through classroom instruction but interact irregularly with advancement staff even though they are on

campus on a daily and weekly basis. Students and graduates recall interacting with advancement staff in the hallways, when school media was being produced, or as a teacher in student ambassador training. They recall generally positive interactions and gratitude for their work towards supporting and funding their education. Advancement staff that recognized students by name and who learned about the lives of their students in a genuine manner made students feel seen, and positively impacted their educational experience at DMA.

> Dolores: No matter how busy they were, or where they were going up and down the stairs, they would stop every single time and have a short conversation with you, that was always impactful. Like once again having people like you know who care, and are there for you.I would see them so often in the hallways and they would know me by name. I knew them and they were like they're rockstars, they're leaders.

When graduates did not recall advancement staff by name, they still remembered some seeing and interacting with them during school events or while helping to produce advancement media either as a student or graduate.

> Atlas: I feel like we didn't see them as much the only times were like when we saw them in family meetings, like when they announce which faculty are leaving. But we don't see them, they're not acknowledged as much.

> Bryan: But some of them were like, "Oh are you interested in doing it?" (being in photos/video) and I would say "Yeah" and they would take it but I think some of these, they also just, I just remember a lot of times someone being in the, usually Mr. ------, just like, like someone being in the Library or like, um… the courtyard and just like taking pictures.

> Filbert: I remember me and Mari did this project for [advancement staff]. We did a few drawings or whatever, we were talking to [advancement staff] and they were like we'll get you spots for the Annual Scholarship Benefit, cause of course you guys contributed and you get to see your final project or whatever and like, nothing ever came up from that. We were both a little bummed out, oh shucks whatever.

> Carmen: The only person that came to mind for me was Mr.-------, my 6th grade year I was an ambassador, I was the first in that class, he told us everything, mainly about giving tours.

Students and graduates see advancement staff as part of their educational experience. While school advancement staff may not take part in regular curriculum instruction, the ways they showed up in extra-curricular activities or built connections were noticed by students.

> Carmen: Teachers, well this is something teachers we saw them every day we were close with them, but I didn't feel like I didn't know the whole community in terms of faculty like I knew who they were but I didn't exactly know. Like, not Mr.-------, but like him too and all those people that worked in that office next to the art studio (the advancement office) they would always just like do their own thing, like, just work on getting donors for the school and I really understand that and like, they were such nice people and like I really like all of them I just wish they would have been more a part of our lives. Like that's just such a greedy thing I know they were raising money for the school, yes definitely definitely appreciate that, but it would have nice to have connected with them also. Ms. ------ definitely connected with us but it would have still been nice to know her more. They were all really nice, no one was rude, they were all super nice. I just wish they were more a part of it.

Students and graduates interact with school advancement staff as part of their educational experience. The extra effort advancement staff made to connect with students despite not being part of the faculty that interacted with students every day did not go unnoticed or unappreciated by students. Students and graduates recall being coached by advancement staff in addition to their teachers, to interact with guests and seeing advancement staff when recording and producing media.

**Selection, Preparation, and Forms of Participation in School Advancement Activities On-Campus and Off-Campus**

Graduates recalled either being assigned, selected, or volunteered to participate in advancement activities on-campus as a classroom greeter, a student ambassador, or simply a student interacting with guests. Off-campus, graduates recall attending the

Annual Scholarship Benefit as student ambassadors, choir members, or in order to read poetry from the annual eighth grade poetry anthology or as an artist that contributed artwork to the event.

### *On-Campus- Classroom Greeters, Student Ambassadors and School Tours*

As mentioned earlier, all graduates recalled at some point being a classroom greeter. All new fourth grade students within the first few months of their time at DMA learn how to do the job of a classroom greeter.

> Kat: I remember like them teaching how to properly shake hands, and like taking turns being the class greeter.
>
> Irie: That reminds me like when you were little, like every class had two assigned greeters and so like, whenever like, [the President] or anyone else would come around with donors, like the greeters would immediately get up, skedaddle over there and let them know, what the fuck we were doing in class you know what I mean?

A classroom greeter quietly walks up to the guest(s) at the door of their classroom and without interrupting the class, introduces themselves and informs the guest(s) what their class is doing at that present moment. While the classroom duty of being a classroom greeter rotated to cover every student in each class, seven out of the twelve graduates interviewed went on to become student ambassadors.

Student ambassadors are 6th, 7th, and 8th grade students that faculty and staff could call upon to step out of their regular school day routine to give a scheduled or unscheduled tour of the school to visitors. Students enjoyed leaving class to give visitor tours because it broke the monotony of the academic day.

> Carmen: 4th and 5th grade I would watch them come in, think what are they doing here and I came to learn they were visitors or sometimes donors and during middle school I started to give them tours and it felt really good. DMA is basically my second home and I got to show them that and I felt proud being able to do that.

> Filbert: Same thing with the, what's it called, the tours, there were very few moments when I actually wanted to stay in class because something was actually very compelling to me *laughs*. Most of the time I was just like really happy, or not really happy, but like I was happy to be out of the class, like I could get a small break.

Being a student ambassador involved being coached by faculty or advancement staff during an elective class or during a coaching session in which students learned the purpose of tours and were guided with possible speaking points about the school and themselves that they shared with guests.

> Bryan: I just remember being in a class. I just remember like being briefed on it and then from there on out I was like supposed to go and do it whenever I was called upon. Basic things like that, but also talking points like talking about honestly the same thing, about if we were in school, just like how De Marillac is helping us with what we're up to and our goals and our dreams and whatnot.

Graduates recall some visitors to De Marillac Academy returning to the school to volunteer their time and talent with students through enrichment activities that occur after the regular school curriculum. Graduates recall positive experiences sharing their school with visitors, especially with volunteers who regularly and consistently showed up individually or with groups that committed to a long-term partnership with the school.

> Atlas : Yeah Twitter actually comes like a lot to help students, not only because of the tech, but also to collaborate and help the students and volunteer and I feel like, they do that to make their partnership stronger and also get to know DMA more through the students.

> Bryan: They also seemed very like caring and dedicated to the overall goal. I think like one of them I did an art class, I think it was sewing as an elective, and she also was like, I don't know, she did something tech-oriented, I think most of the time they were like very caring and really committed to what the school was trying to advance. Yeah. Also, very, uhh, I guess you can say like uhh… yeah just they seemed really eager to help.

On campus, graduates recall working as classroom greeters and student ambassadors in pairs rather than alone, which brought them comfort while navigating

conversations with new visitors they were meeting for the first time. At school, DMA is a "safe zone", students feel comfortable because they feel ownership over their knowledge of the school. On-campus, they could point to things that helped them explain their experience as a student of DMA and also felt that the teachers were mindful and intuitive of how a student was feeling on any particular day if a student needed an option to not participate in advancement activities on campus.

> Atlas: Giving tours was different, I used to give tours with and I feel like when you give tours it's easier because you're able to just say here's this and here's that and if they have any questions it's about the school itself but as soon as I got older most donors would ask questions about your experience.
>
> Sonia: I think the teachers or the people at DMA were really understanding of how we were feeling so like if we weren't feeling a certain way they would support whatever we chose to do.

While the opportunity to become a student ambassador was open to all students, it was clear among graduates that certain, more extroverted or high-performing students were called on more than others to give school tours. Whether consciously or not, faculty and staff selected certain student ambassadors more often than others to interact with guests. Graduates reported that other classmates noticed this frequency as well and expressed concern that not being selected impacted a student's self-perception.

> Dolores: I would get pulled out a lot and obviously students were like "[Dolores] always gets picked, she's gonna get picked" and it would take, you could tell, like some of them wanted to get picked too to just leave class a little bit, like it's cool to ditch class and like, you know feel like you can walk through those halls without supervision and lead it. If I put myself in their shoes, you know it's like what does that say about them. You know why are… like maybe something is wrong with me, you're not good enough, or you know like, at a young age students are very very like, they internalize everything and almost like, when something doesn't go their way they take it very personally.
>
> Sonia: I was an ambassador so I had to give tours sometimes but it didn't feel that often because they would like, they would mostly call ------ and ----- and I

> kind of sometimes get annoyed because I wanted to do it, but I know sometimes I would get nervous, so I don't know, mixed emotions.
>
> Irie: Like the way they told you they would set you aside, like everyone would go to recess like some stay back and they'd be like "Oh you guys got selected to go to the gala" and like "Oh yay yay yay" and so like it was definitely private and you felt special. I definitely did feel special. Like who made that decision, and like behind closed doors, how did they decide that, how did they decide they wanted to approach you for that. Like how to make the money, because obviously you want to pick the chatty kids that are comfortable with talking to others.
>
> Filbert: Looking back in retrospect, I just probably at the moment, me constantly doing it and at that time in 8th grade, I don't wanna seem like… ohhh I was the best one, but I guess like I kind of took it like that, like I was the key tour guide so almost every week it become 2-3 times a week and it became really repetitive for me.
>
> Saturn: I knew the people who were doing tours, usually like, someone who is going to be the next valedictorian, you could usually figure out who was going to be the greeter or the ambassador.

Although every student had the opportunity to be a class greeter or could choose to become a student ambassador, graduates recall that some students were selected more than others which potentially left students feeling above or below their peers.

### *Off-Campus- The Annual Scholarship Benefit*

Off-campus, all graduates recall attending the Annual Scholarship Benefit as students. If one attended the Annual Scholarship Benefit as a student, they were a student ambassador and/or choir member.

Student ambassadors were already prepared to interact with guests at the Annual Scholarship Benefit due to their previous preparation to interact with visitors on-campus. Since the choir performs during the ASB's dinner program, choir members were also coached to interact with guests weeks prior to the event, in addition to rehearsing their choir performance. Choir members became "student ambassadors" for

the night of the event. Two, more soft-spoken choir members recall these coaching sessions:

> Sonia: They had something before ASB, like practices on how to talk to people and how to shake hands firmly and have like constant eye contact and act confident.
>
> Nora: During those practices we like, talked about different talking subjects [to talk with guests about].

On the day of the ASB, after attending a regular school day, students traveled by bus several blocks to the Westin St. Francis hotel where after rehearsing their choir performance, they welcomed guests, introduced themselves, and informed guests about their experiences at school. The advancement staff bring materials from the school to the hotel to recreate a school environment. With the help of teachers present, students speak to guests and present projects and poster boards that help share and highlight their school experience.

> Bryan: I remember there being like one room where you can go and see everything that we were up to and I think that the combination of like, the choir and seeing what they're up to, and the artwork. I think you could say like transparent. I think like above all of that I just remember them being a time like just seeing how many people go into making DMA what it was and like seeing a lot of people care. But usually like I liked them, I mean there was food *laughs* and whatnot, I liked it.

Off-campus at the Annual Scholarship Benefit, graduates remember feeling a mixture of nerves and excitement about attending the premiere fundraising event for the school and interacting with guests. Students were encouraged to speak to a certain number of guests, to introduce themselves and ask about their guests' connection to the school.

> Atlas: I feel like it changed over the years, when I was little I was more shy but I also had more to say and very expressive when it came to talking to donors but when I got older I did say things, but it was harder for me to say words, maybe

> just doing the same thing over again makes it harder to find something new to say. Even though it's new people, you see the same people, and then you won't realize it.
>
> Filbert: At first me being a little 4th grader, even 5th or 6th grade I was very nervous but eventually I just eased into it and it kind of just flowed too, partially because like, my dad's very talkative and he's very friendly so I kind of inherited those traits from him and so from there I kind of just learned how to talk to people very well. The whole ambassadors training just worked really well so by the time I hit 7th and 8th grade and I was given the role of a roamer. I remember being really excited about that because I wasn't in that room [with the poster boards]. I kind of considered it really boring to like, stay in one place and like giving a description but instead I was just walking around the room and talking to people, I could enjoy the little snacks but like, besides that there was just more flow to it, like I really got the hang of it. It went really well for me like over time. And I knew how to end conversations too when it was coming to an end.
>
> Sonia: [It was] nerve wracking but also really fun because you get to hear things about people that you've never heard of, you learn new things just being around other people.
>
> Bryan: I was nervous. Yeah, I don't like... as much as I like to talk, I don't like talking to a lot of people and when I stand out. I think there's also an element of talking to people who I guess were older than me. Usually I was nervous, I never, yeah, yeah, I was usually just nervous. I'm still nervous. To be honest… I would shy from having to have conversations with the donors *laughs* but when I was at the school I felt more comfortable at school. I was more comfortable. Usually I would like go and get a sample or an appetizer and I would go do that rather than talk to people *laughs* and… but I did my job good. I did actually good sometimes alone, but usually I roamed with someone else.
>
> Irie: I felt uplifted at those events, you know, I really did feel good because these people are coming to learn more about our school, and putting bids on things like our art, um… that's my perspective. They're good people. But then I remember how stressed the teachers and coordinators were [...] I definitely understand that you know, but like, at the end of the day I think it was a good experience.

When guests progress from interacting with students to the dining room, students were fed in a separate room while guests eat dinner. After dinner, students gathered on stage to perform three songs for ASB guests. The choir performance was an especially rewarding part of the night for students and despite interactions with guests sometimes being nerve wracking or having to wait for the choir part of the program to begin,

performing with the choir at the Annual Scholarship Benefit left choir members feeling accomplished.

> Atlas: I gotta be honest, I remember when there like other people speaking you had to be behind the curtain quiet no matter what, like 5 or 10 minutes before I remember it getting so hot because it's really crowded. Waiting back there takes a long time, and sometimes they delay when it's supposed to start [the choir performance] and we're just waiting there. We performed at our best because we were finally cooled down. There was always a joy performing, it's just freeing.

> Nora: I enjoyed every ASB even though sometimes they might be like "we didn't have great songs" or "we didn't perform as well as last year", I think every experience every year was fun.

> Irie: I remember everyone looked forward to that, like all of my peers, like everyone around me like they were just so excited because we practiced for so long, we practiced extensively and then finally getting up there and doing it and finally going to the back and feeling juiced like we did it! Like there was definitely a feeling of accomplishment there.

After the choir performance, students were escorted out of the hotel to be picked up or stayed throughout the dessert reception that followed the "fund-a-need" auction and speeches by major donors and advancement officers that occurred after the choir performance if their families were guests at the ASB. Following the departure of the majority of the students, the President and other donors speak and "fund-a-need" auction orchestrates an open call among donors to give money to fund a DMA education for students or some component of it.

Furthermore, the ASB provided another opportunity for students to feel like they were participating in something other than the curriculum. Graduates recall that most students wanted to attend the ASB as a student, it was an opportunity to step into another world.

> Carmen: Umm, honestly, hmm, well this isn't like trashing DMA, I feel like they never really gave us much to do outside of school, like maybe unless you were in a sport, but at the same time sports aren't for everyone. We just did it because we

> were bored. So, DMA didn't give us too much to do, and then like the ASB was just such a big thing, not everyone but most everyone wanted to go and just go be part of the school.
>
> Saturn: I think there's this... when you come from your daily life being like through, homeless people on the street, people doing drugs... going to something like the ASB is the most like extravagant, beautiful thing you fucking probably witnessed. It appeals to you as a student.

When students graduate from De Marillac Academy and enter high school and college, they may still attend the Annual Scholarship Benefit as representatives of the school's Graduate Support Program (GSP) or as a featured graduate speaker.

### *Graduate Experience of the Annual Scholarship Benefit*

After DMA students graduate, the advancement office and Graduate Support Staff call on select graduates to attend as a volunteer that represents the Graduate Support Program, a featured graduate speaker or artist, or attend as a faculty and staff member of DMA.

As a GSP representative, the experience with guest interaction is much like being a student ambassador, but graduates report a more relaxed expectation of who they speak to and what they say, offering them an opportunity to interact with guests in a more relaxed manner. Graduates speak to guests about their experience at DMA, and how the GSP continues to offer them support throughout their high school career and into college with counseling, workshops, and volunteer opportunities. Graduates dine with guests either on donor or sponsoring organization tables or a graduate table near the back of the ballroom.

> Atlas: I think it was mainly different because we weren't a part of the choir performance, instead we were watching it and we were sitting like, in the actual tables where people are serving. It was different for me, because the experience was totally different. Instead of doing the ASB as an actual student, we were a graduate. We were offered different things like we sat in different tables, they

> weren't so strict about how many guests you meet [...] instead it was mainly your choice and we didn't have to do prompts, it was more like a free speech and you were able to say whatever about the GSP and the purpose of it.

All graduates interviewed expressed that if they were invited, they would attend the ASB again. Two graduates interviewed expressed that if you were invited back as a graduate, you were perceived by the school as "successful".

> Saturn: So, when I was a graduate I definitely got asked twice. The first time was because I had gotten a 3.8 GPA and so they asked me to go to ASB and it's known...in our culture if you're asked to go to ASB it's because you're doing something right. The second year I got asked was the only year I was told like just enjoy this event. You know for me I was always happy to do this because I thought of the teachers that helped me when I was in that school, but then it's like now having the social justice background you come to see how it's all part of a system.

> Esmeralda: Yeah I feel like the folks that do get picked are successful in some sort of way and then somehow they wanna make sure that you know it's because De Marillac, it's because of them.

> Dolores: *laughs* It was nice, it felt like for the first time we were kind of accepted into this club if you may, if that's what you'd call it. It was still the same thing, I had to be on my best behavior. I had to smile, I had to meet people.

Four of the twelve graduates interviewed were asked to be a featured graduate speaker who delivered a speech in front of guests during the evening's dinner program. The original speeches were written by graduates but were subject to editing by advancement staff. Among all graduate speakers interviewed, there exists a frustration between their desire to express their stories in their own words and the version that is delivered to the audience the night of the ASB.

> Dolores: When I first submitted my essay to staff...I don't even know WHOSE voice it was after like it wasn't my voice and what I wanted to say. This was right around the Trump election in 2016, and so I wanted to really just bring awareness to immigrants and AB540 students, because I'm... that's me. I wanted to use the platform and it was suggested that I didn't use that because I didn't know how the audience was gonna receive it. If anyone in our, anyone who claims that they're a supporter at DMA should know what kind of, like know what our students are...,

> or have the awareness and do the work to know who we're serving really. Why would anyone be uncomfortable with that if they're supporting us?
>
> Esmeralda: It needed to sound a certain way. The things I wanted to highlight was that this was not easy. There was a lot of pain, a lot of suffering, a lot of changes, and I wanted to emphasize that piece, right? Like you guys keep hearing the success, and we're indebted to De Marillac, but like there's a lot of pain and suffering that follows us throughout this journey on multiple levels. I wanted to talk to the audience. We are hit with one thing after another after another after another and it's exhausting so that was like watered down. The other piece that I wanted to highlight that I remember was like all that I am is because of all that I already have. Like all of my resiliency, my work ethic, all of that is within me and has always been within me... no one "pulled it out" of me, De Marillac did not pull it out of me, you know. And that got changed, again, to, emphasize like, what my teachers did for me, what the school in general did for me.

Off-campus, students and graduates welcome and share their experiences with guests most notably at the Annual Scholarship Benefit held at the Westin St. Francis. Students feel a mixture of nervousness and excitement when participating in this event. They enjoy the food and feel a sense of accomplishment and satisfaction when performing with the school choir. Students work in pairs and are encouraged to speak to a certain number of guests. All students present at the ASB have participated in coaching sessions carried out by DMA faculty and advancement staff in preparation for these interactions. As representatives of DMA's graduate support program, graduates that attend the ASB volunteer to attend or are asked to participate by the GSP or advancement staff. Graduates experience a more relaxed expectation of how many people they must speak with and sit at tables in the dining room where they enjoy the dinner program other guests do. While graduates who attend or are asked to speak sense that they are perceived as "successful" in the eyes of DMA, the message they want to convey to the guests at the ASB is edited before it is delivered the night of the ASB.

### *School Media Production for Students and Graduates*

In regard to producing media for advancement purposes, graduates recall that students who were selected to participate were usually already student ambassadors or other students that volunteered to participate.

> Filbert: I remember they also asked if you wanted to be in front of the camera or not for some videos. I remember them asking students like "Oh do you want to participate or not?"

> Sonia: I was never in photos or videos because I didn't want to be in that stuff.

