

12-1-2022

Anna M. Nogar. Quill and Cross in the Borderlands: Sor María de Ágreda and the Lady in Blue, 1628 to the Present

Michael A. Romero
University of Dayton

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.usfca.edu/jhlt>

Recommended Citation

Romero, Michael A. "Anna M. Nogar. Quill and Cross in the Borderlands: Sor María de Ágreda and the Lady in Blue, 1628 to the Present," *Journal of Hispanic / Latino Theology*. Vol. 24 : No. 2 , Article 13. (2022)
:308-310

Available at: <https://repository.usfca.edu/jhlt/vol24/iss2/13>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by USF Scholarship: a digital repository @ Gleeson Library | Geschke Center. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Hispanic / Latino Theology by an authorized editor of USF Scholarship: a digital repository @ Gleeson Library | Geschke Center. For more information, please contact repository@usfca.edu.

Anna M. Nogar. *Quill and Cross in the Borderlands: Sor María de Ágreda and the Lady in Blue, 1628 to the Present*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2018. 474 pp. \$60.00 Hardcover. ISBN: 9780268102135.

In 1631 the Franciscan friar Alonso de Benavides visited the Spanish nun Sor María de Jesús de Ágreda at her convent in Spain confirm reports of and seek clarifications about the nun's mystical travels to the Americas to preach to Native American tribes and counsel them on the arrival of Spanish missionaries. The early seventeenth century letter produced from this meeting is among the earliest accounts of what becomes known as the "Lady in Blue" narrative describing how Native Americans, such as the Jumano tribe, reported to Franciscan missionaries in New Mexico that they had been visited by a mysterious woman dressed in blue who preached to them and encouraged them to seek baptism from the friars.

Anna Nogar's book, *Quill and Cross in the Borderlands: Sor María de Ágreda and the Lady in Blue, 1628 to the Present*, traces this phenomenon, and has a twofold purpose. First, Nogar tracks the Lady in Blue narrative meticulously over the course of nearly four centuries of publications and reimaginings up to the twenty-first century. Second, Nogar shapes an account of Sor María as a spiritual writer whose influence on audiences in both Spain and New Spain worked in tandem with and independently of the Lady in Blue narrative. Nogar does well in establishing the two distinct yet related personas of Sor María: first, one that arises from the miracle legend of her bilocation to North America and second, an authorial Sor María, known primarily through her biography of the Virgin Mary (*Mística ciudad de Dios*) and her own *vita*; both are being used to demonstrate Sor María's holiness and support her cause for canonization.

Nogar is exhaustive in her archival research and use of primary sources to substantiate her points and to keep the reader on track with the literary evidence for the Lady in Blue narrative. She establishes Sor María's popularity and impact as a spiritual writer, the development of her devotional cult in colonial Mexico, and her inspiration as "protomissionary" among the missionaries themselves, including the renowned Junípero Serra. These themes make up the content of the first four chapters of *Quill and Cross*. They are massive in their undertaking, documenting details such as the donations made to Sor María's cause, her own instructions for religious governance, descriptions of religious art that was influenced by biographical descriptions of Mary and the Holy Family, and an inventory of libraries and collections that carry copies of that biography.

The first four chapters make up almost three quarters of the book. Because these chapters are lengthy, it might have been beneficial for the author to organize them into smaller bites, particularly chapters three and four, which reach near to eighty pages each. But that does not take away from Nogar's achievement in showing Sor María's impact on New Spain as a spiritual writer, an undertaking not previously addressed in scholarship.

The last two chapters shift in tone as they focus on more contemporary accounts of the Lady in Blue. Within the folklore and culture of the Southwest United States, the Sor María legend begins to depart from the historical and authorial nun from Ágreda. Nogar demonstrates Sor María's transition from history to folklore, again using copious amounts of documentation from wide-ranging sources including children's literature and modern novels. These last two chapters make clear that the Lady in Blue has been both resisted and resistive in the popular imagination, and moreover, that Sor María's status as a respected writer has been all but lost.

Nogar achieves her aims in this book and in so doing reaches her intended audience. Historians and scholars of religion and the religious literature of Spain and New Spain will benefit greatly from study of Nogar's method, her extensive documentation and footnoting, and her mastery of the Spanish language. Nearly all the primary sources quoted in Spanish include Nogar's own English translations. She also provides more than two dozen illustrations that, although in black and white, are immensely useful, further demonstrating Nogar's gift for drawing attention to the complex and multi-layered figure of Sor María. This book is highly recommended for students of Spanish mysticism and the church of colonial Mexico.

Michael A. Romero

University of Dayton

Dayton, Ohio