Students who were featured in media production were asked to respond to questions, recite lines or conduct themselves like "normal" for video production or were photographed for collateral to be used for print or digital advancement materials. Camera crews arrived on campus for short periods of time to capture scenes that were later produced into high-quality, emotive, "commercial-like" videos that were shared online with the greater community and public. Graduates felt that they were represented well through the media produced by the school and understood that the practice of producing media that featured students was necessary to spread the word about DMA's mission and gain funds for their education.

> Filbert: They represented the school well, they represented the students well, that's just like a must, a given, they have to do that. And I'm not complaining about that, that's completely fine. It's almost like, say a business, and in the long run if they represent me in a way that I almost like, don't like, like say for some students if they don't like the way they asked us to perform or whatever, like it still benefits them, like you know, because the money comes in for the school and the school is able to advocate for the students and give them the opportunities that they have.

> Bryan: I think it's very motivating, like when I look at that picture (of himself), like the picture in general, it's like a reminder that like, we can do it you know.

Graduates noted that if they were asked to be photographed or recorded for media production, they immediately agreed to whatever was being asked of them as they understood that this media helped the advancement team raise money for the school. Some graduates saw their participation in media production as a way to contribute back to the school that gives them unique educational opportunities.

> Filbert: I had a fairly good experience with almost all of them. I guess just, I remember they really pushed everyone, like those little notecards... like, they pushed everyone, that wasn't really like a choice if you wanted to or not. I remember that one being a little strange for some students, because they weren't used to like, being in front of the camera or whatever. It was just like "Oh, tell us your dream" and you'd have to come up with sentences and it'd be on the back of your little notecard, like it was like trading cards, like each individual had their own card. I remember they also asked if you wanted to be in front of the camera or not for some videos. I remember them asking students like "Oh do you want to participate or not?" So um, I don't remember that being a problem like, kids feeling insecure or whatever. I mean I guess there were like a few times that I knew about students that were like, too afraid to say no, I guess, or they were just too shy to say no, but they just went with it, but I guess like even those students look at it now, they don't care about it. It was like okay yeah, that happened. I guess for me it just always made sense, it was always like this school needs to make money some way somehow so the students have to like give back, because my parents taught me the whole like, giving back too, and the same thing like "Enter to Learn, Leave to Serve" so it kind of gets played together for me. I guess the intense videos, I would never be bothered by it and at the same time I think they always like, balanced out the students who were in the video, so it wasn't like one kid.

While Filbert thought that the selection of students featured in photographs and video varied, not featuring a few students more than others, other graduates pointed out that they noticed certain students were featured more and speculated that it was because of their "cuteness" factor or their race. Despite the fact that most students at DMA are Hispanic or Latino and Asian, a few graduates pointed out that the representation of African American students felt inflated. An African American interviewee recalls being asked to participate rather often:

> Bryan: I'd say very often. *laughs* I remember one time Mr.[teacher]...there was a picture of me and he was like "Oh Bryan you know you're in all these pictures cause you're black" and I was like "Whoa", I mean he was saying it to be funny *laughs* no, no generally I feel like, nah, like, very often. I think that it was like, yeah, pretty often.

> Dolores: think it's um, funny that, I see ------- and --------, who are two of the very few African American students that De Marillac Academy has had and I question like why does it feel like, like we say we're a diverse school why do we always have a token African American student. Put yourself in their shoes, what do they feel like?

Graduates reported that if students felt uncomfortable or hesitant to participate in school media produced by advancement staff and activities, they would go along with it anyway because it served a bigger purpose toward raising funds for their education.

> Saturn: I would always say yes, and now I think about it, it didn't even cross my mind to say no. It felt like a scary thing to do. It was all this… I have to be grateful for what I have… you know I had nothing and now I'm on my way to college…

> Esmeralda: When I did that video, I didn't want to do it, but I did.

> Carmen: I was uncomfortable, but I knew it was for a good cause, so I'd just deal with it. I wouldn't be mad about it or anything just like this is going to happen, it's going to happen. I never thought it was a question of whether or not I was going to do it. I was just always going to do it.

Some of the graduates emphasized that being given the choice to participate and option to opt out of being on camera or in photos and videos should always be given even though parents and guardians had signed parental consent and media waiver allowing for photos and videos to be taken of their child, as well as other advancement activities in general.

> Bryan: I would say usually like in the beginning of the school year my mom must have signed something, so yeah.

> Atlas: I mean I feel like if you select someone and they might not want to do it, it might feel like they might feel invaded and not comfortable being in the video.

> Filbert: I think just like, always have the choice for students like have there be some kind of sign-up.
>
> Saturn: I think I signed up for choir, but I didn't know I signed up for having to meet everyone.

The videos continue to draw the interest of graduates today. Many recalled watching them as students to see the final product of their participation; today the videos and photos act as mementos of their time at De Marillac Academy.

> Filbert: Yeah I've seen a lot of them I'm actually kind of happy that like DMA has made those, and that they're up somewhere online, it's almost like a time capsule or like a little relic like me and other DMA grads can go back on and see like oh! holy crap that's us at that age. All the ASB choir shows, I forgot that Colby had a recital, like he sang in front of the mic in front of everyone and me and Katie totally forgot about that and like going through DMA's YouTube, we were going through like history that we basically almost forgot about, so I'm really happy that those videos exist. And like, for some students the process [of production] was a bit tiring, but even they filmed you for like 15-30 minutes, and like, that was it, they never really called you back in so like the film crew was very good at like, not tiring out the students of course.
>
> Irie: [Watching the videos] made me go back and remember DMA, I remember failing quizzes, acing tests, going up and down, and then finally for it to end like when you graduate. I remember feeling a sense of liberation like wow I really did it.

Aside from representing the students well in media used for informational and advancement purposes, many graduates interviewed remarked on the representation of the Tenderloin, as many of the videos and photos produced between 2005-2018 include clips of the DMA campus and students in the middle of the Tenderloin neighborhood. Graduates voiced concern about how the Tenderloin was represented as a drug-ridden place but that in many ways the Tenderloin is a beautiful community and wished that it had been represented more so in that way. While graduates are honest about the fact that the Tenderloin is a harsh neighborhood to grow up in, it makes some of them question the way people see them as a part of their neighborhood.

> Kat: Like they were like “hold your breath” (in response to the smell of drugs and feces), I don’t think it's untrue, but it's (The Tenderloin) shown like it’s all bad all the time. Back then, I remember when I would be walking to school or walking home like in our uniforms like a lot of homeless people would ask what school we went to, or there would be like Indian Joe, was always greeting the students and the school welcomed him. I still like dreaded walking through the Tenderloin, but it wasn’t like um, I haven’t had any crazy experiences. Even now-- there are some streets that we don’t like to walk through all by ourselves so it’s like the video is true...very much of being aware of living and like coping in the Tenderloin. But, yeah. It could also include the good parts, not just DMA.

> Saturn: It’s the same rhetoric that everyone uses with the Tenderloin like it's just this scary and poor place. And it’s like we have to help these kids so they don’t become part of the scary or the poor. But I mean, for me personally, I’ve grown up walking those streets every day, you know and like, something good is that when I was younger, I learned about like why people become homeless, it’s like, it gives you a different perspective. And everyone in the Tenderloin is really just doing their own thing, doing the best they fucking can, no one bothers me, no one’s trying to fight me, and if so then I can recognize that you know, what mental state they’re at, it’s just where I come from and I can make sense of it, I can navigate it, it’s not like a place where I feel like I’m going to get shot at in any moment, or I’m gonna get stabbed. But that’s what it feels like for everyone else so it almost makes me feel like fuck like where do I come from? That was a big question I had in my college and like do I tell people I’m from the Tenderloin? Do I share that information? Um…

Graduates that grew up and have family in the neighborhood feel connected to the Tenderloin, but express that the circumstances of inequity that force their families and others to live in the Tenderloin should not go ignored. The imagery put out by their school media, that the Tenderloin is an unfortunate place to live, opposes what they were told in school about how fortunate they were to grow up in the Tenderloin.

> Esmeralda: I appreciate that part of the way we describe the Tenderloin is that like there’s a lot of families and students that live here and let’s not forget that, that’s at its core, that’s what makes De Marillac and the Tenderloin the Tenderloin. That helps because when people on the outside walk through, they just see what’s exactly in front of them versus what's actually at the core, so that I think we do very well because that is the reality of our kids lives. I know they have to go through these really harsh, cruel situations that people live in and that has an impact on us and it really does, it makes just question all of it. Then there's this huge shock that follows when you leave the TL, you’re like... you don’t have to maneuver through shit? You don’t have to see folks shooting up? I would have

> loved to grow up in a neighborhood like yours! Like, how great that would have been for my upbringing.
>
> Carmen: They put it out there to us like "Look at you you get to be part of this community" I'm like I don't think we want to be a part of it, of the Tenderloin. I mean the Tenderloin will always be in my heart. But it's like, I don't want to say we're lucky that we get to be in the Tenderloin or that you know it was such a blessing because like because like it'd be better if we didn't have a place like the Tenderloin because like people would have homes, people would have jobs, everything like that. People on the streets wouldn't be doing what they're doing.

Furthermore, a few graduates remarked on the media produced that focused only on the Tenderloin, when in fact DMA serves other communities as well such as the South of Market (SoMa) and Mission neighborhoods. While graduates understand that school media produced for informational and advancement purposes are trying to convey the reality of school population and reality of the situations students face every day to a greater audience, but comment that a truer depiction of the neighborhood and the constituents that live there be represented in a positive way more reflective of the diversity of the students and the spirit of the neighborhood.

Graduates selected to participate in media production post-graduation were asked by graduate support staff or an advancement staff member to appear in photos and/or videos and were often also asked to attend the Annual Scholarship Benefit as a guest or graduate speaker.

On-campus students interact with visitors as a school ambassador or classroom greeter. School ambassadors and classroom greeters are coached through how to give tours and speak with those who visit the school. Students in these roles and others interact with guests through enrichment opportunities and tutoring sessions with volunteers. Students enjoy being pulled from class to give school tours, they are comfortable working in pairs.

Students and graduates also participate in producing media for school advancement collateral to be used for informational and fundraising purposes. All DMA students and graduates are aware of what these advancement practices aim to achieve, which is to inform those in and out of the DMA community about the mission of the school and to attract and sustain those who contribute to the school financially and through other community partnerships.

**Finding 2: "It's bittersweet and it's complex" -- DMA students and graduates code-switch and adapt their dispositions verbally and through physical mannerisms**

Cultural code-switching is described as the non-cognitive ability to change one's disposition and speech based on what is valued by the environment one is in at the time (Morton, 2014). DMA graduates interviewed in this study recognized ways they used to and continue to code-switch when participating as students and graduates in school advancement activities. DMA graduates code-switched between home and school environments and recognized that they shifted their dispositions further when participating in on and off-campus advancement activities, including media production.

While interacting with donors face-to-face, graduates recalled what they learned through the coaching sessions that occurred before fulfilling a role as a class greeter, student ambassador, or student attendant of the ASB. They adapted their ways of speaking, physical mannerisms, and general dispositions based on the environment, people, and activities they were engaged in.

When speaking with guests on or off campus, graduates recall having to approach and welcome them, introducing themselves, and speaking in a more professional and formal tone. Two graduates recall her and her friends being mindful of tone and choice

of words and another recalls consciously being mindful of how to make her words appeal to a donor audience.

> Irie: I remember like, talking with my friends, talking the way I do, and then having to go out there, and like you know, lose that, give them a firm handshake, look them in the eye, try to make a connection, and like I want to convey and let them know that I'm so thankful that they've given me this education.
>
> Kat: I think like at school and at friends. My friend group was really loud so when we were with donors you couldn't be like super loud and yelling at them and stuff *laughs*.

Physically, all graduates recalled the ingrained instruction of giving a "firm handshake", eye contact, and good posture when interacting with a guest. At the Annual Scholarship Benefit, they are required to wear their "mass attire" which is a more formal version of their regular school uniform.

> Saturn: You can't say bruh, that's not allowed. You have to shake hands firmly, look in the eye. It's also about how you dress, [...] being very mindful of the space you make with your body and how you approach people.
>
> Kat: I wouldn't talk like, use slang or how I am with my friends, but it was more professional. I think the eye contact thing is still like, instilled in me, good eye contact with people that you're speaking to.
>
> Filbert: I remember them teaching us different kinds of handshakes, and THE handshake you want to have, so like they told us this is the ghost handshake, or like the crab, you know, they taught us how to make a good, firm handshake, and like eye contact was key.

Furthermore, graduates most recall shifting their disposition to a more well-behaved and polite version of themselves. These traits were already part of their personality, but were more pronounced in advancement settings, they were more conscious of their effort to bring that forth when interacting with guests or in front of a camera. Graduates recognized that they weren't only representing themselves but were also a representative of the school.

> Bryan: Yeah, I think that were was like an element of...we want these people to come back and like, be a part of this school so like you had to kinda be like… I don't wanna say… I guess just more formal and just more enthusiastic. Things like that.
>
> Sonia: I think I acted a little more social than I was at the time, and you had to be polite to people cuz if you were rude, they would feel a certain way about that. We had to act polite or social even if you were really really shy.
>
> Atlas: I feel when there's a camera we act like a certain way, like maybe more like proper than we're used to because usually we wouldn't practice this so like we had to act a little different in front of the camera, the purpose of it was to show like, oh we practice this, this is how we do it. *laughs* I feel like sometimes we would be really off-task, but at that moment most of us were pretty focused but sometimes if you got caught off guard by a camera, whenever it's around, just act. Just act like on-task, and settled. Yeah everyone is more alert or fix themselves.
>
> Filbert: Well, clearly of course, I have to be more presentable, that's just a given for anyone when they want to like, be professional in front of the camera. You want to be viewed in a good manner, or like me, in private you know, I'm still the same person I'm a little bit more loosy-goosy, just when I'm in front of the camera I want to like, represent myself well and like in the best way possible like they tell you like "shake the hand!" and like what things to say like how to talk with them.
>
> Nora: Our behavior reflected not just ourselves but our school. They'd remind us that you know you're representing DMA, you have to act polite and have basic manners. I feel like it was kind of a given because these people actually like, support our education, so we kind of had to. But also, basic common decency, you have to be nice to people.

Two graduates recognized that some guests code-switched in these school advancement environments while interacting with students as well. Guests adjusted their language and disposition in their attempt to connect with DMA students. These graduates recognized that they were representing themselves, but also other groups they were associated with. When guests are polite and genuine, it helped to make the experience more enjoyable for students, put them at ease, and made for a positive experience.

> Filbert: A lot of them were really nice. Um some of them acted a bit weird knowing that they were talking to like kids. It was clear that they were code-switching with me, as they're talking to like, a little kid. And like it didn't bother me, I just found it funny half the time. But some of them just acted normal, and that helped me even more, like when people talk me down or talk to me as if I were a kid, it kind of gave me the feeling like they're like, they're babying me, they're talking down… I don't know, I don't know how to explain it. I hope you know what I mean. Like they have to change for me, but the people who talk normally...it helped me ease into it even more.
>
> Sonia: They were themselves, but I feel like they kind of had pressure on themselves because they had to act a certain way. They kind of had to act like us, like polite? They couldn't be rude, because like, do the donors represent something or are they just people? Like maybe the business [they work for], a lot of times they just wanted respect on both sides, so they had to act a certain way.
>
> Carmen: I always thought the donors were really nice, I can't really remember a mean donor or anything like that, they were all super nice and like always had a smile on their face. That's kind of why I liked doing what I did and helping out the school because like they were so nice, and I really liked them. I don't know how to explain it, but I liked the vibe they gave off.

Many graduates recognize when and how they continue to code-switch and adapt their disposition and mannerisms in their lives today. They view code-switching as a skill that helps them navigate formal and informal realms and affords them access to opportunities and strengthens social connections. DMA expanded on pre-existing values and manners of etiquette students already possessed.

> Atlas: I think like DMA, I actually improved my [etiquette] and manners because we say thank you and please I feel like through DMA is was more improved because like we practiced prayer and the SLE's and the SLE of gratitude so then through that it made me better in like my virtues and stuff. Even though it was practiced at home, I was able to better myself in those areas.
>
> Filbert: These kinds of skills helped me later on in life even though it's not like, I guess like, um, formal. Like I guess I'm pretty good with eye contact now thanks to them, like I don't like look away or whatever too often.
>
> KT: Yeah um… it's a complicated feeling and it's complex because looking back at it now, it helped prepare me to be able to work with people really well, it prepared me to get into the professional field, it prepared me to be more proper.

> But my background is you know, the Tenderloin, like where we speak a certain way you know.

This graduate is cognizant of the how code-switching benefits him in the professional realm even though it may cause him to experience feelings of having to diminish other parts of his background. For graduates ages nineteen or older, code-switching is described as a double-edged sword. On one hand they are grateful to DMA for expanding on the skill of adapting their dispositions and mannerisms in different situations. On the other hand, because code-switching is a tool for upward mobility for those from disadvantaged backgrounds, the need for students and graduates to code-switch in advancement settings while those from more privileged backgrounds do not reflect a frustration older graduates have with "the system". There is a frustration with balancing the need for acquiring resources to afford them all the opportunities that come with a DMA education and needing to do so by coaching students from low socioeconomic backgrounds to act a certain way with certain people in order to make sure these resources are acquired when access to education seems to be a right for some and not for others.

> KT: It's complex because it's almost like, and a lot of graduates feel this way too, I've spoken to a couple… for me personally, it's almost like the way that you speak is not okay… there's something… like a stigma attached to the way that we present ourselves, we have to change for these people, right? Um, and it's bittersweet and it's complex because we live in a world where people really do listen to the way they speak, and it is important to code-switch, and when we are benefitting from the sources and the...what's it called, the money, and the resources that are coming in, that's why it's bittersweet, it's complex. We can't just have it all, we have to be able to adapt in order to tap into those resources.

> Esmeralda: It's almost as if we're already expecting our kids to have to live between these two worlds because that's just how it is. I mean I experienced it throughout high school and college, that I could never be my authentic self because if I spoke the way I spoke to my family and my friends then I wouldn't be taken seriously or that I wouldn't get my message across or that no one would

> listen. Even like in the work setting sometimes, how I talk to some folks is different then when I talk to the CEO. You're not asking white folks to have to code switch. And I get that there's a way to communicate professionally but, it's already assuming that our kids don't already know how to do that so we have coach them, we have to groom them, because they are different, we are different in the way that we talk, and the way that we engage with each other. So that's a real thing, it's a constant way in which we groom our kids. That part is interesting. All of that leads up to THIS, what it is that we want them to say or want them to highlight right? To convey a specific message for a specific audience. Like what is it that they want to hear versus what we want to say, what we want to convey right? It feels almost like we're censoring; you can only say these things, you cannot say this stuff because then it's going to shatter whatever this image is that we want to convey to everyone outside of here.

One graduate was adamant to point out that code-switching is not only to be seen as a negative practice, there is an acknowledgement that there is a balance necessary between being genuine and being "fake" which Morton alludes to, that "code-switching is a careful and delicate balancing act that can easily turn into assimilation, pretense or compartmentalization" (p. 275). Another graduate pointed to the ability to code-switch as a positive skill that would allow her to assimilate with people she regarded as the majority when growing up.

> Filbert: I feel like there's like a negative connotation underlining it, like you're presenting yourself a different way, so you can hide the real you or like, umm something along those lines, but I guess that's like not the case. Like code-switching shouldn't be a bad thing. I guess that's the way other people have perceived it, compared to me, like oh you're being fake or just showing a part of you and the real you is like, someone like, who's like super disorganized and not the way you want to be presented but I feel like code-switching is a good thing, like I don't know. It isn't something...like there's a huge difference between someone being fake and not their actual genuine person and then there's like code-switching like two different sides of the spectrum. I mean, it's still me, but I think like, certain aspects of me just shine a little more. Very few times, where I actually feel like I'm not code-switching at all I'm just being myself. But even then, you just have to find the special people for that or whatever
>
> Irie: I mean remember as a kid it didn't feel weird to me, I remember thinking like "Oh this is so dope, I'm gonna know how to like, speak to people older than me, I'm gonna learn how to like put my shoulders back and look someone in the

> eye and I just thought it was cool, to like… assimilate. I don't know, I kind of put white people on a pedestal when I was little I remember.

As graduates grow older, their past practice of code-switching in advancement settings grows complicated and problematic for them. Older graduates interviewed ages 19-24 express a desire that code-switching, and the reason for it, be taught explicitly to students at DMA so that students can grow in self-knowledge and empowerment, that their dispositions outside of school and advancement settings are seen as of equal value to the ones honed and required of school and professional settings, rather than just as a way to perform or appeal to those with the power and means to provide them their education.

> Saturn: It's just so much a part of the culture, it was like everyone learned and you know we had these jobs called greeters, you were taught how to shake someone's hand, how to practice, how to shake someone's hand firmly, how to look someone in the eye, and at the time it's like yes, this is respect but also… it looks different for other cultures. Like the way I say hi is a hug, and you know that doesn't fit in this box of properness? [...] I remember learning how to rearrange my words to make sure my story was something that would impact people, or something that would be worth putting on a billboard or giving a speech about.

Code-switching is seen as a beneficial skill that was valued and practiced during their time at DMA as students. Students and graduates adapt their ways of speaking, physical mannerisms, and dispositions when in advancement settings. Some graduates recognized that code-switching is practiced by everyone, including those who were older than them. As graduates grow older and reflect on their code-switching practices in advancement settings, it becomes complicated. All but one of the older graduates in the age group of 19-28 interviewed in this study grew frustrated with the need to adapt their behavior and words in order to attract donors and partnerships and see it as a flaw of a larger system in our society that the school doesn't ameliorate.

**Finding 3: "They get to choose when to see us and when not to see us" -- Graduates' participation in school advancement practices relate to their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege**

In their responses, all graduates revealed an understanding of how intersecting factors of race, class, power, and privilege showed up in advancement practices. 1) All graduates articulated that they remember guests and people in positions of power within the school, particularly donors, were generally white, of a class more privileged than their own, and possessed the power to influence and fund their education. 2) Graduates, particularly those between the ages 19-26, expressed frustration with how advancement narratives of students and graduates reinforce stigmas of inferiority, 3) how "successful" students of color were assimilated students of color that exhibited dispositions valued by the dominant white class, and 4) graduates advocated that school advancement practices and strategies be improved for current DMA students.

All graduates commented on the race of the majority of guests and donors they interacted with while participating through advancement practices. As has been revealed in previous parts of this chapter, graduates often recognized the juxtaposition of a white, privileged majority among students of color from disadvantaged backgrounds in advancement settings and their reliance on the success of advancement events and activities. Students, especially after graduation from DMA and into college, articulated the discomfort of being a person of color in a predominantly white advancement environment, and how the power and race of guests and donors with power and privilege reflected larger issues of representation in society. That is not to say that students and graduates are not thankful for the gifts of time, talent, and treasure that donors and guests

give to their education, but that they noticed that those with wealth and power over their access to a quality Catholic education laid in the hands of predominantly white people.

> Irie: I remember like how weird it felt, like to be up in front of the donors and it's like, you reveal the curtain and it's like boom! You got black and brown kids about to sing you a song and then like us looking out into the audience, like all I see is white people. Like how could you not open your pocketbook up and be like "I'm about to give these kids money!" ...in our mass uniform.
>
> Dolores: They were old and white and very impressed for whatever reason. They were all the same, they all kind of merged together because they all blended together. I just didn't, like not once did I see a person of color that was a donor, like that would have been cool. As a graduate going to ASB and as a student, you're very…you don't see different perspectives... or like it wasn't until I went to high school and came back to ASB I was a little uncomfortable by it... I just felt like the spotlight was on me constantly, it was uncomfortable attention. Like I'm a token, it was so weird. I don't know if I was a teen that it started to bug me, it's hard to explain.
>
> Bryan: I just feel bad cuz I think that it was a weird time like to be... I don't know. One thing I was gonna say is that it is true that the majority of the people donors are white, and like, the kids are all of color and it was just weird being in an environment like as I got older, that is primarily white? In the sense that like I want to see, I mean there was only a few black kids, so it's okay if there's only a few on the faculty that are like, you know that are black, but I just felt like, in general seeing people of color in positions of power I think that it's like, it's not even, it's not so much of like, motivating as it is I feel like it should be the norm, it should be representative of this school, this country. But in regards to like, the events, I don't remember too much about them just that they were like, I don't want to say like, I think that there's stuff that was powerful to me, that there were so many people that would go and were literally with like a million dollars and be up on stage and whatnot, there were so many people that cared. It's actually like, I know I am and I was... I mean we're poor and of color and just to see that so many people do like, do care, like yeah.

All graduates articulated that they understood guests, particularly donors, were generally white, of a class more privileged than their own, and possessed the power to influence and fund their education. With this ability to fund their education also comes the ability to step in and out of hearing the struggles of DMA students and graduates. Donors and guests have the privilege of walking into advancement events,

experiencing emotions of empathy, inspiration, or sympathy upon interacting and hearing about the lives of DMA students, but turning these emotions positive once they are able to relieve some of the negative emotions with money.

> Esmeralda: A big part of my issue with ASB is that they (guests) come, they do their thing, but like there really is like, no connection between them and the students or the graduates that go up there. You hear a snippet of what it is like, you know, what their (student/graduate's) life has been like and then you know, that's it. You get to go home, and you live very comfortably. It still feels like I, like we're invisible to them, they get to choose when to see us and when not to see us and so I sat next to the donor and thought maybe for whatever reason, if they're really like, in tune and in want to be connected they might have remembered, but it's a fascinating thing to feel like, very much invisible in that space. Even though we're showcasing to folks but, nothing of it feels, it just doesn't feel genuine.

> Saturn: Our story is like our golden ticket... our story is the golden ticket for DMA, for college, selling how little have…

Graduates, particularly those between the ages 19-26, expressed frustration with how advancement narratives of students and graduates reinforce stigmas of inferiority by focusing on their "sob stories" and owing their current success all to DMA rather than their own individual hard work and the support of their families. Again, graduates feel immense gratitude for the opportunities that DMA connected them with and the skills and education they received and practiced as a DMA student and graduate, but the focus on the adversity in their lives as the common story of struggle can end up feeling diminishing to the individual and the effort and determination they pour into their own education despite the adversity in their lives.

> KT: And I feel like, a lot of times we almost felt like... I don't want to say... like animals in a zoo, but we were like, like our story was put on a pedestal but the individual is kind of like, pushed aside right? Like people love the story of the come-up, especially, you know, it's the American dream, right? But they push the individual aside and push the story up. Attach the individual to the story, which is not… that's how it felt, maybe I'm wrong, um. I think for me now as an adult I try to focus on *my* story, not my sob story as we like to call it right, like it's easily

> turned into my sob story, my struggle. Yeah that was a part of me, but look at all the shit I did, look at all the shit I did after the fact. There's a whole 'nother substance to that, a whole 'nother way to it. One thing that I was like, "Huh?" was when you know one of the [donor] speakers was up there and they described us as like, the "helpless" or like "you are the reason why they are here!" and it's like yeah but let's be realistic like, like they [donors & guests] weren't the ones feeding me at the house, and they weren't the ones picking me up… you know there's a lot of people helping, like, we aren't helpless, like we, just the way that we are described it's just like, we have to be saved. And I mean, there is nothing to be saved, it's like a collaboration right...and like there's a whole story of graduates and the kids and like… we're told like, like we're very needy, which is something I do not agree with. I think that De Marillac and the donors do a great job opening eyes and maybe even opportunities for students but the reason why that even works is because the students are willing to try these things out because if they weren't willing to try those things out you know… your money would go south.
>
> Dolores: I just don't like how often we use the word "poor" like, I feel like it's problematic. I understand that we come from really really low income backgrounds but at the same time hearing the word over and over and over… it can create like these walls where you think that once there's a label placed on you that label comes with limits or boundaries per say. I understand that we come from an underserved community and we are of minority background with its own challenges but just labelling someone as poor almost like, I don't know, labels are like, they can stick with you for longer than you think.

Older graduates describe here that despite the care they know the school and advancement teams have for them, the many of the narratives and descriptors used to describe them like "poor", "at-risk", "at-promise", label them as less than to begin with in comparison with the guests and donors that attend advancement activities. While such descriptors are meant to convey to guests that students come from backgrounds that are less advantaged, it often ignores or takes away from their stories of success regardless of where they come from. There is a constant fixation on the "sob story" of success, rather than success itself.

> Esmeralda: The other piece that I wanted to highlight that I remember was like all that I am is because of all that I already have. Like all of my resiliency, my work ethic, all of that is within me and has always been within me, no one pulled it out

> of me, De Marillac did not pull it out of me, you know. And that got changed, again, to, emphasize like, what [DMA staff] did for me, what my teachers did for me, what the school in general did for me,--- they wanted me to like really zone in on what [DMA staff] had done for me in that moment versus like why it was important for me to make that change for me myself, outside of whether or not she came in or not to say what she had to say. But I don't know, maybe I sounded very angry in my speech, maybe I sounded very sort of like this isn't because of DMA. Following that, [I was] feeling like I had allowed folks to censor me and change how I really felt about speaking to an audience that probably has never experienced close to what I had so, that is why I've always been hesitant to participate in anything that's being asked of me. There's also this piece of like, guilt. Like well De Marillac has opened up these doors so I am indebted to DMA or like, I've always been sort of torn like when to say yes when to not say yes.
>
> Saturn: We're not all sad, you know what I mean? And I don't know what the solution is I guess, but how do you empower your students to just to be themselves, while also getting genuine people who want to donate, because they see that the school is righteous, like not having to highlight or ask what's sad about your life and what do you need help with, just like… genuine.

In addition to working hard and exhibiting perseverance toward the success of their own education, graduates ages 19-24 especially noted how different it was for DMA students to have to "reach" for common definitions of success whereas for other, more privileged populations these same definitions of success are a given, which is a frustration tied to the bigger system of inequity in society.

> Esmeralda: I think one [a photo] that I saw earlier, was ------ who said "My dream is to graduate from college, it's a small dream, but will have gigantic effects" Um… It just felt like, she was minimizing that, like this is, this is going to be an outstanding accomplishment and what one of the things that I've talking a lot with folks is that, especially after this last ASB is that it is our right to have access to school, it's not like she should not be this thing we reach for, like, we are, if you were to talk to someone else who has access and has resources and has wealth, it's sort of a given, but for us it's like "I have to reach for this"... it's as if it wasn't already ours to have in the first place.

Additionally, graduates feel pressure to fit into a box of success as defined by the white, dominant, more powerful class which again, can feel diminishing and shameful to students, graduates, and their backgrounds. Graduates described this box, which they

code-switch to fit into, as “proper” and “professional” but also described their choice to not question any of it as associated with being Catholic.

> Saturn: For a long time I had a hard time just making sense of the shame I felt for where… You know just being an immigrant, for being poor, but also being in these structures of like privilege, so a lot of what I’m learning to do… it just came to a point where I just gotta be real about where I’m coming from because I didn’t turn out to be a horrible person. I did what I could, and we’re here--- and it’s crazy cause like Catholicism is something that can be very suffocating and it’s another box. Being quiet, like I mean, just like having to sit still, having to not say something. I think it’s a double edged sword because on one hand it’s beneficial to me to learn how to speak to white people because that is the language of power but on the other hand it should be more of an empowerment rather than recreating the student to fit the white world.

> KT: I think for me it’s um… the word shame comes up. The word hiding. Professionalism. Being proper. I think Catholicism, Christianity has a lot to do with it, religion, a lot of it, institutionalism, you know we’re taught in class you hear the bell you sit down, right? You do not talk over the teacher, you take notes, do not speak to the teacher in a bad manner, you do prayer, you don’t do prayer you get in trouble, right? Like it’s just like sergeant style, it’s just very institutionalized.

When students and graduates leave the segregated school environment of DMA and enter into spaces that are predominantly white, they feel they must hide who they are or where they come. Code-switching or “acting white” as a person of color brings about a feeling of shame and for Esmeralda and Dolores and when coupled with religion and school norms, that they cannot misbehave nor break the rules of what the “box” of being Catholic or “proper” calls for. They simply must obey or be punished for it.

Furthermore, older graduates ages 19-24 also shared that the values that are often tied to Catholicism, such as gratitude and service, which are shown often as values of DMA students and graduates, can often create another kind of pressure for DMA students when perhaps the focus should be on empowering students to learn who they are before

extending themselves to others. DMA graduates advocate for current students by expressing this need for empowerment for current students.

> Esmeralda: One of the things I feel like I learned over my education journey is that I have to start with me. I have to start with myself, and my own healing and a lot of, everything in here [referring to the photos that focus on students and their dreams], "I want to do this for this person...", "for this community…", "to have a better…" it's like we're not even allowed to be selfish in that like... my education can be so that I survive in this world. It is what we want to teach our kids but along those lines we're almost pushed to be like, selfless and like it's about everybody else versus like education really being like the tool to liberate ourselves from like, chains. We've been limited and told we're not enough, not smart enough, so that's interesting that that's always been the narrative like I need to do this for everyone else but nowhere along that can we celebrate like I'm doing this for myself, for my own growth, for my own success, like in service to myself. Going back to like, I wonder how someone else would say this, like someone you know, who's privileged, I would assume that they don't follow that narrative they put themselves first because it's their right. What I've learned is I can't think about the community just yet, until I'm okay. Until I have done my healing and have felt empowered within. There's nothing's wrong with teaching kids that... I think that's important but that piece I think is missing. That a lot of it for us too is for our own personal growth, that needs to be honored first and foremost before we're placed with this massive responsibility to go out and change the world. You know what I mean?

In this chapter, I presented the findings from photo and video elicitation interviews with 12 graduates of De Marillac Academy. I explored what the experiences of DMA students and graduates are when participating in advancement practices on-campus, off-campus, and through media. I discussed how and when DMA students and graduates code-switched when participating in advancement practices and how they continue to value their ability to code-switch today. Lastly, I explored how older graduates between the ages of 19-24 related the intersecting factors of race, class, power and privilege in society to their past and present participation in advancement practices. The next chapter discusses implications of the study and recommendations for future research.

# CHAPTER V: DISCUSSION, IMPLICATIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter includes a summary of the study, conclusions made about student and graduate participation in advancement studies, how and when students and graduates culturally code-switch, and how these experiences relate to graduates' understanding of race, class, power, and privilege based on the data presented in Chapter 4. This chapter discusses and analyzes each of the findings in relation to current research, discusses implications for educators and advancement officers of NativityMiguel and Catholic schools, and makes recommendations for future studies.

While this research only reflects on the experiences of students and graduates of De Marillac Academy and should not be generalized to reflect the experiences of other students and graduates of other NativityMiguel and Catholic schools, it is my hope that Catholic educators and advancement officers, make it regular practice to listen to student and graduate voices and reflect on how advancement strategies affect their students. If we strive to break the cycle of poverty through education, do our advancement practices and language reinforce or disrupt race and class disparities in the eyes of those entrusted to our care? This study pushes us to truly listen and acknowledge the power and perceptions of our students and graduates and to have the difficult, necessary conversations regarding advancement, philanthropy, race, class, power, and privilege.

## Summary of the Study

49 NativityMiguel schools exist around the USA and Canada, these schools operate on a non-tuition model and are dedicated to exclusively serve students and families from low-income backgrounds with a quality Catholic or faith-based education. In order to provide this education "tuition-free", school advancement offices must appeal

to philanthropists, donors, and community members to give toward this cause. To effectively do so, a tried and true approach is to market the successful results of the school and to showcase students and their stories through advancement strategies like social media, school tours, and scholarship benefits. An unintended reality of serving students from low-income families is that NMC schools predominantly serve students of color. Those with the power and financial means to support and lead NMC schools, donors and school leaders, are predominantly white (Fenzel, 2009b). Students and graduates, in addition to the regular school curriculum, receive a hidden curriculum of coaching and guidance on how to conduct themselves, or culturally code-switch, when interacting with guests in advancement settings. Students and graduates interact with guests on-campus, off-campus, and virtually through images and videos shared of them through social media. Students code-switch physically, verbally, and adapt their dispositions. Doing so while interacting with donors and others that support their education affects how they perceive systems of power, class, race, and privilege in educational and professional settings. The language and imagery used when speaking about and showcasing students and graduates also have an effect on how they understand others to perceive them.

The purpose of this qualitative study sought to understand what participation in advancement activities looks like and how students and graduates adapt and culturally code-switch in these situations, and how their participation informed their greater understanding of race, class, power, and privilege. Specifically, the research questions were:

1) What were and are the experiences of De Marillac Academy students and graduates who participated in advancement practices during 2010-2018?
2) How and when do DMA students and graduates code-switch in advancement settings?
3) How do graduates relate their participation in advancement practices to their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege?

To answer these questions, I interviewed twelve DMA graduates for 45-60 minutes in-person and virtually using photo and video elicitation methods. The interview guide focused on gathering their memories of participating in advancement activities. The questions asked them to recall interactions with donors and guests on-campus at DMA and off-campus at the school's scholarship benefit. The interview questions also sought to gather their experiences of being photographed and filmed for advancement material that was shared with the public and greater community online and through mailings. Throughout the interview process, I wrote analytical notes and continually refined the interview process to allow for more open-endedness that helped give graduates time to express their memories and reflections. I transcribed all of the interviews and allowed common themes to emerge from what graduates shared.

## Discussion of Findings

While every graduate participated in advancement activities in different ways, in different roles, and some more often than others, and although each graduate is unique in terms of their age, race, and views regarding race, class, power, and privilege when reflecting on their DMA education, each of the findings offer insight into how students and graduates experience and navigate these activities and interactions. While all

participants see race and class when it comes to their DMA education and those who funded it, the older aged graduates in particular were able to relate their experiences of DMA advancement activities to deeper reflections on race, class, power, and privilege in our society today. Each finding is described and discussed in the following sections:

There are three major findings of this study: (a) DMA students and graduates participate in school advancement practices in-person and through media. In-person, they fill the roles of class greeters, school ambassadors, choir members, and graduate representatives and welcome and inform guests. Through media, they offer "extensions of themselves" (McLuhan, 1997) through photos and videos shared through mailers, social media, websites, and videos. (b) DMA students and graduates code-switch and adapt their dispositions verbally and through physical mannerisms, and dispositions. (c) Graduates' participation in school advancement practices relates to their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege.

### Finding 1: "I knew what it was about" -- Experiences of DMA students and graduates who participate in school advancement practices

Current and existing literature regarding advancement and fundraising efforts are very donor-centric, they focus on successful marketing and fundraising strategies in order to share successful efforts to appeal to donors and maximize giving. While research exists on non-governmental organizations and the effects of fundraising strategies on beneficiaries, there is little research on school advancement strategies and their effects on students. Studies on NMC schools, when focusing on advancement practices, tend to focus on the donors and advancement events, rather than student experience.

For NativityMiguel schools, successful advancement strategies are extremely important to keeping schools open, since these schools operate on a non-tuition-based

model, they must rely on donations from religious orders and donors to continue running. Students play a principal role in the success of these advancement strategies (Fenzel, 2009b; Fenzel & Wyttenbach, 2018; Quirk, 2010). DMA graduates related that as students, they understood early on in their DMA education what advancement activities like school tours, photos, videos, and the Annual Scholarship Benefit were for. Even though other schools produce media of their students for publicity and informational purposes, DMA graduates understood that the media produced also served to attract and sustain donors of the school. Students and graduates were either told by faculty and staff what these events were for, or students figured it out on their own given that they were aware that DMA was a non-tuition driven school that provided them unique learning opportunities and services. Many of the graduates stated specifically that they were aware that donors who give considerable amounts of money to the school also received credit in return for their donations, whether that be tax deductions, a positive corporate social image, or social recognition for their donations to low-income students. While all graduates expressed gratitude for the donations toward their education, they were plainly aware that donors were also getting something out of it too, whether it was to "feel good" or to receive tax credit, which Brown (2008) alludes to, that philanthrocapitalists "do not only enjoy financial benefit. They also enjoy political benefit" (p.18). Donors and school leaders, because of their positions of power, possess an understood permission to influence the policies, values, and direction of the school. Quirk's study on donors of NativityMiguel schools (2010) found that the primary reason donors gave was because they believed in the school's mission and wanted to give back, 75% of donors agreed that federal tax credits influenced their decision to give. DMA graduates saw interest-

convergence at play here and made sense of this themselves. This unspoken aspect of school advancement is part of the hidden curriculum that students and graduates take away from their advancement experiences. They receive subtle clues that inform them that those with money or power, although genuinely charitable, also stand to gain something in return from their donations to their education.

All graduates recalled working with school advancement staff. Although some graduates recalled advancement staff members by name while others didn't, they all recall interacting with them in some regard. Graduates recall advancement staff taking photos of them for school communications, working with other media professionals that came into the school, and recall particularly how these adults made them feel. DMA, like many NMC schools, is a relatively small school community with a 12:1 teacher to student ratio, so any other non-teaching faculty adult they came into contact with regularly during their time at DMA had an impact, however small or large, on their social emotional and educational experience. Lasallian educators specifically, understand that their commitment to students, whether you're a teacher who interacts with students on a daily basis or an advancement officer, means that you have a potential impact on students, and are entrusted with the responsibility of accompanying students in a positive way (De La Salle, 2007; Grieken, 1999). Graduates of DMA recalled when advancement officers accompanied their classes on field trips, when they attended school events or greeted them at the school gate, when they visited classrooms, but most importantly they recall the ways in which advancement officers knew them by name and gave pause in their busy days to have a genuine conversation with them. Students in NMC schools have reported feeling genuinely cared for by the adults in the school building. The fact

that DMA graduates recall instances in which an advancement officer made them feel seen, recognized, and cared for, indicates that advancement officers, although they are not regular teachers, have the ability to positively impact a student's educational experience (Roy, 2008).

Furthermore, many donors or visitors return to DMA as volunteers to offer gifts of time and talent with students, DMA graduates interviewed in this study believed that these adults also had their best interest in mind and added positively to their educational experience. Similar to what was said by other NMC students, DMA graduates recall feeling safe on campus and that they could trust and were positively impacted by committed teachers, adults, and volunteers in the building whether they interacted with them on a daily, weekly, or monthly basis (Fenzel 2009a, Roy, 2008).

Graduates recall feeling nervous when interacting with guests and donors and were more comfortable being a class greeter or school ambassador, on or off campus, over time. Consistent with what Ebede (2018) found in the preparation of students for advancement activities, they feel more prepared to interact with donors the more they are given the opportunity to practice these skills. DMA graduates liked being called out of class to give school tours and they liked attending the ASB. Beyond the food they remember eating, attending the ASB as a choir member brought back distinct memories of accomplishment, they knew the event was important for the school to raise money towards their education. The ASB also brought students and graduates into an extravagant, philanthropic setting in a fancy hotel that they weren't necessarily used to. This unfamiliar setting, amongst unfamiliar people, is what caused both feelings of excitement and nervousness for students. Graduates recall as students seeing that the

ASB was an opportunity for them to share their educational experiences with guests and donors of the school, as well as an opportunity for them to express gratitude. School visits and the ASB are essential to providing an opportunity where "potential donors can meet and hear testimonies from students and teachers" that would increase the possibility that they would donate to the school (Fenzel, 2009b, p.84). When students meet donors and interact face-to-face, it creates a connection of care and intimacy, which yields larger donations (Ebede, 2018; Marx, 2000).

When a graduate was invited to be a featured graduate speaker, it indicated to them that they were regarded as a successful graduate and therefore an ideal graduate representative of the school. However, the graduates interviewed that were featured speakers indicated that the testimonies they share with the greater audience can make their unique experiences feel oversimplified and generic. The censoring or edits of their original speeches, they feel, took away from their power to share their genuine message with the audience and instead made the focus about how they wouldn't be where they are if it weren't for DMA. They feel like it diminished their individual effort and resilience in overcoming their personal barriers and the impact their families' support had on their success. This is similar to what Brown (2015) found in her study on school advancement settings as well, that students that were favored had the ability to "say great things" about the school, were able to appear needy and well-deserved of donor funds, and helped "make funders feel generous, important, appreciated, and not threatened" (p.2). DMA graduates felt that there is fear around potentially upsetting funders, offending their political or personal views, and therefore risking the possibility that donors would choose to give less or not at all. Graduates succumbed to molding their message so as not to

threaten anyone's privilege. By centering on the effort to pull at the heartstrings of donors and to invoke an emotional response while not upsetting them, we place the donor comfort over student and graduate voices. It tells the graduates that their voice matters, but only so long as they do not offend those in power, which inadvertently maintains inferiority based on race and class (Brown, 2015). DMA students and graduates, through the hidden curriculum of what they learn in advancement settings, learn how to manipulate and decode the system (Stanton-Salazar, 1997), but come to understand that they can do so only if they do not upset those already in power.

In terms of school advancement media, DMA does well to be active on social media and through mailings, as this is a vital component of a successful advancement program that brings in donations (Breeze, 2012; Congress, Luks, & Petit, 2017). Research on non-governmental organizations abroad that feature the faces of students in their fundraising materials tell us that when donors see unjust suffering or lack of access to an undeserving child, they are motivated to help (Manzo, 2008). DMA graduates approve of how they are portrayed by the media produced by DMA for informational and fundraising purposes. They think that they are represented in a positive light and often feel uplifted and motivated by watching and seeing the photos and videos produced of them. Their satisfaction with the positive imagery of them aligns with other studies that have stated that beneficiaries prefer the sharing of images that underline the common humanity between donors and beneficiaries, rather than images that provoke guilt and pity (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Breeze & Dean, 2012, Warrington & Crombie, 2017). That being said, all graduates expressed that while they were represented well visually as full of potential and portrayed in a positive light, they were concerned that the Tenderloin

neighborhood in which DMA is located was not represented fairly enough in accordance with how they see the neighborhood. DMA graduates were concerned that their neighbors in the Tenderloin were overgeneralized as drug addicts and homeless, and although there may have been some truth in that depiction, they wished that donors could see the positive they see in their neighbors and the collaboration of community organizations in the Tenderloin neighborhood in general. Graduates also expressed through the interviews that although DMA was in the Tenderloin, many of them resided in neighboring communities. They wished the school media had also focused on these other neighborhoods in order to give a truer picture of who makes up the DMA community rather than lead audiences to overgeneralize who students are and where they come from, which reinforce negative stereotypes and assumptions about DMA students (Bhati, 2016; Ove 2010).

While many of the graduates recall not minding if they were photographed or recorded, some admitted to feeling slightly uncomfortable or that their participation was simply a given and inevitable. Graduates recall being asked if they wanted to participate or not, but we should be reminded that they may not feel they are in a position to be "morally outraged" or opposed to being photographed or recorded because they depend on the funds these images help garner to pay for their education. In Breeze & Dean's 2012 study, beneficiaries believed that when one is receiving help from an organization, they are not in a position to be upset over anything (Breeze & Dean, 2012). Graduates that were interviewed seemed to not realize that they may have a choice to decline being photographed. Thankfully, graduates in this study felt that their teachers were intuitive

enough to sense if there was any hesitation on the student's part about participating in advancement activities that day.

Graduates recall that sometimes there were "favorites", ambassadors or other students that were called more than others to interact with school guests or be featured in school media. Students and graduates observed that African American students were selected for school media often enough that they didn't feel that it truly depicted the demographics of the school. The percentage of times African American students were shown in school media did not seem relative to how many African American students there were actually present at DMA. Other times, students and graduates noticed that other "favorite" ambassadors or students were those who exhibited social characteristics like extraversion, enthusiasm, and academic success that were valued by the school. These students were those that were particularly skilled at culturally code-switching.

**Finding 2: "It's bittersweet and it's complex" -- DMA students and graduates code-switch and adapt their dispositions verbally and through physical mannerisms**

All graduates interviewed attested to the fact that they were coached by faculty and staff on how to code-switch with donors and school guests on-campus as classroom greeters or school ambassadors and every year prior to the premiere fundraising event off-campus, the Annual Scholarship Benefit. Levinson also purports that if the act of code-switching is not explicitly taught to children from low-income backgrounds, they may act unnaturally for acceptance or as Emdin (2010) explains, "spend their entire lives copying another person's culture and looking down on their own" (p.177). All graduates were unique in their reflections of how and to what degree they code-switch or change their dispositions in advancement settings. In addition to code-switching when interacting with guests, students and graduates also mentioned that they made sure that if

a camera was on them, they were more behaved or focused on the task they were supposed to be doing instead of being distracted by the cameras. While all people code-switch, code-switching for children of color is a means to learn and challenge the systems that oppress them (Levinson, 2007). Graduates recall certain rituals and norms of behavior at DMA on-campus, but extra coaching was given when it meant that students would be in contact with donors and guests or captured on camera. Graduates code-switched verbally, explaining that it wasn't appropriate to use the same selection of words or volume that they would with their friends or on-campus just interacting with their peers or teachers. Physically, graduates distinctly remember being taught how to shake hands with school leaders upon arrival and departure from school, and especially when receiving guests at school or at the ASB. Eye contact was important to couple with shaking hands, and speaking to guests with a well-behaved, polite, and enthusiastic disposition about their school was encouraged and expected. Students generally had free reign over what they wanted to share regarding what they enjoyed about their educational experience and graduates shared that these skills helped them later in life in academic and professional realms. Graduates that were interviewed that were in high school, between the ages of 14-18, reported that they didn't feel as if they were being untrue or unauthentic to who they truly were but that there was a certain behavior and disposition they felt was expected both for the purpose of representing themselves well and representing the school in a positive manner. These graduates took on a more formal disposition, being welcoming to guests who they regarded as people who donated or may potentially donate to the school and fund part of their education. These graduates stated that they were already polite and generally well-behaved, and DMA gave them more

opportunities, in advancement settings and activities, to practice this skill of "turning it on or off" as Brown (2015) describes. In Brown's study, code-switching was known as "professionalism", students in her study were aware of their role in playing to the political spectacle expected "in front of the curtain" with donors. This "professional" look also extends the significance of students in their uniforms, as Irie also mentions at the thought of how donors couldn't possibly resist donating money to kids of color in their uniform singing onstage. These code-switching behaviors appeal to donors, students play into the spectacle that they are deserving of upward mobility and social and cultural capital because they "act" like "them". Carter (2006) has coined this as "acting white", adopting language, dispositions, reaching for social networks, and playing into power dynamics of superiority and subordination. For Carter's study, she found that three different groups emerged to the degree that they "act white": cultural mainstreamers, cultural straddlers, and noncompliant believers. Irie can be described as a cultural mainstreamer when she was a student, because she wanted very badly to assimilate with the white majority she saw on TV and as people with power:

> Irie: I'm gonna learn how to like put my shoulders back and look someone in the eye and I just thought it was cool, to like… assimilate… like I don't know, I kind of put white people on a pedestal when I was little I remember. I remember I was so mad I wanted my parents to rename me to Ashley, and they wouldn't let me and I remember being so mad I threw like the biggest fit. And like I mean, not anymore, now I'm so proud of my brown skin. I remember in middle school or even like on TV, like white people were the ones with the money, they were the ones with the resources, and so like in my head in order for me to be successful and to get my parents out of here and get us out of here, I need to be like them.

Although Irie eventually came to embrace who she was and not look at her brown skin as a deficit, it shows that students and graduates may fluctuate between acceptance of themselves and their backgrounds or come to look down on it as they learn through the

hidden curriculum of participation in advancement events what language, mannerisms, and "codes" are more valued by the privileged that have the power to influence their access to an education. Dolroes and KT mentioned that being expected to turn on a certain disposition in front of donors, as a student and sometimes as a graduate, can leave them feeling a sense of shame about who they are and where they come from, rather than seeing that their home identities are equal to that valued by those with power in advancement settings. Many of these graduates can be seen as cultural straddlers, "strategic navigators", able to "play the game and embrace the cultural codes of both school and home community" (Carter, 2006, p.308). They are able to adopt dispositions valued in advancement environments, and either accept or question the values tied to it. The older graduates were more critical of the norms and behaviors tied to advancement practices and philanthropy in general. Irie, Dolores, Saturn, KT, and Esmeralda stated that as they got older, reflecting back and continuing to participate in advancement activities brings up conflicting, "bittersweet" feelings: sincere gratitude for the opportunities and trajectory that DMA set them on and frustration with the means and messaging by which these funds must be procured to give students from low-income backgrounds their God-given right to access a quality education.

### Finding 3: "They get to choose when to see us and when not to see us" -- Graduates' participation in school advancement practices relate to their understanding of race, class, power, and privilege

In this final section, I expand more on what arose for graduates when relating how race, class, power, and privilege shows up for them when they reflect on their participation and observations regarding school advancement. First, I show how graduates tie their race and the race of school leaders and donors to power and privilege,

Then, I show how graduates reject the narratives that are relayed by advancement to donors. Finally, I end with what graduates hope for current and future students regarding their preparation and education as it relates to self-empowerment, self-knowledge, and participation in school advancement activities.

DMA specifically serves students and families from low-income backgrounds in the Tenderloin, SoMa, and neighboring communities. The innovative funding model has made it possible to ensure a quality Catholic education for over 240 students since the school opened in 2000. An unintended reality of serving students who come from low-income backgrounds is that they are also students of color. DMA students past and present identify with mostly Latino, Asian-Pacific Islander, Asian, African American, or multiracial backgrounds. DMA is a segregated learning environment racially, ethnically, and socioeconomically. This segregation is most apparent in advancement settings, all graduates interviewed in this study explicitly stated and observed that when participating in school advancement activities, they recall that guests and donors were white. As noted in other NMC schools, many of the graduates also stated that school leaders and many of their teachers were also white (Fenzel, 2009a; Fenzel & Wyttenbach 2019). Graduates tied this race marker of white with positions of power. School leaders who were in charge of their education were white. Donors and guests that students were charged with welcoming to the school and scholarship benefit were white. Some graduates saw that the curriculum imparted to them was Eurocentric, despite the fact the cultural backgrounds of all students are not white, it was seen as the curriculum they simply needed to know to be successful in their continuing education. All of the graduates interviewed viewed whiteness as a discourse of power; the power to fund their education,

and the power to choose the content of their education. Nowhere in graduates' recollections of being prepared to interact with guests and donors in advancement settings did they say race was mentioned, it was unspoken. Students were not helped or given an explanation about why this is, there was no discussion about the intersecting factors of race, class, power, and privilege in advancement settings and greater society. Students were left to make sense of this on their own through speaking about it with family or building their critical consciousness as they continued their education into college.

Younger, high school aged graduates in the study seemed less openly critical of the tie between the donors being white and having financial power. As Filbert puts it, "I knew they just had higher financial status and I noticed that the majority of them were white but I didn't like, let that bother me too much, I was just like 'Okay whatever' like that's just a given that's just how it is." Older graduates that were 19 and older credited their experiences in higher education, and simply just being older and engaged in "the system" with their ability to articulate their critical consciousness. Saturn remarked that once one figures out how systems of power, race, class, and privilege work, one can't stop seeing it, regardless of if you went to college or not. Graduates make the connection that white guests and donors are allowed privileges not granted to them because of the color of their skin and because of the difference in socioeconomic background (Solorzano & Yasso, 2002). Esmeralda points out what some of these privileges are perceived to be in school advancement settings. Guests and donors have the privilege of when and how they confront the reality of students' lives, "there's a level of privilege for folks who go into that space where they can tune in and then tune out and then not have to worry about it because they've already cut their check and so they're

done what they had to do for the rest of the year". Donors and guests have the privilege of not needing to interrogate the systems that make them powerful and leave others less advantaged and silenced.

> Esmeralda: I sat next to someone who clearly does not see their impact on why things are the way they are, in terms of like his privilege and the world he grew up in. Like how was I supposed to navigate that conversation, like what about if I had just lost it and went off on him? You know, who was going to be reprimanded? Me. Who was going to have to apologize? Me. So I have to bite my tongue and just sit there and hear like pure ignorance coming out of this person's mouth.

Furthermore, this graduate, along with Saturn and Dolores tied that being white, as a student, comes with the privilege of not needing to lend your sob or success story to advancement school teams to garner funds that grant access to a Catholic education. This privilege is not granted to students of color from low socioeconomic backgrounds despite the Catholic belief that access to a quality education is an inalienable right (Paul VI, 1965b; UN General Assembly, 1948).

The reality is that school advancement teams, students and graduates must collaborate to appeal to guests and donors in order to procure funds and kindle collaborations with community partners to make their education possible, successful advancement efforts are crucial (Fenzel 2009a). Graduates interviewed in this study knew that with the aim to meet fundraising goals, the sharing of their images and life stories added to the success of raising money toward their education. Overall, graduates were pleased with how the narratives were shared through media. They felt that they were represented well, in a positive light, and full of potential. This coincides with what many beneficiaries featured in fundraising campaigns by non-governmental organizations around the world have also wished for, aware that portraying beneficiaries as weak, poor,

or needy only serves to reinforce deficit stereotypes about disadvantaged populations (Bhati & Eikenberry, 2016; Warrington & Crombie, 2017). However, the narratives that are shared with donors feel problematic for many of the older graduates interviewed in this study. When it is their experiences of struggles and poverty that are being made an example of in philanthropic settings, it can feel as though the individual is being separated from their unique experience. The "story" or experience feels generalizable to all DMA students rather than tied to the individual's very real experience when it's being used as a tool to raise money. As KT puts it, "they push the individual aside and push the story up". The story that often gets told is one in which a student overcomes great adversity and is better and successful now because of their DMA education. This "story" includes difficulties students and graduates experience with issues like learning differences, immigration, access to resources, and poverty. Saturn shares, "we shouldn't be selling the same emotional sad story, immigrant story… we're not all sad, you know what I mean?"

Graduates understand that the aim of these narratives are to pull on donor heartstrings, which is a proven strategy that works in fundraising (Burt & Strongman, 2005; Hibbert et al., 2007; Manzo, 2008; Merchant et al, 2010; Ove, 2013; Shanahan et al., 2012), but the line between evoking emotions of empathy and collaboration versus sympathy is very thin. Deficit narratives may further reinforce deficit stereotypes and make a donor or guest feel like a savior, rather than asking them to be a collaborator. When donors and guests hear that their gifts of money can alleviate the difficulty these students face, they have the privilege of walking away from the event feeling good and charitable, but not necessarily confronted with the need that they investigate why

systemic oppression of people of color from low socioeconomic backgrounds, and schools like DMA have to exist in the first place. Asking donors to consider this would make them feel uncomfortable with their power and privilege, as Esmeralda puts it, "but you don't want to disrupt, you don't want to make them uncomfortable… because it's working, thank you for coming, they feel good, you walk away feeling good". These narratives made these graduates uncomfortable, especially when these racial and socioeconomic dynamics of philanthropy, where the power seems to flow from the white and rich down to the brown and poor, were and are not discussed in any part of their DMA education, despite the fact that it is a part of every student's educational experience. Aldana and Kabadi (2019) find similar feelings of confusion and frustration among students of color in Cristo Rey schools, a network of schools that also depends on philanthropic giving and collaboration in order to provide a Catholic education to students of color.

Graduates instead hope for a more positive rendering of what their stories are. While they admit that they have faced great deals of struggle and adversity that others may not ever experience in their lifetimes, graduates hope that these narratives can focus more on their accomplishments that they earned because of their own individual efforts and commitment to resilience and perseverance. By continuing to focus the narrative that none of it is possible without the money of donors, it makes it seem as though they owe it all to donors and ignores what their families and others have done to support them. It glorifies the donor and diminishes the individual to a student in need of saving. DMA students and graduates do not enjoy the privilege of simply owning their own success stories in advancement settings, it seems credit must always be given to the donors in

order to keep donors giving and leaving them feeling positive. A more privileged student from a more privileged background is not required to showcase their story in order to access a quality Catholic education. As Esmeralda puts it, "I just want to BE. I want to be recognized for the work that I do, for the values that I have, for the training that I've received". As Brown (2015) notes in her study, students and graduates must say great things about their school to donors, and make donors feel generous and important, but not threatened. Graduates describe this conflux of emotions as "bittersweet" and as a "double-edged sword", they do not want to seem ungrateful for the opportunities made possible to them by being a DMA student and graduate, but the indebtedness leaves them feeling guilty for pointing out the race of the donors and for being critical of current advancement practices at all. All graduates in this study felt sorry when speaking about race. They do not want to offend anyone, nor overgeneralize the donor audience, but speak to the truth of discomfort of these philanthropic settings that their access to a Catholic education depends on. When confronting this feeling of oppression, which reflects a frustration with larger systems of oppression evident in society, Esmeralda further adds that it's tricky territory, "Don't bite the hand that feeds you".

Several graduates spoke to their hopes of how advancement activities and education at DMA can be made more transparent to students, more honoring of student and graduate's stories and identities, and more empowering for their development. Throughout this study, we are reminded that in preparation to participate in advancement activities, students are prepared to interact with donors and guests by being coached on how to code-switch. Although some graduates recall being told explicitly by teachers and staff what the purpose of these activities were for, students and graduates had to

make sense of how race, class, power, and privilege plays into advancement activities. Graduates in this study advocate for current and future DMA students. In addition to being more explicit about why and how we code-switch, graduates expressed that it should be made clear that the codes students switch between are not valued as greater or lesser than the other, but seen as a skill that they possess to adapt to the different environments they come into contact with. KT said that they don't think there's ever too early an age to speak about race and power, if Catholic schools and educators work through their discomfort of speaking and grappling with issues of race and privilege it might help students in the long run.

> KT: I think that the earlier you teach children about the truth, the less resentment they feel about the world. Like, I felt I very hostile toward a lot of white people for a very long time because I learned this stuff in college you know...like whereas if I had learned it a little earlier and also guided through it, if my professors and my teachers who were white would have talked about it with me, I would have learned about it. I might have been a bit more understanding about it.

In terms of code-switching, by explaining to students that there is certainly nothing wrong or "less" about the language and dispositions they arrive to the door with, students can see their multiple identities as a strength rather than seeing parts of their identity as something to suppress in educational and professional settings. One way to elevate their ways of being and ways of knowing is to adopt culturally sustaining pedagogy that gives students the language to speak about issues of race, class, power, and privilege, and to work with a curriculum that is not Eurocentric. "Eurocentric perspectives continue to shape practices and expected norms that affect students of color in negative ways that hinder the multifaceted potential of their identities and ways of knowing" (Delgado Bernal et al., 2002). Irie wishes she had learned more about her own culture earlier in her education:

> The things you learn in middle school and high school you're like… what the fuck. They taught me the wrong history like, I would have rather learned this history. What was the point in learning white history, and like I hate that it was skewed. I remember 5th grade, [teacher] she's teaching us about the frontier, like… wow this land like there was no one here, and wow these people had opportunity and like, look where we are now! And it's like you… motherfucking liars, the Native Americans were here on this land and you slaughtered and killed them and it's like what the heck. I barely learned anything about my own culture up until college.

By honoring the true history of oppressed peoples and speaking candidly with students about injustices can offer ways in which students can draw parallels to current systems of oppression they see in their current world. Furthermore, they can be educated and given ways of working through and confronting microaggressions they may encounter in the future. By lending time to cover non-Eurocentric history and perspectives in the curriculum, you are lending power for these ways of knowing to be heard and recognized. In doing so and allowing students to share their ways of knowing their cultural history, you give them more power to be their full selves.

All of the graduates interviewed noted that donors and guests were predominantly white. Graduates, even when they were students, clearly saw race even if it was never mentioned in the coaching sessions leading up to the ASB or in their school ambassador training sessions. They saw the power that those with fair skin had over their access to an education, as well as in the power structures of school and greater society. As Solorzano & Yasso (2002) describe it, those who were white were allowed "privileges not granted to people of color", in the case of DMA students and graduates, access to a quality education, opportunities, and networks. All graduates spoke to the immense gratitude they felt for DMA, many admitted that although they like to think that they would be successful regardless of whether or not they were admitted to DMA, their educational

journey and the opportunities made available to them as DMA students and graduates had an incredible impact on their lives and the values they continue to live by today. By disrupting race and power narratives early on in their education and discussing the reasons why systemic inequality exists, schools run less risk of leaving their students and graduates feeling cheated or uninformed in terms of their education and their role in advancement activities.

> Saturn: As a student you trust the people who are teaching you these things, you trust that this is a good thing, that you're learning something you want to be a part of but that's not serving our kids. It's like tell them what they're actually doing. Tell them that this is code-switching, because white people are the ones in power, you know explain to them…and if they can't, then they shouldn't be meeting people. If you can't tell a 4th grader why they're doing this, or what this system is built around, then don't make them do it.

Not only do students and graduates see the power of whiteness through their history books and ways in which they're being asked to code-switch, they see how these norms play out in philanthropic settings but are left to make sense of it on their own later, lacking the guidance that DMA could have given them.

## Implications for Practice

As the data and findings have shown, student and graduate participation in advancement practices is definitely a part of their educational experience. They become accustomed to greeting guests and donors to their school and to advancement events that fundraise towards their education. They receive a hidden curriculum that involves code-switching when interacting with donors and guests and learn how to change their dispositions and mannerisms in certain environments, which they see as a skill that they benefit from as they continue their educational and professional careers. Their participation in and observations of advancement settings relate to how students and

graduates make sense of systematic racism, classism, and who has power and privilege in these systems.

In these interviews with high school aged, college aged, and older graduates, all graduates had something to say about how participation in advancement practices benefited them and also how they can be improved for current and future students. The findings have implications for educators, advancement officers, and donors whether in a Catholic school setting or not.

First, graduates were incredibly thankful for the education and opportunities that came with being a DMA student and graduate. They spoke highly of their teachers, especially those that stayed at the school for longer than a couple of years, to those who took the time to build close relationships with their students, and those who engaged in difficult conversations and challenged them to critique the curriculum and to re-examine the world.

### *For educators*

Graduates articulated the shortcomings of their formal and informal, explicit and hidden curriculum. Participation in advancement activities is a consistent, regular component of a DMA education. The partnerships cultivated by advancement officers with community organizations, corporations, volunteers, Board members, and interested donors all serve to enrich and make a DMA student's education special and unique. DMA and NMC schools would do well to adopt culturally relevant pedagogy that informs, educates, and allows educators to be educated by students about different cultures, different epistemologies, and ways of knowing in our world. Teachers and advancement officers that engage in culturally relevant pedagogy affirm students, their

identities and connection to their culture, and are willing and able to critique inequity while building this capacity in their students as well.

Beyond the formal curriculum, DMA and NMC school educators should challenge themselves to accompany students through building their critical consciousness, speaking in regular and formal settings about the complicated factors that make it necessary for their school to raise funds towards their education in the first place and reflecting on issues of race, class, power and privilege in larger settings. Educators are not expected to know all of the answers, but by grounding themselves in the Lasallian-Vincentian position of accompanying their students as an older brother or sister in working through these issues toward a greater liberation for all can serve as a preface for the critical conversations students and graduates will encounter through their continued education whether in college or not.

Advancement officers and educators should check in with students prior to asking them to engage with guests and donors about how they are doing on that particular day and time given that sometimes the circumstances of students' lives may not permit them to be socially and emotionally available to engage in advancement activities. Graduates recall that their teachers were in tune with their feelings and lives enough to detect if there was a hint of discomfort; educators and advancement officers serve their students well to continue to be attentive to the everchanging needs and circumstances of students' lives. It is important to constantly remind students that it is there choice to participate or not, and that there is no consequence in not choosing to participate.

Educators and advancement personnel in all schools, but particularly in NMC and Catholic schools would do well to create a $4^{th}$-$8^{th}$ grade curriculum sequence that infuses

self-knowledge and growth to build personal empowerment of students and build consciousness of the advancement spaces they are asked to participate in. Empowering students and graduates by drawing on their community cultural wealth can lead students to recognize their natural assets and abilities and best represent themselves in the ways they want to be portrayed and received based on their social cultural wealth (Yosso, 2005). Graduates and students would be able to show their selves in a more dignified, rather than extractive way because there would be a connection between their formal and informal curriculum, the thread of self-empowerment would be more clear to students and graduates.

### *For advancement personnel and school leaders*

Advancement officers should work with teachers to understand and adopt culturally relevant practices in order to affirm, connect to student's cultures, and critique inequity as they coach and prepare students to interact with guests and donors in advancement settings. As stated before, by celebrating and elevating the diverse cultures of the student population as valid and equal to white ways of knowing and being, students and graduates can feel a more inherent and powerful sense of self based on who they are, where they come from, and the unique ways their multifaceted identity can serve and present itself in the world in an empowered manner. Advancement officers are advised to recognize that, especially when working in a Catholic, Lasallian and Vincentian setting, they are considered educators as well.

Advancement officers may not have regular, daily, scheduled interactions with students, but since advancement activities are a regular and consistent part of a student's educational experience, the relationships they build with students is paramount,

especially because advancement officers are charged with the responsibility of presenting and representing students and the need for their education to be funded. Dolores stressed at one point that it is essential that advancement officers consistently immerse themselves into school routines and events, that they build relationships with students and faculty to the same, if not to a higher degree than they do with donors and administrators. Advancement officers must lend a considerable amount of time and energy into building relationships. Graduates recalled simple, short moments in the stairways of the school where an advancement officer stopped to ask how they were doing, asked about their family, or had lunch with their class. Such efforts go a long way in a graduate's recollection and impression that advancement officers were an authentic advocate for their education rather than just doing their job.

In regard to the selection of students and graduates to participate in advancement activities, educators and advancement officers should be diligent and aware of how and why they are selecting students to be class greeters and student ambassadors. Students self-selected to be student ambassadors, but graduates recall that there were still "favorites" being called more than others. At such an impressionable age, educators and advancement officers, at the advisement of graduates in this study, should continuously remind all students that the invitation to participate in school tours is open to all and that students always have the choice to opt out.

Secondly, advancement officers and educators should continue to be diligently critical of the language they use when they describe, or allow others to describe, the students and graduates entrusted to their care. In Catholic schools especially, we are focused on giving preferential treatment to "the poor", not realizing that by describing

students and graduates of color as “poor” carries a stigma of inferiority that donors and others may interpret as a need to save rather than a call for collaboration to working toward equal liberation. The descriptor “poor” sticks with students and graduates even beyond the point at which we hope to free them from the cycle of poverty, as Dolores says, “labels, they can stick with you for longer than you think”. Liberating students and graduates out of poverty does not mean that we liberate them from the stigmas attached to the other intersecting descriptors often associated negatively with being poor and from or residing in the Tenderloin.

### *For media producers*

In terms of the production of media, it is important that educators and advancement officers continue to be mindful about asking consent of all students that may be captured or asked to be on camera. As Warrington and Crombie (2018) found in their study, advancement officers should invest in creative and collaborative approaches of media production, uphold the rights of students, make informed consent part of the process, commit to sensitive and effective communication before, during, and after image creation, and ensure that human dignity is upheld throughout the process (p.67). Media produced and shared for informational and advancement purposes should continue to ensure that they depict students and graduates in a positive light. By collaborating with students and graduates in media production, we may see that students and graduates are able to share their perspective of the Tenderloin community through their unique, compassionate lens. The same advice is implied when it comes to the sharing of student and graduate stories in advancement material and at advancement events as well. Graduates should be entitled to have more power over how they share their stories with

donors and guests in the same regard that donors have the power to say what they want to say and how they say it on stage. When one censors graduate or student voice on stage, it only indicates to those entrusted to our care that the comfort of donors is valued more than the comfort of students and graduates because of financial power.

Truly listening to graduates is crucial to ensuring that their dignity is upheld. There is a difference between having conversations to say that conversations have been had and conversations that actually lead to action and change. "The increased value of listening to graduate voices is that it provides a perspective filtered through experience that could improve the educational context for current and future students" (Roy, 2008, p.8). It is important that educators, advancement officers, and philanthropists humble themselves in order to truly listen to graduate communities in order to improve conditions and representation (Frumkin, 2010). Beyond listening to graduates, also celebrating graduates for their accomplishments based on their own merit has the potential to change philanthropic contributions from "giving" to "collaborating" with students and graduates who the system has failed to serve equitably.

In line with making sure that advancement officers and educators don't play "favorites" with the students they choose to interact with donors, they should also seek to diversify the graduates they ask to attend and speak with donors at the scholarship benefits. Doing so offers students, graduates, families, donors, and the greater DMA community the different kinds of success DMA graduates have discovered. The diversity of graduate success would be exhibited, rather than resorting to graduates who are convenient to access or best represent the type of success thought to appeal most to donors. Advancement offices and efforts that commit to being student-focused rather

than donor-focused do well to uphold the dignity of all students and graduates and are well-positioned to educate their donors.

**For donors**

As pointed out by graduates in this study, those in more socioeconomically advantaged positions of power have the privilege of seeing and not seeing inequity on their own terms. They have the privilege of alleviating their negative emotions, guilt, sympathy, or empathy with their money, but advancement officers would do well to challenge themselves to leverage their ability to speak to donors and also educate them to the ways in which students and graduates continue to feel oppressed in larger systems of society. Donors, if they are genuine donors, would do well to listen and to challenge themselves and their positions of power to further interrogate themselves and how they can continue to bring change to injustices through their roles, and the narratives they share about people in less advantaged positions in society. When donors and graduates can authentically see each other as collaborators toward a common goal, rather than a savior and a student in need of saving, donors and educators truly walk in accompaniment of the students entrusted to their care and inspire graduates to go forth to do the same.

Donors, if truly committed to being partners with DMA in breaking the cycle of poverty, should investigate and discuss ways in which they may perpetuate inequality and commit to making changes and seeing the ways their actions and choices impact students or others from similar backgrounds.

Graduates remarked that the donors who had the most impact on them were ones that visited the campus regularly, knew them by name, and had a genuine conversation

with them rooted in solidarity, rather than a savior mentality. Relationships are key to making a student feel seen, heard, and respected.

## Limitations and Recommendations for Further Research

This research was qualitative, photo and video elicited, and focused on a sample size of twelve graduates. The race, ethnicity, and immigration status of the sample size was reflective of the student and graduate population of DMA. Although this study captured in-depth memories and reflections on participation in advancement activities, this data could not be used to make any generalizations about a specific age group, cultural or ethnic group, or any generalization on immigration status and income level. DMA is one of 49 NativityMiguel schools in the USA and Canada. Although DMA shares common goals and alignment with the NMC, the unique philanthropic environment and advancement strategies of DMA in relation to the Tenderloin and San Francisco context cannot be generalized to other schools in the NativityMiguel Coalition.

This study can be expanded to focus on experiences of students and graduates of all NMC schools, and relationships of advancement officers and donors with the students and graduates of these schools. For example, the same methodology could be applied to a NMC school in Washington D.C. and compared to the findings of this study. This study can also be expanded to discover if and how culturally relevant pedagogy, or explicit curriculum regarding student and graduate participation in advancement activities affect student and graduates understanding of race, class, power and privilege. This way, NMC schools, and Catholic schools in general, can share best practices.

Lasallian, Vincentian, and Jesuit educators are dedicated to reading the signs of the times and challenging themselves to break systems of oppression as they focus on the

most disadvantaged populations in society. This study can be expanded to investigate ways in which Catholic narratives about "the poor" work to recycle or break cycles of poverty. The Catholic belief in humility and listening to all who are welcomed to the table can inform ways in which language in Catholic philanthropic efforts can be improved.

It would be interesting to investigate the ways in which advancement officers in Lasallian and/or Vincentian schools apply the charism to their work. Again, this would give advancement officers the ability to share best practices and best orient themselves to remain student-focused and encourage donors to be centered on efforts to provide equitable access in the best way possible as well.

Furthermore, digging deeper into donor motivations in Lasallian-Vincentian schools could be accomplished by replicating this study but interviewing donors rather than graduates. In this way, we can narrow the gap between donors and the beneficiaries to determine true motivations and explore how divisions of race, class, power, and privilege can be understood between these two entities and reconciled.

This study was focused on twelve graduates that participated regularly in advancement activities, many of the graduates were self-proclaimed extroverts and were generally well-performing students academically. It is still a desire of the researcher to further investigate how advancement activities, or lack of participation in advancement activities affected students who were considered low-performing or are self-proclaimed introverts to see if there was a difference in how their understanding of how race, class, power, and privilege was impacted.

Lastly, though the research would agree that this qualitative, photo and video elicitation interview methodology was the best approach for this study in order for graduates to reflect on their participation of their past at DMA, future research may benefit from taking a quantitative approach. A quantitative approach may bring forth data that further illustrates, confirms, or unconfirms the varied experiences graduates have while participating in school advancement activities.

## Closing Remarks

As Catholic school educators, we firmly believe that every child deserves access to a quality Catholic education, we are charged with the responsibility of advocating for their protection of their dignity and listening to the joys and struggles in life, positioning ourselves in any way possible toward their freedom and equal rights in an often oppressive society.

De Marillac Academy has undoubtedly opened doors to students and graduates that were once closed. The tireless efforts of school leaders, administrators, faculty, and staff toward ensuring this education year after year is highly commended. The donors, guests, community partners, and volunteers enrich and help make education possible for DMA students and graduates. There is no doubt that DMA is an excellent school that has done wonders for the students and families they serve. As an exemplar of NMC schools and a non-tuition Catholic school model, there is always room for improvement.

Today, in our current sociopolitical climate, we are faced with an unyielding flood of instances of ignorance, racism, classism, and sexism in our society and in our schools. Diversity, equity, and inclusion is an ever-increasing challenge for all schools. Efforts to bring topics like race, class, power, privilege to the forefront is difficult. The emotional

tax that these intersectional issues take on the students, graduates, and educators of color who live with the ramifications of inequality, of not being heard, of being listened to but not seeing anything actionable, is tiring and crushing. But these conversations are necessary. As Catholic school educators, we can continually return to the founding charisms of truly listening and accompanying our students through working through these issues as we see them in our everyday environments. Students report feeling safe at De Marillac Academy, what better environment to engage and speak openly about issues of race, class, power, and privilege in an effort to empower students before heading out into the world. When we don't talk about these issues, students and graduates are left to make sense of it on their own, which may lead them to question the intent, motivation, and decision making made by educators on their behalf. We continue to diminish the full identities and ways of knowing our students come to school with by asking them to code-switch in certain ways, especially in front of guests and donors. How can we as Catholic school educators truly listen to our students and graduates, stand down and give them equal voice and decision-making power? When we look at school organization charts, who holds the power from the top-down? This study is an effort to place the students and graduates we serve on top, to allow their voices and how their educational experiences should inform how teachers serve them, how administrators support teachers, how advancement officers support students and teachers and articulate that to donors and guests of the school. If we listen, we can celebrate our successes, but we can also humbly improve our school advancement practices and incorporate graduate voice to move away from and inform donors and guests about appropriate and empowering ways to speak about students and graduates that come from disadvantaged backgrounds. We

can investigate how code-switching as a skill also comes to encompass and celebrate the full range of a student's ability to move across language and class and race in a variety of formal and informal settings. We can accompany our students and donors to grapple with issues of race, class, power, and privilege and work toward that common goal together rather than see it as an attack on one group. As KT said, "it's a collaboration, right?"

# REFERENCES

Aldana, U. S. (2013). Moving Beyond the College-Preparatory High School Model to a College-Going Culture in Urban Catholic High Schools. *Journal of Catholic Education*, *17*(2), 131–153.

Aldana, U. S., & Kabadi, S. U. (2019). A Critical Race Theoretical Examination of the Cristo Rey Network. In *Responding to the Call for Educational Justice: Transformative Catholic-Led Initiatives in Urban Education* (pp. 33–57). Information Age Publishing.

Anderer, M. (2005). *Innovation in Association: The Miguel School Movement*.

Anderson, G. M. (2002). Starting the first San Miguel Middle School: An interview with Lawrence Goyette. *America*, (8). Retrieved from http://0-search.ebscohost.com.ignacio.usfca.edu/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edsggo&AN=edsgcl.91785525&site=eds-live&scope=site

Andersson, J., & Valentine, G. (2015). Picturing the poor: Fundraising and the depoliticisation of homelessness. *Social & Cultural Geography*, *16*(1), 58–74. https://doi.org/10.1080/14649365.2014.950688

Anyon, J. (1980). Social Class and the Hidden Curriculum of Work. *The Journal of Education*, *162*(1), 67–92. Retrieved from JSTOR.

Apple, M. (2004). *Ideology and Curriculum*. Retrieved from http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/usflibrary-ebooks/detail.action?docID=182921

Apple, M. W. (1971). The hidden curriculum and the nature of conflict. *Interchange*, *2*(4), 27–40. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02287080

At What Point Does A Fundraising Ad Go Too Far? (n.d.). Retrieved June 23, 2016, from NPR.org website: http://www.npr.org/sections/goatsandsoda/2015/09/30/439162849/at-what-point-does-a-fundraising-ad-go-too-far

Axelrod, T. (2000). *Raising More Money: A Step-by-Step Guide to Building Life Long Donors*. Seattle, WA: Beveon Publications.

Baltodano, M. P. (2017). The power brokers of neoliberalism: Philanthrocapitalists and public education. *Policy Futures in Education*, *15*(2), 141–156. https://doi.org/10.1177/1478210316652008

Bassett, Bro. R. (1995). Poor. *Lasallian Themes*, *2*, 136–146.

Bates, E. A., McCann, J. J., Kaye, L. K., & Taylor, J. C. (2017). "Beyond words": A researcher's guide to using photo elicitation in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, *14*(4), 459–481. https://doi.org/10.1080/14780887.2017.1359352

Bay Area Women's and Children's Center. (n.d.). History: Creation of the Tenderloin School. Retrieved December 19, 2019, from https://www.bawcc.org/creating_school/

Bell, D. A. (1980). Brown v. Board of Education and the Interest-Convergence Dilemma. *Harvard Law Review*, *93*(3), 518. https://doi.org/10.2307/1340546

Bell, D. A. (1995). Who's Afraid of Critical Race Theory. *University of Illinois Law Review*, (Issue 4), 893.

Berg, G. A. (2010). *Low-Income Students and the Perpetuation of Inequality: Higher Education in America*. Retrieved from http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/usflibrary-ebooks/detail.action?docID=483652

Bhati, A. (2018). *Market, Gender, and Race: Representations of Poor People in Fundraising Materials Used by International Nongovernmental Organizations (INGOs)* (Ph.D., University of Nebraska at Omaha). Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/pqdtglobal/docview/2089465041/abstract/F1E78AF5354E4309PQ/1

Bhati, A., & Eikenberry, A. M. (2016). Faces of the needy: The portrayal of destitute children in the fundraising campaigns of NGOs in India. *International Journal of Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Marketing*, *21*(1), 31–42. https://doi.org/10.1002/nvsm.1542

Bishop, M. (2007, March). What is philanthrocapitalism? Retrieved September 3, 2019, from Alliance magazine website: https://www.alliancemagazine.org/feature/what-is-philanthrocapitalism/

Bissell, S., Manderson, L., & Allotey, P. (2000). In focus: Film, focus groups and working children in Bangladesh. *Visual Anthropology*, *13*(2), 169–183. https://doi.org/10.1080/08949468.2000.9966796

Bobbitt, D. (2011). Teaching McLuhan: Understanding Understanding Media | enculturation. Retrieved November 21, 2018, from http://enculturation.net/teaching-mcluhan

Bonglia, J.-P. K. (2010). Identifying Successful Advancement Approaches in Four Catholic Universities: The Effectiveness of the Four Advancement Models of Communication. *Journal of Catholic Higher Education*, *29*(2), 195–213. (Association of Catholic Colleges and Universities. 1 Dupont Circle Suite 650,

Washington, DC 20036. Tel: 202-457-0650; Fax: 202-728-0977; e-mail: accu@accunet.org; Web site: http://www.accunet.org).

Bradley Hagerty, B. (2012). Sisters And Vatican II: A Generational Tug Of War. Retrieved June 5, 2019, from NPR.org website: https://www.npr.org/2012/10/10/162650803/sisters-and-vatican-ii-a-generational-tug-of-war

Breeze, B., & Dean, J. (2012). Pictures of me: User views on their representation in homelessness fundraising appeals. *International Journal of Nonprofit & Voluntary Sector Marketing*, *17*(2), 132–143. https://doi.org/10.1002/nvsm.1417

Brinig, M. F., & Garnett, N. S. (2010). Catholic Schools, Urban Neighborhoods, and Education Reform. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1395676

Brothers of the Christian Schools. (n.d.b). Saint Miguel Febres Cordero | La Salle.org. Retrieved July 8, 2019, from https://www.lasalle.org/en/who-are-we/lasallian-holiness/saint-miguel-febres-cordero/

Brothers of the Christian Schools. (n.d.a). St. John Baptist de La Salle | La Salle.org. Retrieved June 27, 2016, from De La Salle Brothers, La Salle Worldwide website: http://www.lasalle.org/en/who-are-we/st-john-baptist-de-la-salle/

Brothers of the Christian Schools. (1987). *The Rule of the Brothers of the Christian Schools*. Retrieved from http://www.lasalle.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/institucionales/fsc_rule.pdf

Brothers of the Christian Schools. (1997). *The Brother of the Christian Schools in the World Today: The Declaration*. Retrieved from https://www.lasallian.info/wp-content/uploads/2012/08/The_Declaration_Revised_English_Translation_1997.pdf

Brothers of the Christian Schools. (2014). The Lasallian Mission and the 5 Core Principles. Retrieved October 29, 2018, from http://www.delasalle.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/The-Lasallian-Mission-and-the-5-Core-Principles.pdf

Brown, A. (2015). *A Good Investment? Philanthropy and the Marketing of Race in an Urban Public School*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Bryk, A. S., & Schneider, B. L. (2002). *Trust in schools: A core resource for improvement*. New York : Russell Sage Foundation, [2002]. (Gleeson Stacks LB2862 .B79 2002).

Burt, C., & Strongman, K. (2005). *Use of Images in Charity Advertising: Improving Donations and Compliance Rates*. *8*(8), 10.

Caldwell, V. F., & Crenshaw, K. W. (1996). Critical Race Theory: The Key Writings That Formed the Movement. *Columbia Law Review*, *96*(5), 1363. https://doi.org/10.2307/1123408

California State University, Fresno, USA, Singh, J., & Calvarese, M. (2016). Revitalization Efforts in San Francisco: An Urban History Case Study of San Francisco's Tenderloin District. *Journal of Social Sciences (COES&RJ-JSS)*, *5*(2), 104–129. https://doi.org/10.25255/jss.2016.5.2.104.129

Capelle, N. (2003). *Lasallian Educational Innovations* (No. 243). Retrieved from http://www.lasalle.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/boletin/248_bulletin_en.pdf

Carter, P. L. (2006). Straddling boundaries: Identity, culture, and school. *Dépasser Les Frontières : L'identité, La Culture, et l'école*, (4), 304.

Chapman, T. K., & Donnor, J. K. (2015). Critical Race Theory and the Proliferation of U.S. Charter Schools. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, *48*(1), 137–157. https://doi.org/10.1080/10665684.2015.991670

Cherry, K. (2019). Industry vs. Inferiority Is Stage Four of Psychosocial Development. Retrieved January 3, 2020, from Verywell Mind website: https://www.verywellmind.com/industry-versus-inferiority-2795736

Christian Brothers Service. (n.d.). Coming to North America. Retrieved August 26, 2019, from https://www.cbservices.org/history/America/index.php

Çobanoğlu, R., & Engi˙n Demi˙r, C. (2014). The Visible Side of the Hidden Curriculum in Schools. *Okullardaki Örtük Programın Görünen Kısmı*., *13*(3), 776–786.

Collier, J., Jr., & Collier, M. (1986). *Visual anthropology: Photography as a research method* (Revised and expanded edition.). University of New Mexico Press. (Gleeson Stacks GN347 .C64 1986).

Congregation for Catholic Education. (1988). The Religious Dimension of Education in a Catholic School: Guidelines for Reflection and Renewal. Retrieved October 29, 2018, from http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/ccatheduc/documents/rc_con_ccatheduc_doc_19880407_catholic-school_en.html

Congregation for Catholic EducationA. (1997). The Catholic School on the Threshold of the Third Millennium. Retrieved March 13, 2019, from http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/ccatheduc/documents/rc_con_ccatheduc_doc_27041998_school2000_en.html

Cross, T., Bazron, B., Dennis, K., & Isaacs, M. (1989). *Towards a Culturally Competent System of Care: A Monograph on Effective Services for Minority Children Who Are Severely Emotionally Disturbed*. Retrieved from Georgetown University Child Development Center website: https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED330171.pdf

Daniels, M. (2015, June 8). The Impact of Partnerships: One School's Realization of Community. Retrieved from Independent Ideas Blog of the National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS) website: http://www.nais.org/Independent-Ideas/Lists/Posts/Post.aspx?ID=435

De La Salle, J. B. (2007). *Meditations* (A. Loes, FSC & F. Huether, FSC, Eds.; R. Arnandez, FSC & A. Loes, FSC, Trans.). Retrieved from https://www.lasallian.info/wp-content/uploads/2012/12/Meditations-2007.pdf

De Marillac Academy. (n.d.a). Our History. Retrieved December 8, 2019, from https://demarillac.org/about/our-history/

De Marillac Academy. (n.d.b.). Results. Retrieved December 20, 2019, from https://demarillac.org/about/results/

De Marillac Academy. (2018). Mission & Vision. Retrieved November 22, 2018, from De Marillac Academy website: https://demarillac.org/about/mission/

De Marillac Academy, an oasis in SF's Tenderloin—SFGate. (2010, December 5). Retrieved December 10, 2019, from SF Gate website: https://www.sfgate.com/opinion/article/De-Marillac-Academy-an-oasis-in-SF-s-Tenderloin-2527226.php

De Marillac Academy B. (n.d.c). Students, Graduates, & Families. Retrieved June 4, 2019, from https://demarillac.org/about/demographics/

Delgado Bernal, D., Lynn, M., Yosso, T. J., Solorzano, D. G., & Parker, L. (2002). Critical Race Theory, Latino Critical Theory, and Critical Raced-Gendered Epistemologies: Recognizing Students of Color as Holders and Creators of Knowledge. *Critical Race Theory and Qualitative Research*, *8*(1), 105–126.

Der, H. (2004). Resegregation and Achievement Gap: Challenges to San Francisco School Desegregation. *Berkeley Women's Law Journal*, *19*(2), 308–316.

Dika, S. L., & Singh, K. (2002). Applications of Social Capital in Educational Literature: A Critical Synthesis. *Review of Educational Research*, *72*(1), 31–60. https://doi.org/10.3102/00346543072001031

Disadvantaged. In The Merriam-Webster.com Dictionary. (n.d.). Retrieved December 30, 2019, from https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/disadvantaged

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (2011). *De Marillac Academy*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QXi7YVIioK4

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-a). *"Choice" by Rafael Bautista. 2016 Annual Scholarship Benefit*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KLM3sRPj3eE&index=27&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-b). *Dream*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ulc6MPFhqGo

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-c). *Episode 1—"The Tenderloin"*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lwci_0NUz3g&index=40&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-d). *Episode 2—Student Learning Expectations*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RsAVFhpb-K0&index=39&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-e). *Episode 4—Annual Scholarship Benefit Invite 2016*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=i1d-ZzNcH_w&index=37&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-f). *Episode 5 // DMA Partners // Twitter*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=J3CS7DVSXJc&index=36&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-g). *Episode 6 // Perseverance // Wax Museum Project*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0z8crKYInYg&index=35&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-h). *Episode 7 // De Marillac Academy—Annual Scholarship Benefit Video*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kJO2lEhLjkw

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-i). *Episode 8 // Tenderloin Neighborhood Partnerships*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=v92NDjDn4ec&index=32&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-j). *Episode 9 // Digital Literacy Program*. Retrieved from

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=j7oTgND5yaM&index=31&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-k). *Episode 10 // Angelica's Story // Support*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B6ETP1BhlGM&index=30&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-l). *Episode 11 // 2016 Graduation Interviews // De Marillac Academy*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=urGt885HaDk&index=29&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-m). *Episode 12 // De Marillac Academy Art Teacher Interview*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7BnLq8foDhI&index=26&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-n). *Episode 13 // Art Student Feature*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r24n6sGAST0&index=24&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-o). *Episode 14 // Donor Highlight—The O'Shea Foundation*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=km-1abGpr_U&index=23&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-p). *Episode 15 // Play*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KS8zq9Jo1KU&index=22&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-q). *Episode 16 // Home*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-OB6m9pLsW8&index=21&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-r). *Episode 20 // Come Visit*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AWn1MwQIzq8&index=18&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-s). *Episode 23 // Gratitude*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=86yjI4In7C4&index=15&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-t). *Episode 24 // Gift to the World*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZPEbqPIeKyM&index=14&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-u). *Episode 25 // New Year's Resolutions*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Rd0NwocGx4U&index=13&list=UUZ6bEOOpDm8WeFNjB_G9n7A

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-v). *Episode 26 // Anthology*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qi5VDI5SNKQ

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-w). *Episode 27 // Dreams*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=reIjd18zKCg

DMA DeMarillacAcademy. (n.d.-x). *Episode 28 // Zendesk Partnership*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gPoBsyB99go

Driver, J. (2011). Rethinking the Interest-Convergence Thesis. *NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW*, 50.

Dunnigan, F. (2018). Streetwise: San Francisco Catholic Schools. Retrieved December 19, 2019, from Western Neighborhoods Project website: http://www.outsidelands.org/streetwise-catholic-schools.php

Ebede, S. (2018). Students' Perception of Fundraising Through Personal Solicitation. *Journal of Nonprofit Education and Leadership*, *8*(3), 322–329. https://doi.org/10.18666/JNEL-2018-V8-I3-9136

Echeverría, B. Á. R. (2003). *Pastoral Letter: Associated with the God of the Poor*. Brothers of the Christian Schools.

Eikenberry, A., & Bhati, A. (2019). *A Critical Fundraising Perspective: Understanding the Beneficiary Experience*.

Emdin, C. (n.d.). *For White Folks Who Teach in the Hood...and the Rest of Y'all Too: Reality Pedagogy and Urban Education*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Evans, K. N. P. M. (2012). *The Medium is the Motivation: Understanding the Role of Media Messaging in Individual Charitable Giving* (Ph.D., University of Connecticut). Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/pqdtglobal/docview/1095378589/abstract/D053089B5C104DF4PQ/1

Fabiano FSC, Br. J. (2019, December 9). *How Did DMA start?*

*Federal Poverty Level*. (2019). Retrieved from https://www.healthcare.gov/glossary/federal-poverty-level-fpl/

Feinberg, W., & Soltis, J. F. (2009). *School and Society* (Fifth). New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

Fenzel, L. M. (2009a). Effective alternative urban middle schools: Findings from research on NativityMiguel schools. *Middle Grades Research Journal*, *4*(3), 1–17.

Fenzel, L. M. (2009b). *Improving Urban Middle Schools: Lessons from the Nativity Schools*. SUNY Press.

Fenzel, L. M., & Deal, D. (2003, April). *A National Evaluation of the Success of an Alternative Middle School Model for Urban Children of Color*. Retrieved from https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED482421.pdf

Fenzel, L. M., & Monteith, R. H. (2008). Successful Alternative Middle Schools for Urban Minority Children: A Study of Nativity Schools. *Journal of Education for Students Placed at Risk (JESPAR)*, *13*(4), 381–401. https://doi.org/10.1080/10824660802427686

Fenzel, L. M., & Wyttenbach, M. (2018). *Responding to the Call for Educational Justice: Transformative Catholic-Led Initiatives in Urban Education*. IAP.

Fenzel, M., & Helfelbein, R. (2019). Introduction. In *Responding to the Call for Educational Justice: Transformative Catholic-Led Initiatives in Urban Education* (p. 229). IAP.

Formula for Success. (n.d.). Retrieved March 15, 2019, from De Marillac Academy website: https://demarillac.org/programs/formula-for-success/

Freedom To Learn Project. (2015). *Professor Michael Apple. The Tasks of the Critical Scholar/Activist in Education*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7XhtsoHMJ5Q

Frumkin, P. (2010). Strategic Giving: The Art and Science of Philanthropy. Retrieved March 17, 2019, from http://eds.a.ebscohost.com/eds/ebookviewer/ebook/bmxlYmtfXzI2MDUxMV9fQU41?sid=beb49f7f-e7af-4d81-8fdb-47a4532a09f4@sessionmgr4007&vid=0&format=EB&rid=1

Garcia, K. (2002, January 25). School opens to offer hope in Tenderloin. Retrieved December 10, 2019, from SFGate website: https://www.sfgate.com/bayarea/article/School-opens-to-offer-hope-in-Tenderloin-2879565.php

Giroux, H. A. 1, & Penna, A. N. 2. (1979). Social Education in the Classroom: The Dynamics of the Hidden Curriculum. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, *7*(1), 21–42. https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.1979.10506048

Giroux, H. A., & Purpel, D. E. (1983). *The Hidden curriculum and moral education: Deception or discovery?* Berkeley, Calif. : McCutchan Pub. Corp., [1983]. (Gleeson Stacks LC311 .H5 1983).

Goessling, K. P. (2018). Increasing the Depth of Field: Critical Race Theory and Photovoice as Counter Storytelling Praxis. *The Urban Review*, *50*(4), 648–674. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-018-0460-2

Goldkind, L. (2016). Fundraising for Social Justice: Securing Resources for Just Causes. In E. P. Congress, A. Luks, & F. Petit (Eds.), *Nonprofit Management* (1st ed.). https://doi.org/10.1891/9780826127389.0008

Goldschmidt, E. P., & Walsh, M. E. (2011). *An Examination of Governance Models and Funding Strategies*. 88.

Goldschmidt, E. P., & Walsh, M. E. (2013). *Urban Catholic Elementary Schools: What are the Governance Models?* 26.

Goodwin, E. A., Pusateri, P. A., & Clark, H. E. (2014). *NativityMiguel model schools' leader perceptions: A study of the challenges encountered by volunteer teachers and the strategies used to address these challenges* (Ed.D., Saint Louis University). Retrieved from http://0-search.proquest.com.ignacio.usfca.edu/pqdtglobal/docview/1658058464/abstract/B8D7759AA6A34E4BPQ/3

Gould, M., & Howson, A. (2019). Erikson's Eight Stages of Development. In *Salem Press Encyclopedia*. Great Neck Publishing.

Goyette, L. (2006). *The San Miguel School Providence.* Unpublished manuscript, Manhattan College, NY.

Grace, G. R. (2002). *Catholic Schools: Mission, Markets, and Morality*. Retrieved from http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&AuthType=sso&db=nlebk&AN=84032&site=eds-live&scope=site&custid=s3818721

Grant, J. F. (2008). *A model that addresses at-risk students: A Jesuit academy* (Ed.D., The George Washington University). Retrieved from http://0-search.proquest.com.ignacio.usfca.edu/pqdtglobal/docview/304641743/abstract/B8D7759AA6A34E4BPQ/4

Greeley, A. M., & Rossi, P. H. (1966). *The education of Catholic Americans*. Aldine. (Gleeson Stacks LC501 .G7).

Grieken, G. V. (1999). *Touching the Hearts of Students: Characteristics of Lasallian Schools*. George Van Grieken FSC.

Hamilton, S. W. (2008). *Who Will Save America's Urban Catholic Schools?* Retrieved from https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED500901

Harper, D. (1986). Meaning and work: A study in photo elicitation. *Current Sociology*, *34*(3), 24–46.

Harper, D. (2002). Talking about pictures: A case for photo elicitation. *Visual Studies*, (1), 13. https://doi.org/10.1080/14725860220137345

Harro, R. L. (2008). *Cycle of Socialization: Readings for Diversity and Social Justice.* Amherst, MA: Diversity Works.

Hébert, T. P. (2018). An Examination of High-Achieving First-Generation College Students From Low-Income Backgrounds. *Gifted Child Quarterly*, *62*(1), 96–110. https://doi.org/10.1177/0016986217738051

Hibbert, S., Smith, A., Davies, A., & Ireland, F. (2007). Guilt appeals: Persuasion knowledge and charitable giving. *Psychology & Marketing*, *24*(8), 723–742. https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20181

Hites, S. (2019). Between Social Duty and the Greed of Giving: On Philanthrocapitalism and Gift-Patriotism. *Comparative Literature Studies*, *56*(3), 469–486.

Human Dignity. (n.d.). Retrieved June 20, 2019, from Catholic Social Teaching website: https://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/themes/human-dignity/

Jacobs, T. (n.d.). How to Design an Effective Plea for Donations. Retrieved November 23, 2018, from Pacific Standard website: https://psmag.com/social-justice/design-effective-plea-donations-84304

Jay, M. (2003). Critical Race Theory, Multicultural Education, and the Hidden Curriculum of Hegemony. *Multicultural Perspectives*, *5*(4), 3–9. https://doi.org/10.1207/S15327892MCP0504_2

Johnston, J. (1999). *Pastoral letter: On the defense of children, the reign of God, and the Lasallian mission*. Brothers of the Christian Schools.

Joslyn, H. (2016). The Scramble to Hire Big-Gift Fundraisers. *Chronicle of Philanthropy*, *28*(5), 26.

Kenny, T. (2017, June 17). I was a poor kid at a wealthy private school. It gave me social mobility, but also a sense of shame. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/education/2017/jun/18/i-was-a-poor-kid-at-a-wealthy-private-school-it-gave-me-social-mobility-but-also-a-sense-of-shame

Kentli, F. D. (2009). Hidden curriculum. *European Journal of Educational Studies*, 6.

Kohli, Rita. (2008). *Breaking the cycle of racism in the classroom critical race reflections of women of color educators /.*

Ladson-Billings, G., & Tate, W. F. (1995). Toward a Critical Race Theory of Education. *Teachers College Record*, *97*(1), 22.

Lapenta, F. (2018). *The SAGE Handbook of Visual Research Methods* (By pages 201-213). https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446268278

Levin, B., levin@cc. umanitoba. ca. (2000). Putting Students at the Centre in Education Reform. *Journal of Educational Change*, *1*(2), 155–172.

Liamputtong, P. (2011). *Focus Group Methodology: Principle and Practice*. SAGE.

Liebenberg, L., Ungar, M., & Theron, L. (2014). Using video observation and photo elicitation interviews to understand obscured processes in the lives of youth resilience. *Childhood*, *21*(4), 532–547. https://doi.org/10.1177/0907568213496652

Makris, M. V., & Brown, E. (2017). School development in urban gentrifying spaces: Developers supporting schools or schools supporting developers? *Journal of Urban Affairs*, *0*(0), 1–24. https://doi.org/10.1080/07352166.2017.1360735

Manzo, K. (2008). Imaging Humanitarianism: NGO Identity and the Iconography of Childhood. *Antipode*, *40*(4), 632–657. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8330.2008.00627.x

Marx, J. D. (2000). Online Fundraising in the Human Services. *Journal of Technology in Human Services*, *17*(2–3), 137–152. https://doi.org/10.1300/J017v17n02_03

Massingale, B. N. (2010). *Racial Justice and the Catholic Church*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books.

McLuhan, M. (1997). Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man. Retrieved June 27, 2016, from http://eds.a.ebscohost.com/eds/ebookviewer/ebook/bmxlYmtfXzYxMTY0N19fQU41?sid=8691485d-6309-484b-93ec-5467c34509c9@sessionmgr4002&vid=15&format=EK&rid=1

Mejia-Garcia, A. (2015). *Current Poverties in Lasallian Schools: Increasing Intercultural Sensitivity and Empathy* (M.Ed., Saint Mary's College of California). Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/pqdtglobal/docview/2084141912/abstract/F7F6EA46138943ADPQ/20

Merchant, A., Ford, J. B., & Sargeant, A. (2010). Charitable organizations' storytelling influence on donors' emotions and intentions. *Journal of Business Research*, *63*(7), 754–762. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2009.05.013

Metaperceptions: How Do You See Yourself? (n.d.). Retrieved February 6, 2019, from Psychology Today website: http://www.psychologytoday.com/articles/200505/metaperceptions-how-do-you-see-yourself

Meyer, P. (2008). Independent Networks: NativityMiguel & Cristo Rey. *Who Will Save America's Urban Catholic Schools?* Retrieved from https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED500901

Meyer, P. (2011). Catholic Ethos, Public Education. *Education Next*, *11*(2), 40–48.

Morton, J. M. (2014). Cultural Code-Switching: Straddling the Achievement Gap. *Journal of Political Philosophy*, *22*(3), 259–281. https://doi.org/10.1111/jopp.12019

Nativity Miguel Coalition | Cornelia Connelly Center. (n.d.). Retrieved June 21, 2016, from http://www.connellycenter.org/node/1334

NativityMiguel Coalition. (2014a). *Common Alignment of Member Schools*. Retrieved from https://nativitymigueldotorg.files.wordpress.com/2014/11/membership-identity-2-0.pdf

NativityMiguel Coalition. (2014b). Our Member Schools. Retrieved June 4, 2019, from https://nativitymigueldotorg.wordpress.com/our-member-schools/

NativityMiguel Coalition. (2015). Our Results. Retrieved November 17, 2018, from NativityMiguel Coalition website: https://nativitymigueldotorg.wordpress.com/our-results/

NativityMiguel Coalition. (2018). *NMC Data Dashboard 2017-18*. Retrieved from https://nativitymigueldotorg.files.wordpress.com/2018/11/nativitymiguel-coalition-dd-17-18.pdf

NCEA. (2017). *Catholic School Data At A Glance*. Retrieved from http://usccb.org/beliefs-and-teachings/how-we-teach/catholic-education/k-12/upload/2017_infographic.pdf

Nonprofit Photography: Ethics and Approaches. (n.d.). Retrieved June 23, 2016, from https://www.hatchforgood.org/explore/102/nonprofit-photography-ethics-and-approaches

Oates, M. J. (1995). *The Catholic philanthropic tradition in America*. Retrieved from http://0-search.ebscohost.com.ignacio.usfca.edu/login.aspx?direct=true&db=cat00548a&AN=iusf.b2056853&site=eds-live&scope=site

O'Mara, K. (2018, May 3). Why Hasn't the Tenderloin Gentrified Like the Rest of San Francisco? Retrieved December 8, 2019, from KQED website: https://www.kqed.org/news/11665527/why-hasnt-the-tenderloin-gentrified-like-the-rest-of-san-francisco

Ostrander, S. A., & Schervish, P. G. (1990). Giving and Getting: Philanthropy as a Social Relation. In J. Van Til (Ed.), *Critical Issues in American Philanthropy* (pp. 67–98). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Ove, P. (2013). *"Change a life. Change your own": Child sponsorship, the discourse of development, and the production of ethical subjects* (University of British

Columbia). Retrieved from https://open.library.ubc.ca/cIRcle/collections/ubctheses/24/items/1.0073653

Paul VI. (1965a). Gaudium et spes. Retrieved February 23, 2019, from http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_const_19651207_gaudium-et-spes_en.html

Paul VI. (1965b). Gravissimum educationis: Declaration on Christian education. Retrieved October 29, 2018, from http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_decl_19651028_gravissimum-educationis_en.html

Pink, editor. ), Sara. (2009). *Visual interventions: Applied visual anthropology* (First paperback edition). Retrieved from https://trove.nla.gov.au/version/249621051

Plagens, G. K. (2011). Social Capital and Education: Implications for Student and School Performance. *Education and Culture*, *27*(1), 40–64. https://doi.org/10.1353/eac.2011.0007

Podsiadlo, J. J. 1, & Philliber, W. W. 2, billpra@compuserve. com. (2003). The Nativity Mission Center:A Successful Approach to the Education of Latino Boys. *Journal of Education for Students Placed at Risk*, *8*(4), 419.

*Preserving a Critical National Asset: America's Disadvantaged Students and the Crisis in Faith-based Urban Schools*. (2008). Retrieved from https://www2.ed.gov/admins/comm/choice/faithbased/report.pdf

Proehl, R. A., Ayon, L., Braganza, D., & Sosa, G. A. (2017). De Marillac Academy: Perseverance, Purpose, and Promise. *Journal of Catholic Education*, 111–137. https://doi.org/10.15365/joce.2101062017

Proehl, R. A., Starnes, H., & Everett, S. (2015). Catalyst Schools: The Catholic Ethos and Public Charter Schools. *Journal of Catholic Education*, *18*(2). (Loyola Marymount University. School of Education 1 LMU Drive, University Hall Suite 1760, Los Angles, CA 90045. e-mail: catholicedjournal@lmu.edu; Web site: http://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/ce).

Proehl, R. A., & Suzuki, S. (2009). Transferring Social Justice Initiatives into Lasallian Schools. *Journal of Catholic Education*, *12*(4). https://doi.org/10.15365/joce.1204032013

Quirk, M. (2010). *A Comparative Study of the Impact of Charitable Donations on the Financial Viability of San Miguel Model Schools*. Retrieved from http://via.library.depaul.edu/soe_etd/40/

Rector-Aranda, A. (2016). *School Norms and Reforms, Critical Race Theory, and the Fairytale of Equitable Education*. 17.

Ribay, R. (2019). *Patron Saints of Nothing*. Penguin.

Rich, M. (2015, April 11). Where Are the Teachers of Color? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/2015/04/12/sunday-review/where-are-the-teachers-of-color.html

Roy, J. C. (2008). *Meaning-making in an urban middle school: A study of relational trust and social capital* (Ph.D., Boston College). Retrieved from http://search.proquest.com/docview/304690856/abstract/7D5ADD9B41284DCBPQ/1

Saint Jean-Baptiste de La Salle | French educator. (n.d.). Retrieved August 5, 2019, from Encyclopedia Britannica website: https://www.britannica.com/biography/Saint-Jean-Baptiste-de-La-Salle

Salm, L. (2002). *Rule and foundational documents*. Landover, Md: Lasallian Publications/Christian Brothers Conference.

San Francisco Landmark #172: Saint Boniface Church. (n.d.). Retrieved December 19, 2019, from https://webcache.googleusercontent.com/search?q=cache:qtrLW_iTAd8J:https://noehill.com/sf/landmarks/sf172.asp+&cd=4&hl=en&ct=clnk&gl=us

SanMiguelProv. (n.d.). *More Than a School*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AAi0PcHe4QM

Saroki, S., & Levenick, C. (2009). *Saving America's Urban Catholic Schools*. 146.

Schackmuth, K. (2012). *An exploration of the experiences of first-generation college students in Lasallian higher education* (Ph.D., Loyola University Chicago). Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/pqdtglobal/docview/1082028822/abstract/F7F6EA46138943ADPQ/28

Sewell, W. H., & Hauser, R. M. (1980). *The Wisconsin Longitudinal Study of Social and Psychological Factors in Aspirations and Achievements** (1st ed.). United States, North America.

Shanahan, K. J., Hopkins, C. D., Carlson, L., & Raymond, M. A. (2012). Depictions of Self-Inflicted Versus Blameless Victims for Nonprofits Employing Print Advertisements. *Journal of Advertising*, *41*(3), 55–74.

Shaw, R. (2015). *The Tenderloin: Sex, crime, and resistance in the heart of San Francisco*. Urban Reality Press. (Gleeson Stacks F869.69.T46 S539 2015).

Shields, S., Terrence. (2017). Sharing Generosity in the Tenderloin. Retrieved November 17, 2018, from NativityMiguel Coalition website: https://nativitymigueldotorg.wordpress.com/2017/06/01/sharing-generosity-in-the-tenderloin/

Shields, T. (2003, November). Priority to the Poor: The schools of San Miguel in the United States. Retrieved April 21, 2017, from http://www.lasalle.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/mel/cahier_mel/07cahier_mel_en.pdf

Shields, T. (2006, Fall). Miguel Schools Team Up with Nativity. *De La Salle Today*, *II*(2). Retrieved from http://lasallian.info/doc/dlstodayall.pdf

Signs of Faith—Winter 2000—Brother Visitor's Letter. (2000). Retrieved June 27, 2016, from John Baptist de La Salle: His Life and Times website: https://web.archive.org/web/20120717090611/http://delasalle.org/resources/resources-signs-of-faith/sof_fall00/f00life.htm

slacktivist. (2014, June 26). Charitable fundraising: Wise as serpents, innocent as doves. Retrieved November 23, 2018, from Slacktivist website: https://www.patheos.com/blogs/slacktivist/2014/06/26/charitable-fundraising-wise-as-serpents-innocent-as-doves/

Slawson, N. (2016, March 22). Schoolkids challenge charities' "undignified" images of children. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from http://www.theguardian.com/voluntary-sector-network/2016/mar/22/schoolchildren-campaign-stop-charities-emotive-images-advertising

Smith, J. A., & Osborn, M. (2015). Interpretative phenomenological analysis as a useful methodology for research on the lived experience of pain. *British Journal of Pain*, *9*(1), 41–42. https://doi.org/10.1177/2049463714541642

Solórzano, D. G. (1998). Critical race theory, race and gender microaggressions, and the experience of Chicana and Chicano scholars. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, *11*(1), 121–136. https://doi.org/10.1080/095183998236926

Solórzano, D. G., & Yosso, T. J. (2002). Critical Race Methodology: Counter-Storytelling as an Analytical Framework for Education Research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *8*(1), 22.

Stann, K. (2006, Fall). *Advancing the Mission*. *II*(2), 4–5.

Stanton-Salazar, R. D. (1997). A social capital framework for understanding the socialization of racial minority children and youths. *Harvard Educational Review*, (1), 1.

Stanton-Salazar, R. D. (2011). A Social Capital Framework for the Study of Institutional Agents and Their Role in the Empowerment of Low-Status Students and Youth. *Youth & Society*, *43*(3), 1066–1109. https://doi.org/10.1177/0044118X10382877

Status and Trends in the Education of Racial and Ethnic Minorities. (2009). Retrieved from National Center for Education Statistics website: https://nces.ed.gov/pubs2010/2010015/indicator2_7.asp#5

Teicher, J. G. (2012). Why Is Vatican II So Important? Retrieved June 4, 2019, from NPR.org website: https://www.npr.org/2012/10/10/162573716/why-is-vatican-ii-so-important

Tempel, E. R., Aldrich, E. E., Seiler, T. L., & Burlingame, D. F. (2015). *Achieving Excellence in Fundraising*. Retrieved from http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/usflibrary-ebooks/detail.action?docID=4189539

The Bay Area Women's and Children's Center. (2016). Survey of Tenderloin Family and Children's Issues Summary Report. Retrieved December 13, 2019, from https://www.bawcc.org/pdf/Survey_of_TL_Family_and_Children's_Issues_2016.pdf

Tickle, S. (2017). Ethnographic research with young people: Methods and rapport. *Qualitative Research Journal*, *17*(2), 66–76. https://doi.org/10.1108/QRJ-10-2016-0059

Úcar Martínez, X., Jiménez-Morales, M., Soler Masó, P., & Trilla Bernet, J. (2017). Exploring the conceptualization and research of empowerment in the field of youth. *International Journal of Adolescence and Youth*, *22*(4), 405–418. https://doi.org/10.1080/02673843.2016.1209120

UN General Assembly. (1948). *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*. Retrieved from https://www.ohchr.org/EN/UDHR/Documents/UDHR_Translations/eng.pdf

Ungvarsky, J. (2018). Interpretative phenomenological analysis. *Salem Press Encyclopedia*.

United States Conference of Catholic Bishops. (2018). Call to Family Community and Participation. Retrieved November 24, 2018, from http://www.usccb.org/beliefs-and-teachings/what-we-believe/catholic-social-teaching/call-to-family-community-and-participation.cfm

Walch, T. (2016). *Parish School: A History of American Catholic Parochial Education from Colonial Times to the Present*. Arlington, VA: NCEA.

Wardle, F. (1995). *How Young Children Build Images of Themselves*. 4.

Warrington, S., & Crombie, J. (2017). *The People in the Pictures: Vital perspectives on Save the Children's image making* (p. 49). Retrieved from Save the Children website: https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/sites/default/files/documents/the_people_in_the_pictures.pdf

Watson, L., & Hoefer, R. (2014). *Developing Nonprofit and Human Service Leaders: Essential Knowledge and Skills*. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781483388007

Waymark, B. (2015). *Exploring photo-elicitation as a research method for teachers conducting research in their own institution: A case-study at St, Agnes' School* (Phd, University of Southampton). Retrieved from https://eprints.soton.ac.uk/376645/

When a School Markets Students as Charity Cases. (2015, September 16). Retrieved October 10, 2018, from Tiny Spark website: https://tinyspark.org/podcasts/when-a-school-markets-students-as-charity-cases/

When Effective Fundraising Means Reinforcing Negative Stereotypes. (n.d.). Retrieved June 23, 2016, from Best practices, tips and fundraising ideas for nonprofits website: https://www.classy.org/blog/when-effective-fundraising-means-reinforcing-negative-stereotypes/

Wiles, R., Prosser, J., Bagnoli, A., Clark, A., Davies, K., Holland, S., & Renold, E. (n.d.). *Visual Ethics: Ethical Issues in Visual Research*. 43.

Wilson, T. S., & Carlsen, R. L. (2016). School Marketing as a Sorting Mechanism: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Charter School Websites. *Peabody Journal of Education*, *91*(1), 24–46. https://doi.org/10.1080/0161956X.2016.1119564

Yosso, T.J. (2005). Whose culture has capital? Race, Ethnicity and Education, 8(1), pp. 69–91

Youth Activism Project. (2018). Youth Participatory Action Research Toolkit. Retrieved December 20, 2019, from Youth Activism Project website: https://youthactivismproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/Youth-Activism-Project-YPAR-Guide.pdf

# APPENDICES

## APPENDIX A- Mission and Vision of De Marillac Academy

### Mission

Inspired by the Daughters of Charity and De La Salle Christian Brothers, De Marillac Academy provides a life-changing, accessible Catholic educational experience for the underserved children, youth and families of the Tenderloin and surrounding communities.

### Vision

At De Marillac Academy, we believe that neighborhood of residence and socioeconomic status should not determine a child's access to a quality education or ultimate success in life. De Marillac's holistic program liberates students and graduates to lead lives of choice, meaning and purpose. Every day, De Marillac Academy unites philanthropists with low-income families to break the cycle of poverty through education.

# APPENDIX B

## Schools in NativityMiguel Coalition Advancement Practices: Data gathered from school websites on open web 2019

| School | Location | Religious Affiliation | Founded | Size | Grade Levels | Per pupil expenditure/ year | Events | Media feat. Students |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Anna Julia Cooper Episcopal School | Richmond, VA | Episcopal | 2009 | 108 | 4-8 | 14K | Unknown | https://annajuliacooperepiscopalschool.org/news/videos.php |
| Brooklyn Jesuit Prep | Brooklyn, NY | Catholic - Jesuit | 2003 | 88 | 5-8 | Unknown | Auction and Fundraiser, | Unknown |
| Cornelia Connelly Center | New York, NY | Catholic | 1993 | Unknown | 4-8 | $7.5K | Anniversary Gala, Auction for Action | Unknown |
| Covenant Prep | Hartford, CT | Unknown | 2008 | 60 | 5-8 | $20K | Unknown | Unknown |
| De La Salle School | Freeport, NY | Catholic-Lasallian | Unknown | Unknown | Unknown | Unknown | Spring Gala, Christmas Fundraiser, | Unknown |

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| De Marillac Academy | San Francisco, CA | Catholic-Lasallian & Vincentian | 2001 | 120 | 4-8 | $15K | Annual Scholarship Benefit, Trivioke | https://demarillac.org/stories/ |
| Durham Nativity School | Durham, NC | Catholic | 2002 | Unknown | 6-8 | Unknown | Spring Event | https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCn2BT2XbalwtZjPol5JV1dA |
| Epiphany | Dorchester, MA | Episcopal | Unknown | Unknown | Middle | Unknown | Spring Gala, Sunday in the School Yard | Unknown |
| Escuela de Guadalupe | Denver, CO | Catholic | 1999 | Unknown | K-5 | ~12.5K | Salud! (scholarship benefit) | https://www.escuelaguadalupe.org/our-school?wix-vod-video-id=de0ecd6ac5ac4912b7594e7038ca00d1&wix-vod-comp-id=comp-j3x469vn# |
| Esperanza Academy | Lawrence, MA | Episcopal | 2006 | 60 | 5-8 | $6K | Sponsor Appreciation Events, Breakfast at Fenway Park, Harvest of Hope | Unknown |
| Gonzaga Middle School | Winnipeg, Manitoba | Catholic-Jesuit | 2011 | 15-20 per grade | 6-8 | ~20L | Unknown | Unknown |

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Grace Academy | Hartford, CT | Various female religious orders | Unknown | 66 | 5-8 | $5K | The Power of Grace | Unknown |
| Guadalupe Regional Middle School | Brownsville, TX | Catholic | 2002 | 90 | 6-8 | $7K | Mardi Gras, Golf Tournament (not sure that Ss are present), Charro Days, | https://youtu.be/yfgNYkowqmo |
| Hope Partnership for Education | Philadelphia, PA | Catholic | 2002 | Unknown | 5-8 | $15K | Hope's 12th Annual FriendRaiser | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NRHYqXad4fQ |
| Imago Dei Middle School | Tucson, AZ | Episcopal | 2005 | 70 | 5-8 | $19K | Anniversary fundraiser, Fall Fest? Different sponsoring organizations hold events where students are featured ??? | https://www.imagodeischool.org/media/ |
| Logan Hope | Philadelphia, PA | Christian | 2000 | Unknown | K-8 | $8.5K | Joy in June | Unknown |
| Loyola Academy of St. Louis | St. Louis, MO | Catholic-Jesuit | 1999 | 57 | 6-8 | $18K | Fish Fry, Anniversary Celebrations, Chefs Feast for a Knight | https://vimeo.com/325205598 |

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Marian Middle School | St. Louis, MO | Christian | 1999 | Unknown | 5-8 | $12K | Girls Night Out, Marian Magic Benefit Event | https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCN7mSBNbhrB1YLKKzmeDCiA |
| Most Holy Trinity Catholic School | St. Louis, MO | Catholic | Unknown | Unknown | Unknown | Unknown | Unknown | Unknown |
| Mother Caroline Academy | Dorchester, MA | Catholic | 1993 | | 4-8 | Unknown | Annual Dinner 2019 | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-8IMohdAo2M |
| Mother Teresa Middle School | Regina, Saskatchewan | Catholic-Jesuit | 2011 | 20 per grade | 6-12 | $25K | The Sky's the Limit | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9Mg9Qe1lYlk |
| Nativity Academy at St. Boniface | Louisville, KY | Catholic-Jesuit | 2003 | 48 | 5-8 | ~10K | Annual Golf Scramble, Night Out for Nativity, Nativity Auction | https://vimeo.com/213725759 |
| Nativity Jesuit Academy | Milwaukee, WI | Catholic-Jesuit | 1993 | 250 | K-8 | Unknown | Nativity Jesuit Scholarship Dinner | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5gTHdXcODPo |
| Nativity Prep Academy of San Diego | San Diego, CA | Catholic-Jesuit | 2001 | 200+ | 6-8 | $12.5K | Nativity Prep Golf Classic, Sponsorship Luncheon, | https://vimeo.com/95889200 |

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Nativity Prep of Wilmington | Wilmington, DE | Catholic-Jesuit | 2003 | 52 | 5-8 | Unknown | Ignite the Night | http://nativitywilmington.org/giving/in-vino-veritas/ |
| Nativity Preparatory Academy of Rochester | Rochester, NY | Catholic-Jesuit | 2009 | 56 | 5-8 | $10K | Nativity in Bloom | Unknown |
| Nativity Preparatory School | Jamaica Plan, MA | Catholic-Jesuit | 1990 | 350 | 4-8 | $6K | Student Sponsor Appreciation Breakfast, Nativity Prep Promise Dinner; | https://vimeo.com/user16355362 |
| Nativity School of Harrisburg | Harrisburg, PA | "Faith Based" | 2001 | ~52 | Middle | ~3.6K | Gala | https://drive.google.com/file/d/1myd29FuJkMeMbrfdw2aIczfV7H5X7ztz/view |
| Nativity School of Worcester | Worchester, MA | Catholic-Jesuit | 2003 | 64 | 5-8 | ~19K | Clarke Fundraiser and Culinary Event, Spring Auction, | https://nativityworcester.org/impact/videos/?vimeography_gallery=3&vimeography_video=266322393 |
| NativityMiguel Middle School of Buffalo | Buffalo, NY | Catholic-Jesuit | 2004 | Unknown | 5-8 | $10K | Scholars Award Banquet | https://youtu.be/mjBRy0wB0JA |
| NativityMiguel School of Scranton | Scranton, PA | Catholic-Jesuit | 2012 | Unknown | 5-8 | $8.5K | Tribute Dinner | https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=2&v=PGl1anXSiv4 |

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Nora Cronin Presentation Academy | Newburgh, NY | Catholic | 2006 | Unknown | 5-8 | $10K | Power of the Purse, Breakfast with Lantern of Hope scholarship recipient, Autumn's Glow Gala | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hFYpLiwHZ6o; https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4gioZBD8nwQ |
| Sacred Heart Nativity School | San Jose, CA | Catholic-Jesuit | 2001 & 2006 | 108 | 6-8 | Unknown | Legacy Golf, Trivioke, Fiesta!, Fr. Mateo Sheedy Memorial Celebration | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vMbQM8gJxt0 |
| San Francisco Nativity Academy | Houston, TX | Catholic-Jesuit | 2016 | 20 in Pre-K since 2016 | PreK-8 | $20K | Annual Luncheon | http://www.nativityhouston.org/sponsor-a-student.html |
| San Miguel Academy | Newburgh, NY | Catholic-Jesuit | 2006 | Unknown | 5-8 | Unknown | Holiday Benefit Concert; "Defying the Odds" Scholarship Dinner; | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=25mw_7pafbE |
| San Miguel School of Chicago | Chicago, IL | Catholic-Lasallian | 1995 | 90 | 4-6? | Unknown | "Guiding Star Donor" | Unknown |
| San Miguel School of Washington, DC | Washington, DC | Catholic-Lasallian | 2002 | Unknown | 6-8 | Unknown | Annual Scholarship Benefit, Miguel Mornings | https://sanmigueldc.org/students/video-photo-gallery/asb-photos/ |

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Seattle Nativity School | Seattle, WA | Catholic-Jesuit | 2013 | 75 | 6-8 | Unknown | Promoting Success Luncheon, | https://vimeo.com/275366470 |
| Sisters Academy of Baltimore | Baltimore, MD | Catholic | 2004 | 71 | 5-8 | Unknown | Jazzin' it Up in the Park | https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=98&v=zJKFGHm6CR0 |
| St. Andrew Nativity School | Portland, OR | Catholic-Jesuit | 2001 | 79 | 6-8 | $15K | Promoting Success Luncheon, | https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=91&v=4TsFQU5AocA |
| St. Andrews School | Richmond, VA | Episcopal | 1894 | 96 | K-5 | Unknown | Speaker Series (no students) | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RTIQeeTdIwY |
| St. Cecilia School and Academy | St. Louis, MO | Catholic | 1908 | Unknown | K-8 | Unknown | Archbishop Gala | Unknown |
| St. Ignatius School | Bronx, NY | Catholic-Jesuit | 1995 | 79 | 6-8 | $12.5K | Annual Scholarship Benefit | https://www.sis-nativity.org/our-success/video-library/ |
| St. James School | Philadelphia, PA | Episcopal | 2010 | 85 | 4-8 | $30K | Annual Scholarship Benefit | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-y6qIRLrQSA |

| | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| St. Louis Catholic Academy | St. Louis, MO | Catholic | 2003 | Unknown | K-8 | $4K | (Not clear that they rely on donor funds) | Unknown |
| St. Martin de Porres Academy | New Haven, CT | Catholic | 2005 | 62 | Middle | Unknown | Spring Fling Gala, Golf Fore Kids, Student Tours | https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=u5KZnkc5j-k&feature=youtu.be |
| The Neighborhood Academy | Pittsburg, PA | "Faith Based" | 2001 | Unknown | 6-12 | Unknown | Corporate Appreciation Luncheon, | https://www.theneighborhoodacademy.org/support/leadership-giving.cfm |
| Trinity Academy | Hartford, CT | \Episcopal | 2012 | 46 | 1-4 | Unknown | Excellence Gala | Unknown |
| Washington School for Girls | Washington, DC | Catholic | 1998 | 130 | 3-8 | $18K | Unknown | https://www.washingtonschoolforgirls.org/school-video |

## APPENDIX C- Interview Protocol

General

1. Do any memories come up for you from the past after looking at all of these photos and videos?
2. In your opinion, how often were you asked to participate in advancement events like _____ (the ASB, school visits, features in advancement materials, photos/videos taken for print or online disbursement)?
3. Were you ever aware of what these practices were for?
4. Who approached you about participating in these advancement practices?
5. Did you feel like you had to speak or act differently when you were at these events or being filmed compared to when you were just at school or out of school?
6. What do you remember feeling about the donors or film crews (if applicable) you met at these events?
7. If you had to describe your academic and behavioral record during your time at DMA, how would you describe it? (For example, what would you say was your average GPA?)

In-person

1. What was interacting with guests like for you when you were little?
2. Were you given a choice to participate?
3. At the time, did you understand what was going on?
4. How were you prepared to interact with guest?
5. Do you remember how it felt?

6. Tell me about an interaction you remember.
7. Did you have any takeaways from the event?
8. What's it like thinking about it now?
9. How were you selected to be a part of the event?
10. Do any feelings or thoughts come up for you now?
11. What did DMA do well? If you could suggest any improvements, how would you make the selection, preparation, and presentation of students better?
12. "Tell me more…"

Media interactions

1. Have you seen this photo or video before?
2. Were you asked permission to have your photo or video taken?
3. What's it like to see yourself in these photos/videos?
4. What do you remember from the time when it was produced?
5. Do you remember how you felt?
6. Tell me what you remember from the production.
7. Tell me what you remember from post-production.
8. Looking at these photos and videos now, what do you think DMA did well regarding their advancement practices? Do you have any suggestions for improvement?
9. "Tell me more…"

| APPENDIX D- Table of Graduates Interviewed | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Graduate** | **Gender** | **Age** | **Grad Year** | **Race** | **Ethnicity** | **What is your highest level of education?** | **Were you born in the USA?** | **Home Language** | **Religion** | **Highest level of education attained by parents** | **Were your parents/guardians born in the USA?** | **How often?** | **Participation** |
| Atlas | Female | 14-18 | 2019 | Asian | Filipino | Some high school, no diploma | Yes | English, Tagalog | Roman Catholic | In the US: N/A ; However, in the Philippines they received a Bachelor's degree. | No | Always | Ambassador, Choir, Media, ASB every year |
| Nora | Female | 14-18 | 2019 | Asian | Filipino | Some high school, no diploma | Yes | English | Roman Catholic | 2 year vocational for mom | No | Often | Choir, ASB every year |
| Sonia | Female | 14-18 | 2019 | Hispanic or Latino | Mexican American | Some high school, no diploma | Yes | English, Spanish | Other | They were in highschool unable to finish it fully | No | Often | Ambassador, Choir, Media, ASB every year |
| Filbert | Male | 14-18 | 2017 | Hispanic or Latino | Mexican | Some high school, no diploma | Yes | English, Spanish | Roman Catholic | Some College | No | Always | Ambassador, Choir, Media, ASB every year |
| Bryan | Male | 14-18 | 2017 | African American | African American & Asian | Some high school, no diploma | Yes | English | Other | Associates Degree | No | Often | Ambassador, Media, ASB some years |
| Carmen | Female | 14-18 | 2017 | Hispanic or Latino | Mexican | Some high school, no diploma | Yes | Spanish | Roman Catholic | High school diploma | No | Always | Ambassador, Choir, Media, ASB ever year |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Irie | Female | 19-25 | 2012 | Asian | Filipina | Some college credit, no degree | Yes | English, Tagalog | Other | Mother: First year of college, Father: High school diploma | No | Always | Ambassador, Choir, ASB |
| Kat | Female | 19-25 | 2011 | Asian | Filipino | Bachelor's degree | Yes | English, Tagalog | Roman Catholic | Mom - Bachelor's Degree from the Philippines, Dad - high school | No | Often | Choir, ASB every year -- As graduate, ASB once |
| Saturn | Female | 19-25 | 2010 | Hispanic or Latino | Peruvian | Bachelor's degree | No | English, Spanish | Other | Some college in their country and GED | No | Often | Choir, ASB,-- As graduate media and speaker |
| Dolores | Female | 19-25 | 2009 | Hispanic or Latino | Mexican | Bachelor's degree | No | Spanish | Buddhist | Some college - Mom / High school- Dad | No | Often | Ambassador, ASB every year, Media, As graduate media and speaker |
| KT | Male | 26-34 | 2006 | Hispanic or Latino | Mexican | Master's degree or higher | Yes | English, Spanish | Other | High School | No | Occasionally | Attended ASB at least 4 times as graduate and guest speaker, media |
| Esmeralda | Female | 26-34 | 2005 | Hispanic or Latino | Mexican-American | Master's degree or higher | No | English | Roman Catholic | Elementary School | No | Often | Attended ASB as graduate and guest and speaker, media |

## APPENDIX E- Invitation of Participation to Graduates

Dear DMA Graduate,

Hi! Ms. Tapia here. If you don't know me, I used to be the Librarian and Digital Literacy Instructor at DMA from 2011-2017. I am a doctoral student at the University of San Francisco's School of Education. I am hoping that you will accept an invitation to speak with me about your participation as a student and graduate at De Marillac Academy's advancement activities. "Advancement activities" encompass the Annual Scholarship Benefit, giving school tours, greeting visitors to DMA, having photos or videos clips of you shared online, and basically any interaction with guests where you represented DMA.

My intention is to understand what this experience was like for you. We will begin with a preliminary survey to gauge how often you feel you participated in these activities. I am looking to get a variety of graduates that participated a lot or not much at all. Participation is completely voluntary. If you are selected after the preliminary survey, I will ask to conduct an interview with you in-person or online where we will look at photos and videos taken during your time at DMA and what those experiences were like for you. The interview would be anywhere between a half-hour to an hour.

I will keep your answers to the survey and your potential interview completely anonymous. If you would like to participate in the study, please begin by taking the preliminary survey linked below.

Your participation in the research will be of great importance to ensure that DMA and other NativityMiguel schools in the nation fully understand the impact advancement activities have on students and graduates in light of their school mission. If you would like to learn more about my study, feel free to read my own introduction to my dissertation here.

I really look forward to reconnecting with many of you! Thank you for your time and consideration. If you have any questions please feel free to email me.

Preliminary DMA Graduate Survey

Sincerely,
Ms. Alicia Tapia, MLIS, Doctoral Student, University of San Francisco

## APPENDIX F- Letter of Consent

You are invited to take part in a research study about your student and graduate participation in advancement activities of De Marillac Academy. The researcher is inviting participants between the ages of 14-30.

This form is part of a process called "informed consent" to allow you to understand this study before deciding whether to take part. This study is being conducted by Alicia Tapia, a former educator at De Marillac Academy, current librarian at Sacred Heart Cathedral, and doctoral student at the University of San Francisco.

**Background Information:**
The purpose of this study is to gain insight into the experiences of De Marillac graduates when they were students participating in school advancement activities such as the Annual Scholarship Benefit, school tours, interaction with workers on campus on corporate days of service, and photo and video shoots done for school publicity purposes.

**Procedures:**
If you agree to be in this study, you will be asked to:
• You will be asked to sit down for an interview in person or online that will last anywhere from half an hour to an hour and half.
• You will view photos and videos of students and graduates taken for school advancement and publicity purposes. These photos and videos are only meant to help recall the experiences of participation in advancement activities.

**Here are some sample questions:**
1. Did you feel like you had to speak or act differently when you were at these events or being filmed compared to when you were just at school or out of school?
2. What do you remember from the time when this photo or video was produced?
3. What was interacting with guests like for you when you were little?
4. How were you selected to be a part of the event?
5. Looking at these photos and videos now, what do you think DMA did well regarding their advancement practices? Do you have any suggestions for improvement?

**Voluntary Nature of the Study:**
This study is completely voluntary. Everyone will respect your decision of whether or not you choose to be in the study. No one associated with this study will treat you differently if you decide not to be in the study. Additionally, your responses throughout the interview will remain anonymous, no one will know if you did nor did not participate. If you decide to join the study now, you can still change your
mind later. You may stop at any time.

**Risks and Benefits of Being in the Study:**
Being in this type of study involves some risk of the minor discomforts that may be recalled upon remembering your experiences.

**Payment:**
This study is completely voluntary; there will be no reimbursement or payment for time.

**Privacy:**
Any information you provide will be kept anonymous. The researcher will not use your personal information for any purposes outside of this research project. Also, the researcher will not include your name or anything else that could identify you in the study reports unless you have given consent. Data will be kept secure by password protection and data encryption. Data will be kept for a period of at least 5 years, as required by the university.

**Contacts and Questions:**
If you have questions now or at a later time, you may contact the researcher, Alicia Tapia, via email atapia2@dons.usfca.edu. You can ask any questions you have before you begin the survey.

Please print or save this consent form for your records.

**Statement of Consent**
I have read the above information. I feel I understand the study well enough to make a decision about my involvement. By providing my signature below, I understand and agree to the terms described above. Please indicate your consent by signing below

_____
Printed Name

_____
Signature

_____
Date

**Parental Consent (if you are under the age of 18)**

_____
Printed Name

_____
Signature

_____
Date

## APPENDIX G- Example of Research Transcript and Memos

| Interview Transcript | Notes/Self-Check |
|---|---|
| Grad: I don't remember that too well, looking back at De Marillac, I just think of the key moments, like I can't think of individual things of course, but I remember them teaching us different kinds of handshakes, and THE handshake you want to have, so like they told us this is the ghost handshake, or like the crab, you know, they taught us how to make a good, firm handshake, and like eye contact was key. And that, just like, these kind of skills helped me later on in life even though it's not like, I guess like, um, formal. Like I guess I'm pretty good with eye contact now thanks to them, like I don't like look away or whatever too often. | *Looking at photos of students at ASB<br><br>• Is grateful for these skills<br>• Code-switching as asset<br>• Conscious of what he's doing |
| AT: Anything else? What do you remember when you were little in terms of like, interacting with guests? | |
| Grad: I did notice, like they had a higher financial status, that was just a given, but like as a kid I never really let that define me, and I'm so happy it didn't like I never viewed my race as something negative, or even though I'm technically the minority, I don't like keeping that mindset I feel like it prohibits me even more, like "oh since I'm a minority I can't do this this and this" and even then if it's, if it's me still thinking I'm a minority I still want to do things, I feel like it's always subconsciously there, but I'm happy that just never came through me. It was never taught to me like, oh since I'm Latino and I'm lower income da-da-da-da. | • He's afraid to name race here, he wants to name everything around it except race.<br>• Why doesn't he see his race as an asset? He ignores instead.<br>• This makes me sad.<br>• CRT<br>• This is frustrating to me. |
| AT: Yeah | |
| Grad: Like I can't do this or that… like yeah, I know the circumstances but it's never hit me to the point where it like bothers me too much or like I have to think about it, you know technically I'm the minority but mentally I don't consider myself a minority almost, and that sounds really strange but I guess it just helped me you know. And it's the same thing with the donors you know, I knew they just had higher financial status and I noticed that the majority of them were white but I didn't like, let that bother me too much, I was just like "Okay whatever" like that's just a given that's just how it is. | • Ignoring race is problematic<br>• How can we help students/graduates see the interrelationship of race, class, privilege, and that it's not right?<br>• Am I the only one here that doesn't see it's not right? |